Recent Scholarship in the Field of *kalām*

Jan Thiele¹

ILC-CCHS, CSIC, Madrid

jan.thiele@cchs.csic.es

Abstract: This article reviews recent scholarship on *kalām*-theology and attempts to briefly describe some tendencies that appear to be promising for opening new perspective for future work. Scholarship has made significant attempts to transcend previous limitations of the field along the confines of religious communities and scholarly disciplines (theology vs. philosophy) and has extended the geographical scope and timeframe of investigation.

Keywords: Islamic theology – *kalām* – Muʿtazilism – Ašʿarism

I. INTRODUCTION

An earlier version of this overview of recent scholarship in the field of *kalām* (or, more completely, *ʿilm al-kalām*) was presented at the *Atelier d'historiographie critique* organised by the present journal (Paris, 10th February 2017). It has since then been slightly updated.² The scholarship reviewed here is devoted to a discipline that is often translated as 'theology'. This translation is not entirely wrong, but nevertheless somewhat imprecise: to be sure, the *mutakallimūn*, that is, the practitioners of the discipline of *kalām*, actually addressed theological questions. Yet the spectrum of their reflections also included fields that the Western tradition would attribute to the domain of philosophy, including metaphysics and physics, epistemology or ethics. It is therefore not surprising that *kalām* shares many subjects with *falsafa*, that is, the heirs of Hellenic philosophy in the Islamic world.

The second problem of the translation 'theology' is that there are other forms of theology distinct from *kalām*. They are all subsumed under the label *uṣūl al-dīn* ('principles of religion'). The reason for there being various forms of theology was that theologians were divided over the appropriate and legitimate methodology for addressing theological problems. The starting point of *kalām* was rational reflection—as opposed to their detractors, whose departing point was scripture. The latter group of opponents to

¹ I gratefully acknowledge funding from the Spanish Government's Ramón y Cajal programme (RYC-2015-18346).

² The presentation covered works published during the five years before the meeting. I have added some studies that were published since then.

kalām were primarily found in the milieu of the Traditionalists, and more specifically the Ḥanbalites.³ This is at least what the general picture looks like. The historical reality is however somewhat more complex: more than 35 years ago, D. Gimaret demonstrated, for example, that a thinker like Ibn Taymiyya (d. 728/1328) adopted a very rational approach in his attempts to resolve theological questions.⁴ The same Ibn Taymiyya is a major reference for historical and contemporary Ḥanbalites. More recently, studies have provided significant additional evidence for the influence of speculative theology on him.⁵ The inclusion of Ibn Taymiyya in an overview of research in *kalām* is certainly debatable, but omitting him completely would no be less problematic.

This overview of recent research on *kalām* is selective. I attempt to briefly describe some tendencies that appear to me promising for opening new perspectives for future work. In addition, I will provide lists of recent contributions to several subfields of *kalām* studies. One might blame me for not systematically reviewing recent scholarship on the Māturīdite school, that is the second important movement of Sunni *kalām* after Aṣʿarism. The reason is that I do not feel sufficiently competent to assess the extensive production from Turkey.⁶

3 There were, however, other 'literalists' or 'scripturalists' like, for example, the Ṣāḥirīs.

4 Daniel Gimaret, 'Théories de l'acte humain dans l'école ḥanbalite', *Bulletin d'études orientales* vol. 29, 1977, pp. 157-178.

5 See Jon Hoover, *Ibn Taymiyya's Theodicy of Perpetual Optimism*, Leiden, Brill, 2007; and more recently, Livnat Holtzman, 'Debating the Doctrine of *jabr* (Compulsion): Ibn Qayyim al-Jawziyya reads Fakhr al-Dīn al-Rāzī', in Birgit Krawietz and Georges Tamer (eds.), *Islamic Theology, Philosophy and Law: Debating Ibn Taymiyya and Ibn Qayyim al-Jawziyya*, Berlin/Boston, De Gruyter, 2013, pp. 61-93; Ajhar A. Hakim, 'The Forgotten Rational Thinking in the Ḥanbalite Thought With Special Reference to Ibn Taymiyya', *Journal of Arabic and Islamic Studies* vol. 14, 2014, pp. 137-154; Sophia Vasalou, *Ibn Taymiyya's Theological Ethics*, Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2015; Livnat Holtzman, 'Accused of Anthropomorphism: Ibn Taymiyya's *Mihān* as Reflected in Ibn Qayyim al-Jawziyya's *al-Kāfiya al-Shāfiya*', *The Muslim World* vol. 106, no. 3, 2016, pp. 561-587; Jon Hoover, 'Ḥanbali Theology', in Sabine Schmidtke (ed.), *The Oxford Handbook of Islamic Theology*, Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2016, pp. 625-646; as well as a special issue edited by Caterina Bori and published in *The Muslim World* vol. 108, no. 1, 2018 (specifically the contributions by R. Adem, 'Ibn Taymiyya as Avicennan? Fourteenth-Century Cosmological Controversies in Damascus', pp. 124-153; F. Griffel, 'Ibn Taymiyya and His Ash'arite Opponents on Reason and Revelation: Similarities, Differences, and a Vicious Circle', pp. 11-39; and J. Hoover and M.A.G. Mahajneh, 'Theology as Translation: Ibn Taymiyya's Fatwa permitting Theology and its Reception into his *Averting the Conflict between Reason and Revealed Tradition* (Dar' Ta'arūḍ al-'Aql wa l-Naql)', pp. 40-86).

6 I shall therefore limit myself to mentioning the English translation of U. Rudolph's seminal work on the school's eponym al-Māturīdī (Ulrich Rudolph, *Al-Māturīdī and the Development of Sunnī Theology in Samarqand*, trans. Rodrigo Adem, Leiden, Brill, 2014),

Readers who would like to keep an eye on future publications in the field are referred to T.-A. Druart's *Brief Bibliographical Guides in Medieval Islamic Philosophy and Theology*, from which this overview has also greatly benefited. The *Brief Bibliographical Guides* are hosted at the webpage of the Catholic University of America and are currently in the process of being converted by A. Lammer and P. Adamson into a combined and searchable version, which should be accessible soon via Ludwig-Maximilians-Universität München.⁷ A recent attempt to outline the 'state-of-the-art' in the field of the history of Islamic theology, *The Oxford Handbook of Islamic Theology*, may also serve as a bibliographical guide for research in the field of *kalām*.⁸

II. THE BEGINNINGS OF KALĀM (2ND-3RD/8TH-9TH CENTURIES)

In an article published in 1991, D. Gimaret took stock of the achievements in the field of *kalām* and deplored an unbalanced focus on the study of the earliest phase of *kalām*.⁹ Today the situation appears almost reversed. Since J. van Ess' monumental *Theologie und Gesellschaft*,¹⁰ relatively little work has

and such recent publications as Abū Ishāq Ibrāhīm b. Ismā'īl al-Šaffār al-Buḥārī, *Talḥiṣ al-adilla wa-qawā'id al-tawḥīd*, 2 vols., ed. Angelika Brodersen, Beirut, Orient Institut Beirut, 2011; Angelika Brodersen, 'Göttliches und menschliches Handeln im māturīdischen kalām', *Jahrbuch für islamische Theologie und Religionspädagogik* vol. 2, 2013, pp. 117-139; Angelika Brodersen, 'Das Kapitel über die „schönen Namen Gottes“ im *Talḥiṣ al-adilla li-qawā'id at-tawḥīd* des Abū Ishāq as-Šaffār al-Buḥārī (gest. 534/1139)', *Zeitschrift der Deutschen Morgenländischen Gesellschaft* vol. 164, no. 2, 2014, pp. 375-406; Angelika Brodersen, *Der unbekannte kalām. Theologische Positionen der frühen Māturīdiya am Beispiel der Attributenlehre*, Berlin, Lit Verlag, 2014; Nathan Spannaus, 'Šihāb al-Dīn al-Marḡānī on the Divine Attributes: A Study in Kalām in the 19th Century', *Arabica* vol. 62, no. 1, 2015, pp. 74-98; Philip Dorroll, 'The Universe in Flux: Reconsidering Abū Maṣ'ūr Al-Māturīdī's Metaphysics and Epistemology', *Journal of Islamic Studies* vol. 27, no. 2, 2016, pp. 119-135; Ulrich Rudolph, 'Ḥanafī Theological Tradition and Māturīdism', in Sabine Schmidtke (ed.), *The Oxford Handbook of Islamic Theology*, Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2016, pp. 280-296; Nathan Spannaus, 'Theology in Central Asia', in Sabine Schmidtke (ed.), *The Oxford Handbook of Islamic Theology*, Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2016, pp. 587-605; and Thomas Würtz, *Islamische Theologie im 14. Jahrhundert. Auferstehungslehre, Handlungstheorie und Schöpfungsvorstellungen im Werk von Sa'd ad-Dīn at-Taftāzānī*, Berlin/Boston, De Gruyter, 2016.

7 <http://philosophy.cua.edu/faculty/druart/bibliographical-guide.cfm> [accessed 24 February 2018].

8 Sabine Schmidtke (ed.), *The Oxford Handbook of Islamic Theology*, Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2016.

9 Daniel Gimaret, 'Pour un rééquilibrage des études de théologie musulmane', *Arabica* vol. 38, no. 1, 1991, pp. 11-18.

10 Josef van Ess, *Theologie und Gesellschaft im 2. und 3. Jahrhundert Hidschra. Eine Geschichte des religiösen Denkens im frühen Islam*, 6 vols., Berlin/New York, de Gruyter, 1991-1997.

been done on the earliest speculative theologians. An exception is the work of D. Bennett, who wrote his doctoral thesis (University of California 2011)¹¹ on one of the most important early *mutakallimūn*, Ibrāhīm al-Nazzām (d. between 220/835 and 230/845) and several shorter papers.¹² There were some additional studies that returned to older research questions, such as the origins of the dialectical methodology in *kalām*,¹³ the Christian contribution to early *kalām*¹⁴ and an article that revises the composition history of al-Aṣʿarī's (d. 324/935) *Maqālāt*,¹⁵ one of the most important heresiographies of early theology.

The study of early *kalām* will perhaps receive new impetus: van Ess' work is currently being translated into English and will consequently be accessible to a much wider audience than the original German version.¹⁶ In addition, the study of early *kalām* will most likely benefit from the recent rise of Ibādī studies. W. Madelung and A. Al-Salimi have unearthed some early Ibādī *kalām* texts, the oldest of which were dated by the editors to the late second/eighth and the early third/ninth century.¹⁷ Provided they are au-

11 David Bennett, 'The Spirit of Ahypokeimenonical Physics: Another Side of Kalām Natural Philosophy', PhD Thesis, University of California, 2011.

12 David Bennett, 'Abū Ishāq al-Nazzām: The Ultimate Constituents of Nature are Simple Properties and *Rūh*', in Monique Bernards (ed.), *Abbasid Studies: Proceedings of the 2010 Meeting of the School of Abbasid Studies*, Exeter, Gibb Memorial Trust, 2013, pp. 201-2017; David Bennett, 'The Mu'tazilite Movement (II): The Early Mu'tazilites', in Sabine Schmidtke (ed.), *The Oxford Handbook of Islamic Theology*, Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2016, pp. 142-158.

13 Naomi Aradi, 'The Origins of the *kalām* Model of Discussion on the Concept of *tawhīd*', *Arabic Sciences and Philosophy* vol. 23, no. 1, 2013, pp. 135-166; Fedor Benevich, 'Wenn sie sagen..., dann sagen wir...': Die Ursprünge des dialektischen Verfahrens des Kalām', *Le Muséon* vol. 128, no. 1-2, 2015, pp. 181-201.

14 Fritz W. Zimmermann, 'Kalām and the Greeks', in Behnam Sadeghi et al. (eds.), *Islamic Cultures, Islamic Contexts*, Leiden, Brill, 2014, pp. 343-363; Orsolya Varsányi, 'The Concept of *'aql* in Early Arabic Christian Theology: A Case for the Early Interaction between Philosophy and *kalām*', in Damien Janos (ed.), *Ideas in Motion in Baghdad and Beyond: Philosophical and Theological Exchanges between Christians and Muslims in the Third/Ninth and Fourth/Tenth Centuries*, Leiden, Brill, 2015, pp. 109-134; Sidney H. Griffith, 'Excursus I: Christian Theological Thought during the First 'Abbāsid Century', in Sabine Schmidtke (ed.), *The Oxford Handbook of Islamic Theology*, Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2016, pp. 91-102.

15 James Weaver, 'A Footnote to the Composition History of *Maqālāt al-islāmiyyīn*: The Internal Parallels in al-Aṣḥarī's Material on the Shia', *Journal of Abbasid Studies* vol. 4, no. 2, 2017, pp. 142-186.

16 The first three volumes have already been published: Josef van Ess, *Theology and Society in the Second and Third Century of the Hijra*, trans. John O'Kane and Gwendolin Goldbloom, Leiden, Brill, 2016-2017.

17 Abdulrahman Al-Salimi and Wilferd Madelung, *Early Ibādī Theology. Six kalām texts by*

thentic, they would be the earliest primary texts of *kalām* ever discovered. The study of Ibādī sources is still in a rudimentary stage, of which a collective volume edited by E. Francesca offers a first outline.¹⁸ Yet the recent finds of primary sources offer a new textual basis for studying the early phase of *kalām*.

Abdulrahman Al-Salimi, 'Early Ibādī Theological Arguments on Atoms and Accidents', *Arabic Sciences and Philosophy* vol. 23, no. 1, 2013, pp. 117-134.

Harith Bin Ramli, 'The Predecessors of Ash'arism: Ibn Kullāb, al-Muḥāsibī and al-Qalānisi', in Sabine Schmidtke (ed.), *The Oxford Handbook of Islamic Theology*, Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2016, pp. 215-224.

Patricia Crone, 'Al-Jāḥiẓ on *aṣḥāb al-jahālāt* and the Jahmiyya', in Rotraud Hansberger, M. Afīf al-Haytham and Charles Burnett (eds.), *Medieval Arabic Thought: Essays in Honour of Fritz Zimmermann*, London, The Warburg Institute, 2012, pp. 27-40.

Marco Demichelis, 'Fanā' al-Nār Within Early Kalām and Mysticism: An Analysis Covering the Eighth and Ninth Centuries', *Archiv Orientalní* vol. 83, no. 3, 2015, pp. 385-410.

Racha el-Omari, 'The Origins of the Mu'tazila', in Sabine Schmidtke (ed.), *The Oxford Handbook of Islamic Theology*, Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2016, pp. 130-141.

Nimrod Hurvitz, 'al-Ma'mūn (r. 198/813–218/833) and the *Miḥna*', in Sabine Schmidtke (ed.), *The Oxford Handbook of Islamic Theology*, Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2016, pp. 649-659.

Steven C. Judd, 'The Early Qadariyya', in Sabine Schmidtke (ed.), *The Oxford Handbook of Islamic Theology*, Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2016, pp. 44-54.

Wilferd Madelung, 'Early Ibādī Theology', in Sabine Schmidtke (ed.), *The Oxford Handbook of Islamic Theology*, Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2016, pp. 242-251.

Cornelia Schöck, 'Jahm b. Ṣafwān (d. 128/745–6) and the "Jahmiyya" and Ḍirār b. 'Amr (d.

ʿAbd Allāh b. Yazīd al-Fazārī, Leiden, Brill, 2014.

18 Ersilia Francesca (ed.), *Ibadi Theology: Rereading Sources and Scholarly Works*, Hildesheim, Olms, 2015 (for Ibādī *kalām*, see specifically Abdulrahman Al-Salimi, 'Ibādism and the Creation of the Qur'ān', pp. 145-155; Moez Dridi, 'The Theology of Human Actions: Imposing the Impossible: *al-takṭīf* and its Problems for the Ibādīs', pp. 177-184; Mohammed Ech-Cheikh, 'Ignored Pages of the History of Ibādī Theology in North Africa during the Middle Ages: The *Wājiz* (Summary) of 'Abf al-Kāfi and the *Dalīl* (Proof and Demonstration) of Warjalānī', pp. 103-113; Ahmed Ismail, 'The Theory of the Atom in the Ibādī, Ash'arite and Mu'tazilite Schools', pp. 207-221; Douglas Leonard, 'Anthropomorphism of the Divine as Metaphor in Early Ibādī Theology and Reformed Calvinism', pp. 199-205; Wilferd Madelung, 'Ibādīyya and Mu'tazila: Two Moderate Opposition Movements in Early Islam', pp. 23-28).

200/815)', in Sabine Schmidtke (ed.), *The Oxford Handbook of Islamic Theology*, Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2016, pp. 55-80.

Alexander Treiger, 'Origins of *Kalām*', in Sabine Schmidtke (ed.), *The Oxford Handbook of Islamic Theology*, Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2016, pp. 27-43.

III. STUDIES ON MU'TAZILISM

From the fifth/eleventh century onwards, the Mu'tazila was increasingly marginalised from Sunni Islam. They were regarded as heretics and their literature was no longer transmitted—and sometimes intentionally destroyed. Our most important sources for the study of the first important school of *kalām* are therefore found outside the Sunni realm: on the one hand among the Shiites, and specifically the Zaydīs, and on the other hand in Jewish manuscript sources.¹⁹

Karaite Sources

From the late fourth/tenth century onwards, Karaite Jews came to adopt Mu'tazilite teachings in their theology. We still possess a substantial corpus of Mu'tazilite manuscripts copied by members of this community. However, most of these texts were not preserved in their entirety. Rather, they are remnants of the Geniza, that is, store rooms for books that were no longer used. The surviving codices tend to be more or less complete fragments of works. The most important collection of Karaite fragments of Mu'tazilite works is found in the Firkovitch collection in the National Library of Russia,

19 Recently, relatively few works on Mu'tazilism without specific reference to the Shiites or Karaites have been published: see for example Andrew J. Lane, 'You can't tell a book by its author: A study of Mu'tazilite theology in al-Zamakhsharī's (d. 538/1144) *Kashshāf*', *Bulletin of the School of Oriental and African Studies* vol. 75, no. 1, 2012, pp. 47-46; Wilferd Madelung, 'Ibn al-Malāḥimī on the Human Soul', *The Muslim World* vol. 102, no. 3-4, 2012, pp. 426-432; Mohd Radhi Ibrahim, 'Immediate Knowledge According to al-Qāḍī 'Abd al-Jabbār', *Arabic Sciences and Philosophy* vol. 23, no. 1, 2013, pp. 101-115; Wilferd Madelung, 'Universality in Mu'tazili thought', in Michael Morony (ed.), *Universality in Islamic Thought: Rationalism, Science and Religious Belief*, London, I.B. Tauris, 2014, pp. 7-21; Hussein Ali Abdulsater, 'Reason, Grace and the Freedom of Conscience: The Period of Investigation in Mu'tazili Theology', *Studia Islamica* vol. 110, no. 2, 2015, pp. 233-262; Alena Kulinich, 'Beyond theology: Mu'tazilite scholars and their authority in al-Rum-mānī's *tafsū*', *Bulletin of the School of Oriental and African Studies* vol. 78, no. 1, 2015, pp. 135-148; Sabine Schmidtke, 'The Mu'tazilite Movement (III): The Scholastic Phase', in Sabine Schmidtke (ed.), *The Oxford Handbook of Islamic Theology*, Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2016, pp. 159-180; and the section on Baghdadi Mu'tazilism below.

St Petersburg. Since these manuscripts were practically inaccessible until the fall of the Soviet Union, the study of this material started only late.

The texts preserved in the Karaite repositories are not necessarily treatises written by members of their community. Rather, they include works by Jewish *and* Muslim authors. In recent years several valuable critical editions of key texts for the study of Mu'tazilism have been prepared on the basis of Karaite manuscripts. Of significant importance are fragments of the multi-volume *al-Muġnī fī abwāb al-tawhīd wa-l-'adl* by the Mu'tazilite chief theologian *qāḍī* 'Abd al-Ġabbār al-Hamaḍanī (d. 415/1025). The *Muġnī* is the most important *summa* of Mu'tazilite teaching that has come down to us. Parts of it were previously accessible in the edition of the fourteen (out of originally twenty) volumes discovered in Yemeni manuscripts. The Karaite fragments recently edited by O. Hamdan and S. Schmidtke contain sections of the work that are not included in the Yemeni recension and were previously believed to be lost.²⁰

Additional primary sources that complement the previous finds of Mu'tazilite works are two treatises by the Būyid vizir al-Šāhib b. 'Abbād (d. 385/995), the patron of *qāḍī* 'Abd al-Ġabbār. It is again S. Schmidtke who worked on this edition, this time in collaboration with W. Madelung.²¹ The texts are of great interest, despite their relative shortness and their fragmentary character: they are among the most ancient surviving sources of the Baṣran school of Mu'tazilism; in addition their thematic focus is specifically relevant to the study of Mu'tazilite metaphysics and atomistic ontology. Several recent articles with a more narrow focus shed further light on the Karaite reception of Mu'tazilism. Yet the study of the material is still very much in its infancy, and many fragments of works remain unidentified.

Hassan Ansari, Wilferd Madelung and Sabine Schmidtke, 'Yūsuf al-Baṣīr's Rebuttal of Abū l-Ḥusayn al-Baṣrī in a Yemeni Zaydi Manuscript of the 7th/13th Century', in David Hollenberg, Christoph Rauch and Sabine Schmidtke (eds.), *The Yemeni Manuscript Tradition*, Leiden, Brill, 2015, pp. 28-65 [also relevant to Zaydī Mu'tazilism].

Bruno Chiesa, 'Some Missing Chapters of al-Qirḡisānī's *Kitāb al-Anwār* Book II', *Intellectual History of the Islamicate World* vol. 2, no. 1-2, 2014, pp. 37-49.

Yoram Erder, 'The Karaites and Mu'tazilism', in Abdelwahab Meddeb and Benjamin Stora

²⁰ *Nukat al-Kitāb al-Muġnī: A Recension of 'Abd al-Jabbār al-Hamaḍhānī's (d. 415/1025) al-Muġnī fī abwāb al-tawhīd wa-l-'adl. Al-Kalām fī l-tawlīd; al-Kalām fī l-istiṭā'a; al-Kalām fī l-taklīf; al-Kalām fī l-naẓar wa-l-ma'ārif*, eds. Omar Hamdan and Sabine Schmidtke, Beirut, Deutsches Orient Institut, 2012.

²¹ *Al-Šāhib Ibn 'Abbād: Promoter of Rational Theology. Two Mu'tazilī kalām Texts from the Cairo Geniza*, eds. Wilferd Madelung and Sabine Schmidtke, Leiden, Brill, 2016.

(eds.), *A History of Jewish-Muslim Relations: From the Origins to the Present Day*, Princeton, Princeton University Press, 2013, pp. 778-787.

Wilferd Madelung, 'Mu'tazili Theology in Levi ben Yefet's *Kitāb al-Ni'ma*', *Intellectual History of the Islamicate World* vol. 2, no. 1-2, 2014, pp. 9-17.

Sabine Schmidtke, 'Jewish Reception of Twelver Shī'ī kalām: A Copy of al-Sharīf al-Murtaḍā's *Kitāb al-Dhakhīra* in the Abraham Firkovitch Collection, St. Petersburg', *Intellectual History of the Islamicate World* vol. 2, no. 1-2, 2014, pp. 50-74.

Gregor Schwarb, 'Short Communication: A Newly Discovered Fragment of al-Sharīf al-Murtaḍā's *K. al-Mulakhkhaṣ fi uṣūl al-dīn* in Hebrew Script', *Intellectual History of the Islamicate World* vol. 2, no. 1-2, 2014, pp. 75-79.

David Sklare, 'The Reception of Mu'tazilism among Jews Who Were Not Professional Theologians', *Intellectual History of the Islamicate World* vol. 2, no. 1-2, 2014, pp. 18-36.

Sarah Stroumsa, 'The Mu'tazila in al-Andalus: The Footprints of a Phantom', *Intellectual History of the Islamicate World* vol. 2, no. 1-2, 2014, pp. 80-100.

Jan Thiele, 'The Jewish and Muslim Reception of 'Abd al-Jabbār's *Kitāb al-Jumal wa-l-'uqūd*: A Survey of Relevant Sources', *Intellectual History of the Islamicate World* vol. 2, no. 1-2, 2014, pp. 101-121.

Shiite Mu'tazilism (Zaydīs and Imāmīs)

The second subfield of Mu'tazilite studies that has seen significant progress is its reception among Shiite theologians. Although the Imāmīs are of some importance, recent scholarship has been specifically productive with respect to Zaydī Mu'tazilism in Iran and Yemen.²² As is the case with the study

²² For some recent studies on Imāmī Mu'tazilism see Hassan Ansari and Sabine Schmidtke, *The Reception of al-Shaykh al-Ṭūsī's Theological Writings in 6th/12th century Syria: Facsimile Edition of 'Abd al-Rahmān b. 'Alī b. Muḥammad al-Ḥusaynī's Commentary on al-Ṭūsī's Muqaddama (MS Atf Efendi 1338/1)*, Tehran, Mirāt-i Maktūb, 2013; Hassan Ansari and Sabine Schmidtke, 'Al-Shaykh al-Ṭūsī: His writings on Theology and their Reception', in Farhad Daftary and Gurdofarid Miskinzoda (eds.), *The Study of Shī'ī Islam: History, Theology and Law*, London, I.B. Tauris, 2014, pp. 475-497; Wilferd Madelung, 'Theology: Introduction', in Farhad Daftary and Gurdofarid Miskinzoda (eds.), *The Study of Shī'ī Islam: History, Theology and Law*, London, I.B. Tauris, 2014, pp. 455-463; Hassan Ansari and Sabine Schmidtke, 'The Shī'ī Reception of Mu'tazilism (II): Twelver Shī'īs', in Sabine Schmidtke (ed.), *The Oxford Handbook of Islamic Theology*, Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2016, pp. 196-214; Reza Pourjavady and Sabine Schmidtke, 'Twelver Shī'ī Theology', in Sabine Schmidtke (ed.), *The Oxford Handbook of Islamic Theology*, Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2016, pp. 456-472; Hussein Ali Abdulsater, 'The Theory of States from al-Mufid to al-Murtaḍā', in Saiyad Nizamuddin Ahmad and Sajjad Rizvi (eds.), *Philosophy*

of the Karaite-Muʿtazilite textual corpus, the study of Zaydī Muʿtazilism has been advanced primarily on the basis of (previously) unedited manuscript sources. Publications in this field include in-depth studies—either monographs or series of articles—and critical editions, as well as a special issue of *Arabica* (see below the contributions to vol. 59, no. 3–4). Several individual theologians, like al-Ḥasan al-Raṣṣās (d. 584/1188)²³ or Abū ʿAbd Allāh al-ʿAnsī (d. 667/1269)²⁴ have received specific attention. A significant amount of scholarship has focused on the sixth/twelfth and seventh/thirteenth centuries. This period was specifically relevant to the transmission of knowledge and literature from the Iranian Zaydī community to Yemen.²⁵ As a result of this process, Yemen became the new cultural and intellectual centre of Zaydism. Some additional studies shed light on later developments and provide insight into the continuity of the Muʿtazilite tradition among the Zaydis of Yemen.²⁶ A recent initiative of the Institute for Advanced Study in Princeton together with the Hill Museum and Manuscript Library (HMML) at Saint John's University, Collegeville, Minnesota attempts to build a comprehen-

and the Intellectual Life in Shiʿah Islam, London, The Shiʿah Institute Press, 2017, pp. 1–27.

- 23 Jan Thiele, *Theologie in der jemenitischen Zaydiyya. Die naturphilosophischen Überlegungen des al-Ḥasan ar-Raṣṣās*, Leiden, Brill, 2013.
- 24 Hassan Ansari and Sabine Schmidtke, 'Between Aleppo and Ṣaʿda: The Zaydī Reception of the Imāmi Scholar Ibn al-Bīṭrīq al-Ḥillī', *Journal of Islamic Manuscripts* vol. 4, no. 2, 2013, pp. 158–198; Hassan Ansari and Sabine Schmidtke, 'The Literary-Religious Tradition among 7th/13th-Century Yemeni Zaydis (II): The Case of ʿAbd Allāh b. Zayd al-ʿAnsī (d. 667/1269)', in David Hollenberg, Christoph Rauch and Sabine Schmidtke (eds.), *The Yemeni Manuscript Tradition*, Leiden, Brill, 2015, pp. 101–154; Ḥusām al-Dīn ʿAbd Allāh b. Zayd al-ʿAnsī, *al-Maḥaḡḡa al-bayḍāʾ fī uṣūl al-dīn: Facsimile Edition of MS Munich, Bayerische Staatsbibliothek, Cod. arab. 1286*, eds. Hassan Ansari and Sabine Schmidtke, Tehran, Mirāt-i Maktūb/CNRS, 2015.
- 25 Hassan Ansari and Sabine Schmidtke, 'Muʿtazilism in Rayy and Astarābād: Abū l-Faḍl al-ʿAbbās b. Sharwīn (Studies on the transmission of knowledge from Iran to Yemen in the 6th/12th and 7th/13th C., II)', *Studia Iranica* vol. 41, no. 1, 2012, pp. 57–100; Hassan Ansari and Jan Thiele, 'MS Berlin, State Library, Glaser 51: A Unique Manuscript from the Early 7th/13th-Century Bahṣamite Milieu in Yemen', in David Hollenberg, Christoph Rauch and Sabine Schmidtke (eds.), *The Yemeni Manuscript Tradition*, Leiden, Brill, 2015, pp. 66–81; Hassan Ansari and Sabine Schmidtke, 'The Cultural Transfer of Zaydī and non-Zaydī Religious Literature from Northern Iran to Yemen (Sixth/Twelfth Century through Eighth/Fourteenth Century)', in Sonja Brentjes and Jürgen Renn (eds.), *Globalization of Knowledge in the Post-Antique Mediterranean*, London/New York, Routledge, 2016, pp. 141–166.
- 26 Gregor Schwarb, 'Muʿtazilism in a 20th century Zaydī Qurʾān commentary', *Arabica* vol. 59, no. 3–4, 2012, pp. 372–403; Gregor Schwarb, 'MS Munich, Bavarian State Library, Cod. arab. 1294: A Guide to Zaydī Kalām-Studies during the Ṭāhirid and Early Qāsimite Periods (Mid-15th to Early 18th Centuries)', in David Hollenberg, Christoph Rauch and Sabine Schmidtke (eds.), *The Yemeni Manuscript Tradition*, Leiden, Brill, 2015, pp. 155–202.

sive digital repository of Zaydī manuscripts and is gradually providing open access to a growing corpus of unexplored Mu'tazilite sources.²⁷ Recent finds have shown the value of such endeavours: for example, some substantial fragments of Ibn al-Malāḥimī al-Ḥwārazmī's *Kitāb al-Mu'tamad fī uṣūl al-Dīn* were recently discovered in Zaydī manuscript libraries (Ibn al-Malāḥimī was not a Zaydī, though). These additional portions of texts allowed W. Madelung to publish a new, enlarged edition of the work.²⁸

Hassan Ansari, 'Un muḥaddiṭ mu'tazilite zaydite : Abū Sa'd al-Sammān al-Rāzī et ses Amālī', *Arabica* vol. 59, no. 3-4, 2012, pp. 267-290.

Hassan Ansari, 'Un texte sur la controverse entre les mu'tazilites et les sunnites concernant un musulman qui commet un grand péché et qui meurt sans s'être repenti, composé par 'Alī b. Nāṣir al-Ġilānī al-Lāhiġānī (probablement un savant de à la fin du viie/xiiie s.)', *Chroniques du manuscrit au Yémen* vol. 20, 2015, pp. 22-56.

Hassan Ansari, 'The Shī'ī Reception of Mu'tazilism (I): Zaydis', in Sabine Schmidtke (ed.), *The Oxford Handbook of Islamic Theology*, Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2016, pp. 181-195.

Hassan Ansari, Sabine Schmidtke and Jan Thiele, 'Zaydi Theology in Yemen', in Sabine Schmidtke (ed.), *The Oxford Handbook of Islamic Theology*, Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2016, pp. 473-493.

Ekaterina Pukhovaia, 'A Zaydi Multitext Manuscript from the Glaser Collection (Staatsbibliothek zu Berlin): MS Glaser 37', *Shii Studies Review* vol. 1, no. 1-2, 2017, pp. 175-193.

Sulaymān b. 'Abd Allāh al-Ḥurāṣī, *Kitāb al-Taḥṣīl li-ġumal al-Taḥṣīl. Facsimile Edition of MS Berlin, Glaser no. 51*. With Introductions and indices by Hassan Ansari and Jan Thiele, Tehran, Mirāth-e maktūb & Freie Universität Berlin, 2013.

Sabine Schmidtke, 'Biblical Predictions of the Prophet Muḥammad among the Zaydis of Iran', *Arabica* vol. 59, no. 3-4, 2012, pp. 218-266.

Sabine Schmidtke, 'Biblical predictions of the Prophet Muḥammad among the Zaydis of Yemen (6th/12th and 7th/13th centuries)', *Orientalia Christiana Analecta* vol. 293, 2013, pp. 221-240.

Jan Thiele, 'La causalité selon al-Ḥākim al-Ġišūmī', *Arabica* vol. 59, no. 3-4, 2012, pp. 291-318.

²⁷ For further details see Sabine Schmidtke, 'Preserving, Studying, and Democratizing Access to the World Heritage of Islamic Manuscripts: The Zaydi Tradition', *Chroniques du manuscrit au Yémen* vol. 23, 2017, pp. 103-166; Sabine Schmidtke, 'The Zaydi Manuscript Tradition: Virtual Repatriation of Cultural Heritage', *International Journal of Middle East Studies* vol. 50, no. 1, 2018, pp. 124-128.

²⁸ Rukn al-Dīn Ibn al-Malāḥimī al-Ḥwārazmī, *Kitāb al-Mu'tamad fī uṣūl al-dīn*, ed. Wilferd Madelung, Tehran, Mirāth-e Maktūb & Freie Universität Berlin, 2012.

Jan Thiele, 'À propos de l'attribution du ms. Ambrosiana ar. F 122, fol. 35b : un fragment d'un texte zaydite du Yémen', *Chroniques du manuscrit au Yémen* vol. 16, 2013, pp. 16-24.

Abū l-Qāsim al-Ka'bī al-Balḥī and the Mu'tazila of Baghdad

Recent research on *kalām* has also produced significant work on the Mu'tazilite school of Baghdad and its most prominent representative, Abū l-Qāsim al-Ka'bī al-Balḥī (d. 319/931). This branch of Mu'tazilism has long been neglected by scholars of the history of *kalām*—for obvious reasons: the sources are quite problematic because they were mostly written by later antagonists and consequently tend to be polemical. The first detailed study on Abū l-Qāsim al-Balḥī was eventually published in 2016 by R. el Omari.²⁹ Her monograph is the first systematic collection and critical analysis of secondary reports about central elements of the doctrines of this important theologian. Yet el Omari was apparently unaware of the publication of one of Abū l-Qāsim al-Balḥī's works in *kalām*, namely his *ʿUyūn al-masā'il wa-l-ġawābāt*, a work she assumed to be lost.³⁰ Both the recent edition and el Omari's monograph open important new perspectives for further research.

IV. STUDIES ON AŠ'ARISM

After the decline of Mu'tazilism, Aš'arism became the predominant school of *kalām*. Its adherents were primarily Šāfi'ites and Mālikites. Scholars widely agree that the history of Aš'arism can be roughly divided into two major phases, and that the transition from the 'methodology of the earlier' to that of the 'later ones' is closely linked to the teaching of the famous Abū Ḥamid al-Ġazālī (d. 505/1111). Al-Ġazālī's intellectual activity was a landmark in a longer transformation, to which later theologians, like for instance Faḥr al-Dīn al-Rāzī (d. 606/1210), also contributed. On the other hand, some innovations previously associated with al-Ġazālī could actually be traced to earlier phases of Aš'arite history. Nonetheless, the periodisation of 'early' (or 'classical') and 'later' Aš'arism is still helpful and will also structure the following outline.

29 Racha el Omari, *The Theology of Abū l-Qāsim al-Balkhī/al-Ka'bī* (d. 319/931), Leiden, Brill, 2016. See in addition Philippe Vallat, 'Can Man Assess God's Goodness? A Controversy Between Abū Bakr al-Rāzī (d. 925) and Mu'tazili Theologians', *Mélanges de l'Institut Dominicain d'Études Orientales* vol. 31, 2015, pp. 213-251.

30 Abū l-Qāsim al-Balḥī al-Ka'bī, *ʿUyūn al-masā'il wa-l-ġawābāt*, eds. Rāḡiḥ al-Kurdī, 'Abd al-Ḥamid al-Kurdī and Hüseyin Hansu, 'Ammān, Dār al-Ḥamid, 2014.

Early Aš'arism

If Aš'arism is the most important school of Sunni *kalām*, this has not saved it from a significant loss of its literature. The majority of the writings of the earliest representatives of Aš'arism have not survived. Having said this, it is particularly important that two primary sources of great relevance to the early history of Aš'arism have recently been published. The first is an edition of Abū Ḡa'far al-Simnānī's (d. 444/1052) *al-Bayān 'an uṣūl al-īmān*.³¹ The work has survived in a single manuscript and was used extensively by D. Gimaret in his classical 1980 study *Théories de l'acte humain en théologie musulmane*.³² The second publication is a facsimile edition of volume two of the autograph of *Nihāyat al-marām fī dirāyat al-kalām* by Faḥr al-Dīn al-Rāzī's (d. 606/1210) rather lesser-known father, Ḍiyā' al-Dīn al-Makkī (d. middle of the 6th/12th c.).³³ Long passages of the *Nihāya* comprise a recompilation of a work by the author's teacher, namely Abū l-Qāsim al-Anṣārī's (d. 512/1118) *al-Ḡunya fī l-kalām*.³⁴ Both works are incomplete so that each of them allows a relatively clear idea of the missing parts of the other text. Additional major texts of 'early' Aš'arism have been recently discovered but still wait to be published. However, they have been used in some studies on specific theological issues. Problems that have been dealt with include debates on the 'argument from ignorance' (with specific focus on Abū Bakr al-Bāqillānī, d. 403/1013, and Abū l-Ma'ālī al-Ḡuwaynī, d. 478/1085);³⁵ the adoption of Abū Hāšim al-Ḡubbā'ī's (d. 321/933) theory of *aḥwāl* (literally 'states') by Aš'arite theologians;³⁶ and al-Bāqillānī's theory of the human act in his *Hidāyat al-mustaršidīn*.³⁷

31 Abū Ḡa'far Muḥammad b. Aḥmad b. Muḥammad al-Simnānī, *al-Bayān 'an uṣūl al-īmān wa-l-kaṣf 'an tamwihāt ahl al-ṭuḡyān*, ed. 'Abd al-'Azīz b. Rašīd al-Ayyūb, Kuwait, Dār al-Ḍayā', 1435/2014.

32 Daniel Gimaret, *Théories de l'acte humain en théologie musulmane*, Paris, J. Vrin, 1980.

33 Ḍiyā' al-Dīn al-Makkī, *Nihāyat al-marām fī dirāyat al-kalām: Facsimile of the Autograph Manuscript of Vol. II*, ed. Ayman Shihadeh, Tehran, Mirāt-i Maktūb, 2013.

34 Jan Thiele, 'Commonness and Derivative Work in Aš'arite Literature: A Comparison of Ḍiyā' al-Dīn al-Makkī's *Nihāyat al-marām* and Abū al-Qāsim al-Anṣārī's *al-Ḡunya fī al-kalām*', *Mélanges de l'Institut Dominicain d'Études Orientales* vol. 32, 2017, pp. 135-166.

35 Ayman Shihadeh, 'The Argument from Ignorance and Its Critics in Medieval Arabic Thought', *Arabic Sciences and Philosophy* vol. 23, no. 02, 2013, pp. 171-220.

36 Jan Thiele, 'Abū Hāšim al-Jubbā'ī's (d. 321/933) Theory of 'States' (*aḥwāl*) and its Adaptation by Ash'arite Theologians', in Sabine Schmidtke (ed.), *The Oxford Handbook of Islamic Theology*, Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2016, pp. 364-383 includes some preliminary observations based on al-Bāqillānī's still unedited *Hidāyat al-mustaršidīn*; Fedor Benevich, 'The Classical Ash'ari Theory of *aḥwāl*: Juwaynī and his Opponents', *Journal of Islamic Studies* vol. 27, no. 2, 2016, pp. 136-175, focuses on al-Ḡuwaynī.

37 Jan Thiele, 'Conceptions of Self-Determination in Fourth/Tenth-Century Muslim

- Hassan Ansari, 'Sunnism in Rayy during the Seljūq Period: Sources and Observations', *Der Islam* vol. 93, no. 2, 2016, pp. 460-471.
- Mokdad Arfa Mensia, 'Regards d'Ibn Rushd sur al-Juwaynī: questions de méthode', *Arabic Sciences and Philosophy* vol. 22, no. 2, 2012, pp. 199-216.
- Nazif Muhtaroglu, 'Al-Bāqillānī's Cosmological Argument from Agency', *Arabic Sciences and Philosophy* vol. 26, no. 2, 2016, pp. 271-289.
- Yasir Qadhi, 'Salafi-Ash'arī Polemics of the 3rd & 4th Islamic Centuries', *The Muslim World* vol. 106, no. 3, 2016, pp. 433-447.
- Ayman Shihadeh, 'Classical Ash'arī Anthropology: Body, Life and Spirit', *The Muslim World* vol. 102, no. 3-4, 2012, pp. 433-477.
- Ayman Shihadeh, 'Theories of Ethical Value in *Kalām*: A New Interpretation', in Sabine Schmidtke (ed.), *The Oxford Handbook of Islamic Theology*, Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2016, pp. 384-407 [also relevant to later Aš'arism and Mu'tazilism].
- David Thomas, 'Christian Borrowings from Islamic Theology in the Classical Period: The Witness of al-Juwaynī and Abū l-Qāsim al-Anṣārī', *Intellectual History of the Islamicate World* vol. 2, no. 1-2, 2014, pp. 125-142.
- Jan Thiele, 'Between Cordoba and Nisābūr: The Emergence and Consolidation of Ash'arism (Fourth–Fifth/Tenth–Eleventh Century)', in Sabine Schmidtke (ed.), *The Oxford Handbook of Islamic Theology*, Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2016, pp. 225-241.

Al-Ġazālī

Al-Ġazālī is not only an exceptional thinker because of his contributions to Muslim intellectual history but also because modern scholarship has devoted numerous publications to him. This should make him one of the best studied figures in Muslim intellectual history. Three recent monograph studies by A. Treiger, A. Cissé and K. Garden show that interest in al-Ġazālī has not decreased.³⁸ Al-Ġazālī's 900th anniversary in 2011 was the occasion for several collective volumes and special issues of academic journals.³⁹ Some

Theology: al-Bāqillānī's Theory of Human Acts in Its Historical Context', *Arabic Sciences and Philosophy* vol. 26, no. 2, 2016, pp. 245-269.

38 Alexander Treiger, *Inspired Knowledge in Islamic Thought: Al-Ghazālī's Theory of Mystical Cognition and its Avicennan Foundation*, London/New York, Routledge, 2012; Alphousseyini Cissé, *Quelques aspects de la pensée d'Al-Gazālī*, Paris, L'Harmattan, 2013; Kenneth Garden, *The First Islamic Reviver: Abū Ḥamid al-Ghazālī and his Revival of the Religious Sciences*, Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2014.

39 *The Muslim World* vol. 101, no. 4, 2011 & vol. 102, no. 1, 2012 (ed. M. Afifi al-Akiti); *Mélanges*

new translations of al-Ġazālī's works have also been published, including a partial translation of *Iḥyā' 'ulūm al-dīn* into English⁴⁰ and a translation of *Kitāb Asās al-qiyās* into Italian.⁴¹

Maria De Cillis, *Free Will and Predestination in Islamic Thought: Theoretical Compromises in the Works of Avicenna, Al-Ghazālī and Ibn 'Arabī*, London/New York, Routledge, 2013.

Taneli Kukkonen, 'Receptive to Reality: Al-Ghazālī on the Structure of the Soul', *The Muslim World* vol. 102, no. 3–4, 2012, pp. 541–561.

Taneli Kukkonen, 'Al-Ghazālī on the Origins of Ethics', *Numen* vol. 63, no. 2–3, 2016, pp. 271–298.

Edward Omar Moad, 'Al-Ghazālī's Position on the "Second Proof" of the "Philosophers" for the Eternity of the World, in the First Discussion of the Incoherence of the Philosophers', *Sophia* vol. 55, no. 4, 2015, pp. 429–441.

Later Aṣ'arism

Until recently, the development of Aṣ'arism after al-Ġazālī and the increasing integration of elements from the Avicennian system of thought during this period went almost unnoticed by experts in *kalām*. This has greatly changed. Among other researchers, A. Shihadeh has made significant contributions to bringing this era more to the forefront, specifically with his 2006 monograph study on the ethics of the period's most influential thinker, Faḥr al-Dīn al-Rāzī.⁴² More recently, A. Shihadeh has further advanced this field and has focused specifically on the interim period between al-Ġazālī and Faḥr al-Dīn al-Rāzī and the theologians' increasing engagement with Avicenna. Apart from several article-length studies,⁴³ he published a critical

de l'Institut Dominicain d'Études Orientales vol. 30, 2014 (ed. E. Pisani); Ucar Bülent and Frank Griffel (eds.), *900 Jahre al-Ġazālī im Spiegel der islamischen Wissenschaften*, Göttingen, Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, 2015; Frank Griffel (ed.), *Islam and Rationality: The Impact of al-Ghazālī. Papers Collected at his 900th Anniversary*, Leiden, Brill, 2016; Georges Tamer (ed.), *Islam and Rationality: The Impact of al-Ghazālī. Papers Collected at his 900th Anniversary*, Leiden, Brill, 2015.

40 [Abū Ḥāmid] al-Ghazālī, *Kitāb al-'ilm: the Book of Knowledge. Book 1 of the Iḥyā' 'ulūm al-dīn, The revival of the Religious Sciences*, trans. Kenneth Honerkamp, Louisville, Fons Vitae, 2015.

41 [Abū Ḥāmid] al-Ġazālī, *Il Kitāb Asās al-qiyās di al-Ġazālī: Elementi di logica e logica giuridica*, trans. Germana Porcasi, Palermo, Officina di Studi Medievali, 2016.

42 Ayman Shihadeh, *The Teleological Ethics of Fakhr al-Dīn al-Rāzī*, Leiden, Brill, 2006; see also Ayman Shihadeh, 'From al-Ghazālī to al-Rāzī: 6th/12th Century Developments in Muslim Philosophical Theology', *Arabic Sciences and Philosophy* vol. 15, no. 1, 2005, pp. 141–179.

43 Ayman Shihadeh, 'A Post-Ghazālīan Critic of Avicenna: Ibn Ghaylān al-Balkhī on the

edition and comprehensive analysis of an aporetic commentary on Avicenna's *Iṣṣārāt* by Šaraf al-Dīn al-Mas'ūdī (d. before 605/1208).⁴⁴ Furthermore, Faḥr al-Dīn al-Rāzī's approach to interpreting the Qur'ān was subject to a monograph study by T. Jaffer.⁴⁵ Finally, Faḥr al-Dīn al-Rāzī's voluminous *Nihāyat al-ʿuqūl* has been published.⁴⁶ Various shorter studies have shed light on specific theological and philosophical problems discussed by Faḥr al-Dīn al-Rāzī and some post-Rāzian thinkers, as well as on the reception of his thought among the Copts.

Peter Adamson, 'Fakhr al-Dīn al-Rāzī on Place', *Arabic Sciences and Philosophy* vol. 27, no. 2, 2017, pp. 205-236.

Asad Q. Ahmed, 'The Reception of Avicenna's Theory of Motion in the Twelfth Century', *Arabic Sciences and Philosophy* vol. 26, no. 2, 2016, pp. 215-243.

Eşref Altaş, 'An Analysis and Editio Princeps of Fakhr al-Dīn al-Rāzī's *Risālah: Al-Jawhar al-Fard*', *Nazariyat* vol. 2, no. 3, 2015, pp. 77-178.

Fedor Benevich, 'The Essence-Existence Distinction: Four Elements of the Post-Avicennian Metaphysical Dispute (11–13th Centuries)', *Oriens* vol. 45, no. 3–4, 2017, pp. 203-258.

Alnoor Dhanani, 'The Impact of Ibn Sinā's Critique of Atomism on Subsequent *kalām* Discussions of Atomism', *Arabic Sciences and Philosophy* vol. 25, no. 01, 2015, pp. 79-104.

Heidrun Eichner, 'Essence and Existence: Thirteenth-Century Perspectives in Arabic-Islamic Philosophy and Theology', in Dag Nikolaus Hasse and Amos Bertolacci (eds.), *The Arabic, Hebrew and Latin Reception of Avicenna's Metaphysics*, Berlin/Boston, De Gruyter, 2012, pp. 123-152.

Heidrun Eichner, 'Handbooks in the Tradition of Later Eastern Ash'arism', in Sabine Schmidtke (ed.), *The Oxford Handbook of Islamic Theology*, Oxford, Oxford University

Materia Medica of the Canon of Medicine', *Journal of Islamic Studies* vol. 24, no. 2, 2013, pp. 135-174; Ayman Shihadeh, 'Avicenna's Corporeal Form and Proof of Prime Matter in Twelfth-Century Critical Philosophy: Abū l-Barakāt, al-Mas'ūdī and al-Rāzī', *Oriens* vol. 42, no. 3–4, 2014, pp. 364-396; Ayman Shihadeh, 'Fakhr al-Dīn al-Rāzī's Response to Sharaf al-Dīn al-Mas'ūdī's Critical Commentary on Avicenna's *Iṣṣārāt*', *The Muslim World* vol. 104, no. 1–2, 2014, pp. 1-61; Ayman Shihadeh, 'Al-Rāzī's (d. 1210) Commentary on Avicenna's Pointers: The Confluence of Exegesis and Aporetics', in Khaled El-Rouayheb and Sabine Schmidtke (eds.), *The Oxford Handbook of Islamic Philosophy*, Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2016, pp. 296-325.

44 Ayman Shihadeh, *Doubts on Avicenna. A Study and Edition of Sharaf al-Dīn al-Mas'ūdī's Commentary on the Iṣṣārāt*, Leiden, Brill, 2015; see also the book review in this issue.

45 Tariq Jaffer, *Rāzī: Master of Qur'ānic Interpretation and Theological Reasoning*, Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2014.

46 Faḥr al-Dīn al-Rāzī, *Nihāyat al-ʿuqūl fī dirāyat al-uṣūl*, 4 vols., ed. Sa'īd 'Abd al-Laṭīf Fūda, Beirut, Dār al-Ḍaḥā'ir, 1436/2015.

Press, 2016, pp. 494-514.

Khaled El-Rouayheb, 'Must God Tell Us the Truth? A Problem in Ash'arī Theology', in Behnam Sadeghi et al. (eds.), *Islamic Cultures, Islamic Contexts*, Leiden, Brill, 2014, pp. 411-429 [also relevant for early Aš'arism & al-Ġazālī].

Hannah C. Erlwein, 'Proving God's Existence? A Reassessment of al-Rāzī's Arguments for the Existence of the Creator', *Journal of Qur'anic Studies* vol. 19, no. 2, 2017, pp. 31-63.

Muammer İskenderoğlu, 'Fakhr al-Dīn al-Rāzī and Ibn 'Arabī on the Ways to Knowledge of God: Unveiling or Reflection and Reasoning?', in John A. Chesworth et al. (eds.), *The Character of Christian-Muslim Encounter*, Leiden, Brill, 2015, pp. 111-125.

Tarek Ladjal, 'The Development of the Ash'arite Doctrine in North Africa: Building of Theological, Political and Religious Unity', *Academic Journal of Interdisciplinary Studies* vol. 4, no. 3, 2015, pp. 291-300.

Andreas Lammer, 'Eternity and Origination in the Works of Sayf al-Dīn al-Āmidī and Athīr al-Dīn al-Abharī: Two Discussions from the Seventh/Thirteenth Century', *The Muslim World* vol. 107, no. 3, 2017, pp. 432-481.

Felicitas Opwis, 'Attributing Causality to God's law: The Solution of Faḥr ad-Dīn al-Rāzī', in David Reisman and Felicitas Opwis (eds.), *Islamic Philosophy, Science, Culture, and Religion: Studies in honor of Dimitri Gutas*, Leiden, Brill, 2011, pp. 397-418.

Gregor Schwarb, 'The 13th Century Copto-Arabic Reception of Fakhr al-Dīn al-Rāzī: Al-Rashid Abū l-Khayr Ibn al-Ṭayyib's *Risālat al-Bayān al-aẓhar fī l-radd 'alā man yaqūlu bi-l-qaḍā' wa-l-qadar*', *Intellectual History of the Islamicate World* vol. 2, no. 1-2, 2014, pp. 143-169.

Gregor Schwarb, 'Excursus III: The Coptic and Syriac Receptions of Neo-Ash'arite Theology', in Sabine Schmidtke (ed.), *The Oxford Handbook of Islamic Theology*, Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2016, pp. 547-566.

Mark N. Swanson, 'Christian Engagement with Islamic *kalām* in Late 14th-Century Egypt: The Case of al-Ḥawī by al-Makīn Jirjis Ibn al-'Amīd "the Younger"', *Intellectual History of the Islamicate World* vol. 2, no. 1-2, 2014, pp. 214-226.

Hidemi Takahashi, 'Reception of Islamic Theology among Syriac Christians in the Thirteenth Century: The Use of Fakhr al-Dīn al-Rāzī in Barhebraeus' Candelabrum of the Sanctuary', *Intellectual History of the Islamicate World* vol. 2, no. 1-2, 2014, pp. 170-192.

Philippe Vallat, 'Between Hellenism, Islam, and Christianity: Abū Bakr al-Rāzī and His Controversies with Contemporary Mu'tazilite Theologians as Reported by the Ash'arite Theologian and Philosopher Fakhr al-Dīn al-Rāzī', in Damien Janos (ed.), *Ideas in Motion in Baghdad and Beyond: Philosophical and Theological Exchanges between Christians and Muslims in the Third/Ninth and Fourth/Tenth Centuries*, Leiden, Brill, 2015, pp.

178-220.

Robert Wisnovsky, 'Essence and Existence in the Eleventh- and Twelfth-Century Islamic East (*Maṣriq*): A Sketch', in Dag Nikolaus Hasse and Amos Bertolacci (eds.), *The Arabic, Hebrew and Latin Reception of Avicenna's Metaphysics*, Berlin/Boston, De Gruyter, 2012, pp. 27-50.

'Regional Manifestations' of Aš'arism

The growing interest in the developments of Aš'arism after al-Ġazālī shifted the geographical focus onto the Islamic east. It was specifically thinkers from this geographical region—including Faḥr al-Dīn al-Rāzī himself—who contributed to the process that can be described as a synthesis of Aš'arism and post-Avicennian philosophy. Yet some recent works have also focussed a spotlight on the development of Aš'arism in other areas, including the Indian subcontinent⁴⁷ and the Islamic west. The study of Maghribi Aš'arism is receiving new stimuli from research activities in the region itself, with some initiatives of individual scholars and institutions specifically dedicated to the study of Maghribi Aš'arism, such as the Markaz Abī l-Ḥasan al-Aš'arī based in the Moroccan city of Tetuan. In addition, large sections of a recent monograph on Islamic intellectual history in the eleventh/seventeenth century by K. El-Rouayheb are devoted to Mālikite Aš'arism in North Africa.⁴⁸ A. Spevack's book on an Egyptian Aš'arite theologian from the twelfth/eighteenth century further broadens the geographical and temporal perspective of recent approaches.⁴⁹

Aqīdat Abī Bakr al-Murādī, ed. Ġamāl 'Allāl al-Baḥtī, Tetuan, Markaz Abī l-Ḥasan al-Aš'arī, 1433/2012.

Abū l-Ḥaġġāġ Yūsuf b. Mūsā al-Ḍarīr, *al-Tanbīh wa-l-iršād fī 'ilm al-i'tiqād*, eds. Samīr Qūbī, Muḥammad al-'Imrānī and Nūr al-Dīn Šu'aybi, Rabat, Wizārat al-Awqāf wa-l-Šu'ūn al-Islāmiyya, 1435/2014.

47 Asad Q. Ahmed and Reza Pourjavady, 'Theology in the Indian Subcontinent', in Sabine Schmidtke (ed.), *The Oxford Handbook of Islamic Theology*, Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2016, pp. 606-624.

48 Khaled El-Rouayheb, *Islamic Intellectual History in the Seventeenth Century: Scholarly Currents in the Ottoman Empire and the Maghreb*, Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 2015.

49 Aaron Spevack, *The Archetypal Sunnī Scholar: Law, Theology, and Mysticism in the Synthesis of al-Bājūrī*, New York, SUNY Press, 2014; see also Aaron Spevack, 'Egypt and the Later Ash'arite School', in Sabine Schmidtke (ed.), *The Oxford Handbook of Islamic Theology*, Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2016, pp. 534-546.

- Ġamāl 'Allāl al-Baḥtī (ed.), *al-Fikr al-Aš'arī bi-l-Maġrib ḥilāl marḥalatay al-ta'sīs wa-l-tarsīm: al-mu'aṭṭirāt al-Mašriqiyya wa-l-maḥṣūṣiyyāt al-maḥalliyya*, 2 vols., Tetuan, al-Rābiṭa al-Muḥammadiyya li-l-'Ulamā'/Markaz Abī l-Ḥasan al-Aš'arī, 1438/2017.
- Lutz Berger, 'Interpretations of Ash'arism and Māturīdism in Mamluk and Ottoman Times', in Sabine Schmidtke (ed.), *The Oxford Handbook of Islamic Theology*, Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2016, pp. 693-703.
- Mohamed Bilal-Achmal, 'Textos del legado aš'arī magrebí: *Al-'aqida al-burḥāniyya al-aš'ariyya* de Abū 'Amr al-Salālī al-Fāsī', *al-Qantara* vol. 34, no. 1, 2013, pp. 205-213.
- Fahrasat Abī Ġa'far Aḥmad b. Yūsuf al-Fihri al-Lablī*, ed. Nūr al-Dīn Šubad, Tetuan, al-Rābiṭa al-Muḥammadiyya li-l-'Ulamā'/Markaz Abī l-Ḥasan al-Aš'arī, 1434/2013.
- Maribel Fierro, 'The Religious Policy of the Almohads', in Sabine Schmidtke (ed.), *The Oxford Handbook of Islamic Theology*, Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2016, pp. 679-692.
- Abū Bakr Muḥammad Ibn al-'Arabī, *Kitāb al-Af'āl*, ed. Nabīla al-Zikrī, Tetuan, al-Rābiṭa al-Muḥammadiyya li-l-'Ulamā'/Markaz Abī l-Ḥasan al-Aš'arī, 2017.
- Abū 'Abd Allāh Muḥammad b. Muḥammad Ibn 'Arafa, *al-Muḥtaṣar al-kalāmī*, ed. Nizār Ḥam-mādī, Tunis, Dār al-Imām Ibn 'Arafa, 1435/2014.
- Ibrāhīm b. Aḥmad al-Qurašī al-Taymī Ibn Bazīza, *al-Is'ād fī šarḥ al-Iršād (al-muštamil 'alā qa-wā'id al-i'tiqād)*, eds. 'Abd al-Razzāq Basrūr and 'Imād al-Suhayl, Kuwait, Dār al-Ḍiyā', 1435/2014.
- Ibn Ṭalḥa al-Yāburī wa-Muḥtaṣaruḥu fī uṣūl al-dīn*, ed. Muḥammad al-Ṭabarānī, Tetuan, Markaz Abī l-Ḥasan al-Aš'arī, 1434/2013.
- Muẓaffar b. 'Abd Allāh al-Miṣrī al-Muqtaraḥ, *Šarḥ al-Iršād fī uṣūl al-i'tiqād*, 2 vols., ed. Nazīha Ma'ariġ, Tetuan, Markaz Abī l-Ḥasan al-Aš'arī, 2014.
- M. Sait Özervarlı, 'Theology in the Ottoman Lands', in Sabine Schmidtke (ed.), *The Oxford Handbook of Islamic Theology*, Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2016, pp. 567-586.
- Abū 'Abd Allāh Muḥammad b. Yūsuf al-Sanūsī, *Talāṭat 'aqā'id aš'ariyya*, ed. Ḥalīd Zahri, Tetuan, Markaz Abī l-Ḥasan al-Aš'arī, 1433/2012.
- Sabine Schmidtke, 'Ibn Ḥazm's Sources on Ash'arism and Mu'tazilism', in Maribel Fierro, Camilla Adang and Sabine Schmidtke (eds.), *Ibn Ḥazm of Cordoba. The Life and Works of a Controversial Thinker*, Leiden, Brill, 2013, pp. 373-401.
- Delfina Serrano Ruano, 'La diffusion de l'aš'arisme et la réforme du crédo malikite à l'époque almoravide: Ibn Rušd al-Ġadd, Abū Bakr Ibn al-'Arabī et le qāḍī 'Iyād', in Cyrille Aillet and Bulle Tuil Leonetti (eds.), *Dynamiques religieuses et territoires du sacré au Maghreb médiéval: éléments d'enquête*, Madrid, CSIC, 2015, pp. 79-102.

- Delfina Serrano, 'Later Ash'arism in the Islamic West', in Sabine Schmidtke (ed.), *The Oxford Handbook of Islamic Theology*, Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2016, pp. 515-533.
- Justin Stearns, "All Beneficial Knowledge is Revealed": The Rational Sciences in the Maghrib in the age of al-Yūsi (d. 1102/1691), *Islamic Law and Society* vol. 21, no. 1-2, 2014, pp. 49-80.
- Jan Thiele, 'Notes sur l'aš'arisme d'Abū l-Walid al-Bağī', in Nejmeddine Hentati (ed.), *Ishām al-Bāğī wa-l-Laḥmī fī taṭawwur al-maḍhab al-mālīkī/Contribution d'al-Béji et d'al-Lakḥmī à l'évolution du malikisme*, Tunis, Université Ez-zitouna, 2015, pp. 411-431.
- Abū 'Abd Allāh al-Tilimsānī, *Kitāb al-Muḥāḍarāt*, ed. Ikram Bülu'ayş, Tetuan, al-Rābiṭa al-Muḥammadiyya li-l-'Ulamā'/Markaz Abi l-Ḥasan al-Aş'arī, 2017.
- L.W.C. van Lit, 'An Ottoman Commentary Tradition on Ghazālī's *Tahāfut al-falāsifa*. Preliminary Observations', *Oriens* vol. 43, no. 3-4, 2015, pp. 368-413.
- Rotraud Wielandt, 'Main Trends of Islamic Theological Thought from the Late Nineteenth Century to Present Times', in Sabine Schmidtke (ed.), *The Oxford Handbook of Islamic Theology*, Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2016, pp. 707-764.
- Abū l-Ḥasan 'Alī b. 'Abd al-Raḥmān al-Yafrānī al-Ṭanğī, *al-Mabāḥiṭ al-'aqliyya fī šarḥ ma'ānī al-'Aqida al-burhāniyya*, ed. Ğamāl 'Allāl al-Baḥtī, Tetuan, Markaz Abi l-Ḥasan al-Aş'arī, 2017.
- Ḥalid Zahri, *al-Mašādir al-Mağribiyya li-l-'aqida al-Aş'ariyya: bibliyüğrafiyyā wa-dirāsa bibliyū-mitriyya*, 2 vols., Tetuan, al-Rābiṭa al-Muḥammadiyya li-l-'Ulamā'/Markaz Abi l-Ḥasan al-Aş'arī, 2017.

V. CONCLUSION

In many respects, the 'state-of-the-art' in *kalām* studies still appears unsatisfactory. A number of desiderata that had been identified already in 1991 by D. Gimaret have only been partially addressed, and a great deal of basic research remains to be done, including the identification and edition of sources that remain in manuscript form. Yet one has to bear in mind that modern research on *kalām* is a relatively young field of study and that it has seen significant advances, including contributions that have opened perspectives for future work.

The claim that the study of *kalām* can and should not be limited to Muslim scholars and their literary production is not entirely new. However, recent scholarship has underscored that non-Muslim sources are indispensable for the field: the fact that we now possess significant new portions of 'Abd al-Ğabbār's *al-Muğnī fī abwāb al-tawḥīd wa-l-'adl* and even textual fragments from the pen of al-Şāḥib b. 'Abbād that predate 'Abd al-Ğabbār are

just two striking examples from the domain of Muʿtazilite studies. These texts indeed require closer analysis in order to complete and refine our knowledge of Baṣran Muʿtazilī *kalām*. As for the Aṣʿarite school, studies on the Coptic reception of Faḥr al-Dīn al-Rāzī's teaching has also highlighted the relevance of cross-denominational approaches to the study of *kalām*.

Scholars have not only challenged the limitations of the field along the confines of religious communities. The appropriateness of sharply distinguishing between theology and philosophy has also become an important issue. Recent scholarship has devoted a great deal of work to studying the synthesis of post-Avicennian philosophy with *kalām*, specifically with regard to later developments in the Aṣʿarite school. It is now beyond doubt that later *kalām* made a significant contribution to the continuity of *falsafa* (as opposed to the outdated narrative of the 'decline' of philosophy caused by the attacks of the theologians). The methodological distinction between the 'demonstrative' nature of *falsafa* and the 'dialectic' (and therefore inferior) nature of *kalām* appears no longer tenable in the light of recent research. As a result, surveys of 'Islamic philosophy' increasingly acknowledge the 'philosophical' nature of *kalām* in general.⁵⁰ This opens new room for further exploring the relationship between *kalām* and *falsafa*.

Some significant attempts to 'decentralise' the perspective on *kalām* have been made: interest in developments in more 'peripheral' regions like Yemen, Oman or the Maghrib has significantly grown. One might also add the advances in the study of Ottoman *kalām*. However, the latter's marginalisation in scholarship of Islamic intellectual history had nothing to do with a geographical periphery but rather with the previously unquestioned narrative of a 'decline' of Islamic thought under the Ottomans. With the widening of the geographical scope, the timeframe of investigation has also been extended. If several years ago the field was specifically concerned with early *kalām*, the perspective is today much wider than ever before, and important

50 Peter Adamson, 'Arabic Philosophy and Theology before Avicenna', in John Marenbon (ed.), *The Oxford Handbook of Medieval Philosophy*, Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2012, pp. 58-82; Peter Adamson, *Philosophy in the Islamic World: A Very Short Introduction*, Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2015; Peter Adamson, *Philosophy in the Islamic World: A history of philosophy without any gaps, Volume 3*, Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2016; Khaled El-Rouayheb and Sabine Schmidtke (eds.), *The Oxford Handbook of Islamic Philosophy*, Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2016; Khaled El-Rouayheb, 'Theology and Logic', in Sabine Schmidtke (ed.), *The Oxford Handbook of Islamic Theology*, Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2016, pp. 408-431; Frank Griffel, 'Theology Engages With Philosophy: al-Ghazālī's *Tahāfut al-falāsifa* and Ibn al-Malāḥimī's *Tuhfat al-mutakallimīn fī l-radd ʿalā l-falāsifa*', in Sabine Schmidtke (ed.), *The Oxford Handbook of Islamic Theology*, Oxford, Oxford University Press, 2016, pp. 435-455.

work has been done on periods and trends that were previously considered unworthy of serious investigation.