Mount Etna dense array local earthquake $P$ and $S$ tomography and implications for volcanic plumbing

Mireille Laigle, Alfred Hirn, Martine Sapin, and Jean-Claude Lépine
Laboratoire de Sismologie Expérimentale, Département de Sismologie, UMR 7580 CNRS
Institut de Physique du Globe, Paris

Jordi Diaz and Josep Gallart
Institut de Ciencies de la Terra "Jaume Almera," Consejo Superior de Investigaciones Científicas
Barcelona, Spain

Rinaldo Nicolich
Dipartimento di Ingegneria Navale del Mare i per l’Ambiente, Università di Trieste, Trieste, Italy

Abstract. Inversion for the three-dimensional velocity structure of Mount Etna is performed with a data set of arrival times of $P$ and $S$ waves of local earthquakes from temporary dense arrays of three-component seismographs. A high-$V_p$ body revealed by the original tomography without nearby stations is confirmed, and its image is sharpened using new velocity constraints provided by refraction data. Synthetic tests of $V_p$ and $V_p/V_s$ and comparison with an independent artificial source tomography with a fundamentally different geometry consistently calibrate the significance threshold of the resolution indicators. The trustworthy part of the image shows a high-$V_p$ body centered under the southern part of Valle del Bove above the 6 km below sea level deep basement, which extends towards sea level and may be rooted in or through the crust. It has a large contrast of over 1 km/s with the surrounding sediments and sharp lateral limits and can thus be regarded as made of intrusive material of magmatic origin. The massive high-$V_p$ body is heterogeneous in $V_p/V_s$. The regions inside it where $V_s$ is relatively low can then be suspected of containing a proportion of melt or be fractured and act as pressure links or transport zones. Such features may be structurally linked and appear to be activated in eruptive phenomena. By taking into account the heterogeneities in structure and physical state retrieved by seismic tomography a succession of seismic events, deformational episodes, and geochemical variation in lavas can be discussed with respect to the well-observed eruptions.

1. Introduction

In an attempt to bring an image of Mount Etna (Figure 1a) into focus we carried out a comprehensive survey with several seismic methods at different scales and resolutions [Him et al., 1997; Laigle, 1998]. This huge active basaltic volcano is in an unusual location. In map view, it is south and in front of the subduction zone marked by the slab dipping northward beneath the Calabrian block. On an E-W cross section from the Ionian marine basin to northeastern Sicily, it is at the edge of the Mesozoic passive continental margin. Marine reflection seismic profiles reveal active normal faults, as well as heterogeneities in lithospheric structure, inherited from the Mesozoic evolution of the passive margin to the Ionian Sea, with which they interact [Nicolich et al., 2000]. These results could suggest that the development of Etna volcano is structurally related and coeval with features in the lithosphere that indicate a recent change [Hirn et al., 1997]. The slab of Ionian lithosphere to the NNW, under the Calabrian arc and Tyrrhenian Sea, is still identified by seismicity and velocity structure [Selvaggi and Chiarabba, 1995]. Half a million years ago, the regime at the surface changed from regional compression toward the Calabrian arc to extension in the region SE of Etna. This change was presumably controlled by a change in coupling at the interplate boundary. It may result from the stranding of the Sicilian-Peloritan block against the Hyblean continental promontory of Africa, while the slab of Ionian oceanic material under the Tyrrhenian continues its rollback. Etna appears to be constructed uphill of the lateral edge of this slab, defined from seismicity in the mantle under the Tyrrhenian Sea. A crustal-scale active, normal fault at sea continues this direction from Etna toward the SSE, oblique to the Malta Escarpment of the Mesozoic palaeomargin [Hirn et al., 1997; Nicolich et al., 2000]. These active tectonic features at sea are suggested to be sources of the two major catastrophic earthquakes of 1169 and 1693 in eastern Sicily. These seismic events then appear structurally linked to Etna. They also appear to follow the two major changes in eruptive style and magma discharge rate over the millennium, with a third one being in progress [Hirn et al., 1997].

Across Etna, the variation of the deep lithospheric structure is resolved from offshore-onshore crustal refraction and teleseismic data, with which former data [Sharp et al., 1980] can be consistently interpreted in terms of a mantle upwarp. At its top, magma may pond under the crust, but a large amount of
it may not erupt and instead may be advected sideways in the present lithospheric-scale extension and related asthenospheric upwelling, as is the case under oceanic spreading centers [Hirn et al., 1997]. This allows reconciliation of discrepancies in the interpretation of some petrological or geochemical observations, which appear when such a huge magma chamber is assumed to be trapped inside the crust. At a smaller scale a body characterized by a high velocity of P waves, or high-\(V_p\),
body, previously detected in the crust under the edifice by local earthquake tomography [Him et al., 1991] can now be shown, with an artificial source restricted-ray tomography [Laigle and Him, 1999], to reach a shallow level. Exsolution of SO₂, whose rate of discharge at Etna is exceptional, much higher than expected from the eruption rate, can only occur at shallow depth [Allard, 1997]. Since the high-$V_p$ body reaches such a shallow depth, it can be made of the magma from which the gas is exsolved. This magma is not erupted and returns to freeze at depth, its storage being eased by the extensional regime [Laigle and Him, 1999].

Velocity tomography from travel times of local earthquakes is developing as a method for retrieving the three-dimensional (3-D) internal structure of volcanoes, thus providing elements for understanding their plumbing system and the geological evolution of their edifice. Eruption-feeding conduits, geothermally altered regions, magma chambers, and solidified magmatic intrusions have been detected by a number of studies of other volcanoes. In subduction-related volcanoes, smaller volumes of high $V_p$ and also less massive low-$V_p$ structures (the latter regarded as conduits) have been detected, e.g., at Redoubt, Alaska [Benz et al., 1996]; Unzen, Japan [Ohmi and Lees, 1995]; and Mount St. Helens [Lees and Crosson, 1989; Lees, 1992]. Large high-$V_p$ bodies are commonly found and interpreted as solidified intrusions, as, for instance, Hengill-Grensdalur central volcano, Iceland [Toomey and Foulger, 1989]; Mauna Loa and Kilauea and their rift zones [Okitobo et al., 1997] and Kilauea volcano, Hawaii [Thurber, 1984; Rowan and Clayton, 1993; Dawson et al., 1999]; and Piton de la Fournaise, Réunion Island [Nercessian et al., 1996]. For these volcanoes built near oceanic spreading centers or by the action of plumes on oceanic plates, these intrusions within the edifice are part of a broader process which also builds their substructure, oceanic plate, or oceanic island. At Etna the volcanic edifice itself is small and constructed on preexisting continental crust covered by thick sedimentary layers. We suggested that the intrusive material can find space to form this large high-$V_p$ body not only within the edifice but under it, within the preexisting sedimentary volume and possibly deeper in the crust as a consequence of the recent regime of lithospheric extension evidenced on the regional scale [Him et al., 1997; Nicolich et al., 2000].

In the present paper we investigate the fine structure of the intracrustal intrusive magmatic body beneath Etna with high-resolution seismic tomography. In a first experiment of local earthquake tomography (LET) on Mount Etna volcano in 1984, we used a dense temporary array including stations on the upper slopes and summit craters, with mostly three-component seismographs [Him et al., 1991]. Tightly constrained hypocenters allowed insight into earthquake distribution in space and time [Nercessian et al., 1991]. These $P$ and $S$ data were inverted iteratively but without ray tracing through the updated models [Him et al., 1991]. The main structural feature suggested by this tomography was a high-$V_p$ body extending from the summit down to 6 km below sea level (bsl). This has since been confirmed by refraction-reflection profiles [Accaino et al., 1998; Laigle et al., 1998]. Subsequent LET studies have principally used the sparser array with mostly vertical component stations of the permanent volcano monitoring stations [Cardaci et al., 1993; De Luca et al., 1997; Villasenor et al., 1998]. In the results the location, shape, and size of this high-$V_p$ body were only partly recovered. However, we have now confirmed that this high-$V_p$ body indeed reaches up to a shallow depth inside the thick sedimentary cover, with an artificial source undershooting experiment that considers rays propagating only above the basement [Laigle and Him, 1999]. In order to improve the original LET, dense arrays of up to 35 stations with three-component seismographs were again deployed during two 5–6 week periods in 1994 and 1995 (Figure 1b). Seismic activity was rather low, and only 20% additional data were provided. The new data provide a significant check of the earlier experiment since the array was broader, sites were different, and, in particular, seismographs could be located closer to the high-$V_p$ body, including one in the rough Valle del Bove, which had never been instrumented before. New refraction results contribute to defining the initial 1-D model. With the augmented database we perform a number of synthetic tests to assess the reliability of the image, so that anomalies in $V_p/V_s$ can also be discussed. We propose tentative interpretations of some of these anomalies and suggest that corresponding structures have been activated in the major complex eruptions of Etna 1989 and 1991–1993 and allow interpretation of some of its specific features.

2. Reference 1-D Velocity Model and 3-D Inversion

In seismic tomography the 3-D model of $P$ and $S$ wave velocity heterogeneity can be inferred by an iterative inversion procedure linearized with respect to a reference 1-D model of velocity versus depth. Hence the 3-D results depend on the 1-D reference model chosen. In local earthquake tomography (LET) this reference model, termed the “minimum 1-D model,” can be computed with the arrival time data set according to the procedure outlined by Kissling et al. [1994]. However, this procedure is already a linearized inversion and hence depends on an initial model which has to be defined as a first step of the forward problem. In the present case, we constrain this initial model, independent from the LET data, by taking into account the refraction seismic lines from diverse shot points around and on the volcano [Accaino et al., 1998; Laigle et al., 1998]. The refraction velocity values thus measured from sea level down to 6 km bsl appear >0.5 km s⁻¹ higher than those used in the reference models of the original tomography [Him et al., 1991] and subsequent ones, as displayed in Plate 1d. In the new initial 1-D model we used the first arrival refraction velocities but increased the values toward the base of the sedimentary cover to take into account gradients common in these layers. This increase is nevertheless conservative, since the refraction lines sample mostly the surroundings of the high-$V_p$ plug, and hence the velocities that they provide are still lower than the areal average.

However, in the volcanic edifice itself the velocity-depth function is not constrained independently, and several initial models need to be tested against the LET data. Among them, two end-member models are discussed further: initial model G, for gradient (red in Plate 1d), has a velocity-depth increase from the summit to 2 km bsl, whereas model C, for constant, has a constant velocity from the summit to 1 km bsl (dark blue, with red underneath in Plate 1d). Both models, even the latter one, are discretized into 0.5-km-thick layers in order to allow the 1-D minimum procedure to use the data to perturb this constant velocity. The two minimum 1-D models resulting from these two different initial models differ in detail but show two important common features: a contrast in velocity from...
above to below 2 km bsl and a major, deeper velocity contrast at roughly the same depth of 5.5 km bsl. Moreover, the information in the LET data has brought the velocities to higher values in the shallow part of the model, consistent with the refraction results. Residuals in the hypocentral locations have a rather large root-mean-square (RMS) value, which is not attributable to inaccurate data, since timing and reading resolution are of the order of 0.01 s. In the minimum 1-D inversion this results in large station terms. These terms have, however, consistent values over broad areas encompassing stations of the three different surveys and are not therefore related to local problems of instrument type or site geology. They are to be taken as due to structure, and the 3-D inversion shall be allowed to retrieve it. For this 3-D inversion the gradient model G is preferred. The reason is that it relocates as shallower those earthquakes that are associated with eruptive phenomena recorded at the surface in October 1984 and October 1996. The results of the 3-D tomography displayed in the following have to be considered with respect to this minimum 1-D model G (red in Plate 1d).

For the 3-D inversion we use a data set of 156 well-observed earthquakes with an average of 21 data per event, totaling 3319

Plate 1. P wave velocity model resulting from the tomographic inversion, isolines every 0.5 km s⁻¹, kilometric UTM coordinate system. (a) Map at 2 km bsl, (b) N-S section at km 502 E, (c) E-W sections at km 4176 N, and (d) velocity-depth functions as discussed in text: initial and minimum 1-D of two models G and C for the present inversion and model of Hirn et al. [1991]. Red crosses mark nodes of the 3-D inversion scheme in plane in Plate 1a and in depth in Plate 1d.
observations, 2130 of P and 1189 of s waves. Here we consider
our whole dense array data set including 1984, 1994, and 1995
and use the inversion code SIMULPS of Thurber [1983], Eberhart-
Phillips [1993], and Kissling [1988], modified by Thurber [1993]
and Evans et al. [1994]. This code has also been used in to-
monographies of Etna by Cardaci et al. [1993] and De Luca et al.
[1997]. It considers the joint problem of earthquake location
and propagation in a heterogeneous model of both Vp and
Vp/Vs fields, and it solves the problem iteratively by using a
damped least squares method. Travel times are computed at
each iteration in a medium interpolated among a 3-D array of
nodes with the updated velocity values, using an approximate
ray tracer with a pseudo-bending method [Um and Thurber,
1987]. The new results concerning the high-Vp body do agree with those obtained earlier by Him et al. [1991]. This is note-
worthy because the previous code was based on a model pa-
rameterization with blocks of constant velocity and did not take
into account the modification of the structure when retesting
the rays from one iteration to the other.

To adapt to the numbers of data and unknowns, we choose a 2-km spacing of nodes in horizontal planes (red crosses in Plate 1a) and 1-km spacing down to 5 km bsl and then at 7, 9,
and 12 km bsl (red crosses on velocity-depth function in Plate 1d). All computations have been made with two grids rotated 45° with respect to each other. Results are displayed in the
common N-S, E-W frame but have all been checked to also
appear in the other inversions and hence to be independent of
grid orientation. To avoid overinterpreting the data, we
present the results of an inversion with rather conservative
parameters, such as a damping of 10 s 2 km -1 chosen from synthetic tests discussed in section 3. After three iterations the
variance is reduced by 75%, and the RMS residual is reduced from 0.36 s to 0.18 s.

3. Three-Dimensional Vp Tomographic Results and
Synthetic Tests of Significance of Vp and Vp/Vs

On the P wave velocity deviation map at 2 km bsl (Plate 1a)
a large high-Vp region is found centered on the southern Valle
del Bove. Its western edge is particularly sharp and separates
large domains. A lateral velocity contrast up to 30% corre-
sponds to the well-known pre-Etnean sediments, with a veloc-
ity of around 4 km s -1. The sediments contain a core with high
velocity, up to 5.5 km s -1, which is likely made of intrusive
material of magmatic nature. Such a strong and sharp lateral
contrast embedded in the sediments is also obvious in the
wide-angle reflection-refraction profiles of the controlled-
source survey [Laigle and Him, 1999]. A first indication of the
trustworthiness of this main feature is that it had been found
with a completely different inversion code and initial model
[Him et al., 1991]. A second indication can be derived from the
analysis of the ray sampling. Also, in order to estimate the
reliability of results, synthetic model reconstruction tests for
the specific source-receiver geometry of observation have been
proposed [Humphreys and Clayton, 1988; Spakman et al., 1989].

The commonly used checkerboard tests essentially illustrate
the spatial sampling and resolution of the ray geometry but do
not test the reliability of large-scale structure [Lèvesque et al.,
1993], such as the one found here. Hence we prefer to test
synthetic models which have structures of large size and of high
amplitude. This also helps to define the value of the parameters
which are used for the inversion of observed data, for example, a damping factor of 10 s 2 km -1, which allows a compromise
between the recovery of the amplitude and the spatial smooth-
ing of the anomalies. For synthetic models we will first consider
a high-Vp bar, with a geometry different from the result of the
inversion of observations. Then we will consider a cube mim-
icking the upper part of these results, and finally, we will
consider synthetic models that take the Vp structure resulting
from the inversion of observations but two different hypothe-
ses for the corresponding Vp/Vs structures. For each test we
compute times between the source and receiver locations of
the real experiment, through the synthetic model, invert them,
and compare the result to the model. Since the high-Vp domain
appears bounded by a N-S limit in the west (Plate 1a and
Figure 2a), we consider a synthetic model that instead extends
as an E-W bar with a 20% positive anomaly (Figure 2b). This
model is reasonably retrieved by the test (Figure 2c). Hence
the N-S oriented boundary resulting from the inversion of the
observed data is a trustworthy feature required by the observ-
ations, not an artifact due to inadequate ray geometry, as-
sumptions, inversion code, or parameters, which are the same
for the synthetic and observed data.

The distribution in space of the reliability of the image can be displayed by mapping indicators of the quality of the data,
such as hit count and derivative weight sum, or resulting from
the inversion, such as the resolution matrix. Parameters ex-
tracted from the full-resolution matrix, such as the value of the
diagonal element and the spread function [e.g., Menke, 1984],
have been discussed by Toomey and Foulger [1989]. Their dis-
tribution indicates the relative quality of results through the
model. However, the threshold value of the indicators, below
which images should be disregarded, depends on the particular
experiment geometry and inversion parameters in a nonex-
plicit way, and there is no simple means to estimate this thresh-
old value. Synthetic tests allow definition of the regions where
the model can be reconstructed adequately. The resolution
indicators can then be calibrated by identifying their value in
these regions of acceptable results. In the present case, the
inversion of the synthetics of the high-Vp bar appears to re-
trieve the model correctly inside the inner contour in Figure
2c, which is that part of space where the diagonal term of the
resolution matrix has a value in excess of 0.05 and where the
resolution spread function has values smaller than 1.2. Inside
the outer contour (values of 1.5 for the spread function), nodes
are still moderately well resolved, but outside results should be
discarded. Results are not commonly thought of as being sig-
nificant down to a value of the diagonal term as small as
in the present model. For the resolution spread function, however, the
threshold value is relatively small, even better than those
commonly considered. This reflects the fact that the absolute
values themselves have no strong meaning, which is well
known, since they depend on characteristic details of the in-
version, for instance, the number of parameters, as discussed
by Toomey and Foulger [1989]. When we use a sparser gridding
or do not compute Vp/Vs, the diagonal term increases to
values found for other tomographies. This is, of course, at
the cost of a less in model fidelity as recalled by Toomey and
Foulger [1989], which is obviously not justified here since it
implies losing Vp/Vs. In the following, the structures inside the
1.2 or at least 1.5 value contours of the spread function are
discussed.

An even stronger proof, independent from the synthetic
tests, that establishes the threshold of significance of resolution
parameters in the present particular LET of Etna is presented
by Laigle and Him [1999]. It is based on the comparison of the
Figure 2. From left to right, results of the inversion of observations, models, and results of inversion of their synthetics. Contours superimposed on results are for values of the resolution indicators extracted from the full resolution matrix. Inner contour is the value of 0.05 for the diagonal term as calibrated by the comparison with results of artificial source tomography [Laigle and Him, 1999]. This same inner contour corresponds to a value of 1.2 for the resolution spread function. Outer contour is 1.5 for the spread function, above which results are not reliable. Maps at 2 km bsl of (a) $V_p$ deviation (in %) resulting from the inversion of observed data, (b) the synthetic model of E-W bar of high $V_p$ over 2 km thickness centered at 2 km bsl, and (c) result of the inversion of these synthetics to be compared with model in Figure 2b. East-west sections at 4178 N of (d) $V_p$ deviation (in %) resulting from the inversion of observed data, (e) the synthetic model of a cube, centered 1 km south of the section, and (f) the result of the inversion of synthetics to be compared to model in Figure 2e to estimate recovery and leakage.
LET results with those of an artificial source tomography experiment (RAST, for Restricted ray Artificial Source Tomography) with completely different geometries and wave types, which has been specifically designed and carried out for this purpose in the experimental effort on Mount Etna. In the RAST experiment, borehole shots at diverse azimuths from the summit of Etna were recorded on the opposite side. The geometry, with the source at the surface and the short shot-receiver distance, restricts the waves recorded as first or early arrivals corresponding to rays reflected or refracted above the basement interface at 6 km bsl. In this upper volume, within the regions well sampled by the two independent tomographies, RAST and LET can then be considered to have resolved the structure reliably where they give the same result and not reliably where their results differ. The limit between these two parts of the space [Laigle and Him, 1999] allows calibration of the threshold value of parameters extracted from the resolution matrix results. The value of 1.2 for the spread function found with the results of the present LET synthetic test is consistent with this different approach.

On vertical cross sections of Vp through the Valle del Bove (Plates 1b and 1c and Figure 2d) the high-Vp body is seen to reach through the whole upper 5–7 km and confirms the original result of the first tomography of Etna of Him et al. [1991]. Its 5-km-diameter core has a velocity over 5.5 km s−1, contrasting with a velocity lower by 1–1.5 km s−1 in the surrounding sediments. At its edge the isolines of the absolute value of the velocity are vertical. This is orthogonal to the assumed horizontal layering of any reference 1-D model. In order to test the adequacy of the latter we investigate if the observation geometry and inversion code are able to retrieve a synthetic model with a vertical boundary similar to the one found here. We choose as synthetic structure a 6-km-sized cube with a 20% bsl. It can be considered well resolved only down to 9 km bsl, from the observed data (Figure 2d) is a trustworthy feature. can consider that the vertical edge of the high-Vp body found in the middle of the cube in Figure 2f, we are well reconstructed, as illustrated by an E-W vertical cross section through the northern half of the cube in Figure 2e. Since its shape and amplitude are well reconstructed, as illustrated by an E-W vertical cross section through the northern half of the cube in Figure 2e, we can consider that the vertical edge of the high-Vp body found from the observed data (Figure 2d) is a trustworthy feature.

In the inversion of the observations (Figure 2d, displaying the E-W cross section of Vp deviation at km 4178 N (northing in the kilometric UTME coordinate system)) the anomaly of the high-Vp body reduces amplitude at around 4 km bsl, whereas at its eastern edge the spread function value increases to above 1.5. Then it builds up again as a deeper high-Vp body reaching from 6 km bsl to the bottom of the inverted volume at 12 km bsl. It can be considered well resolved only down to 9 km bsl, as indicated by the 1.5 contour. The existence of the shallow high-Vp body above the basement, i.e., above 6 km bsl, is constrained by RAST, for which the ray paths are confined to above this level. While the local earthquake data allow a sampling to larger depth, this gets sparser with depth because of the distribution of the hypocenters. Therefore, even if the spread function value is under 1.5, the deeper high-Vp in the LET inversion might then, in part, not be real but might result from leakage from the shallow high-Vp body documented by RAST and LET. The synthetic test displayed in Figure 2f shows the amount of smearing and the gradual decrease toward depth in the reconstruction of a shallow high-Vp cube. Within the same well-sampled region inside the 1.2–1.5 contour the inversion of the observations (Figure 2d) shows a shape different from that of the high-Vp anomaly, with a local decrease toward depth followed by an increase. The latter, deep high-Vp should then be considered as a trustworthy structure, since it does not appear in the inversion of the synthetics and hence is not due to leakage from the shallow high-Vp. This makes a case for a likely intracrustal root to the high-Vp body through the whole volume, which is resolved down to the bottom of the inverted domain at 12 km bsl. The absolute location in plane of such a column of material of magmatic origin inside the crust is not well constrained because it depends on the location computed for the deepest earthquakes that illuminate it. This is not well constrained in plane because of the reduced aperture of the array and the large heterogeneity.

The present Vp tomography allows estimation of the reliability and accuracy of the image of the high-Vp body found by Him et al. [1991] and sharpening of its 3-D shape. It confirms the extent in depth, well-constrained from above the basement around 5 km bsl, then reaching through the sedimentary cover with a broad extent at 2 km bsl and up to sea level. It constrains as well its location at the southern edge of the Valle del Bove and also under part of the summit region. Some of these elements have not been retrieved in other tomographies [Cardaci et al., 1993; De Luca et al., 1997; Villaseñor et al., 1998]. Several interpretations have been based on the first-order characteristics, location, depth, size, and shape of the high-Vp body suggested by Him et al. [1991], which are still valid. The high-Vp body may represent an ensemble of fossil magma chambers of previous volcanoes whose position migrated [Him et al., 1991]. In this geometry the absolute migration could have been that of the sedimentary and effusive cover of the Vp body toward the SE in the evolutionary model of Etna's shallow structure [Borgia et al., 1992], rather than the migration to the NW of the magma feeding these volcanoes. The intrusion of the body may be related to the extensional context, as well as the excess amount of degassing with respect to erupted lava [Him et al., 1997]. More specifically, because the shallow position of its top [Laigle and Him, 1999] is consistent with SO2 exsolution depth [Allard, 1997], this body could be where the degassed unerupted magma is stored. Its deeper edge could be the origin for shallow magma transport, as in the models of Dobran and Coniglio [1996].

With the large amount of reliable S wave readings due to the use of three-component sensors, we can simultaneously invert for deviations of Vp and for Vp/Vs. When comparing the corresponding maps at 2 km bsl in Plates 2a and 2b within well-sampled areas, the striking features are as follows: (1) the low-Vp medium in which the high-Vp massive body is embedded has high Vp/Vs, which is consistent with its interpretation as a sedimentary domain, with water-filled pores and cracks, and (2) Vp/Vs variations show a smaller spatial wavelength than the high-Vp body, revealing regions of high Vp/Vs inside or at the edges of this body of intrusive magmatic origin, which could indicate the presence of a molten fraction in the solidified intrusion.

The threshold of the resolution spread function for Vp/Vs can be deduced from that of Vp by comparing the averaging vectors for the two parameters in the full-resolution matrix or the distributions of their spread function versus derivative weight sum, following Toomey and Foulger [1989]. This leads to a definition of a larger value for the threshold for Vp/Vs. The corresponding contours of 1.5 for good and 2 for acceptable sampling encompass smaller regions than the 1.2 and 1.5 contours for Vp, which is expected since the S wave data coverage is less dense.

In order to test the resolving power within that well-sampled
region and the reliability of small size features in $V_p/V_s$ with respect to those of $V_p$, we have to check that these particular spots are not the result of artifacts of the experiment. This could occur, for instance, from the data geometry, since the ray coverage for $S$ waves is still poorer than that of $P$ waves. A synthetic model is built by taking the 3-D $V_p$ heterogeneity recovered from the inversion of observations and a constant $V_s$ in space. The 3-D $V_p$ heterogeneity and an almost null $V_p/V_s$ deviation, which therefore is not shown because the image is almost blank, are easily retrieved. This test supports the conclusion that the heterogeneous features of $V_p/V_s$ in the resulting model do not come from experimental or processing artifacts but presumably come from the real structure.

The complementary test is to check that a real structure with the small size of $V_p/V_s$ anomalies resulting from the inversion of observations is within the effective resolving power of observations. We specifically build the synthetic model to be like the one retrieved from observations in both $V_p$ and $V_s$. From the comparison of the results of the inversion of these synthetics (Plate 2 and Figures 3c and 4c) with the inversion of the observations (Plate 2 and Figures 3b and 4b), we can accept as trustworthy the regions where the two images are similar. This is, however, only true when they are similar in a well-sampled region, not when they are similar because of lack of sampling. The contour of the resolution spread function is superimposed in order to show where the results should be disregarded since they are outside the threshold of significance. It is obvious that the observed-synthetic image pairs have several features in common in the central part, where we may discuss $V_p$ and $V_p/V_s$ together and attempt an interpretation.

4. $V_p/V_s$ Compared With $V_p$: Physical State of the Intrusive Magmatic Substructure of Etna

Seismic velocities are known to depend on a wide array of parameters: nature of the rock, temperature and pressure, phase changes in the material, porosity or crack distribution and shape, and nature and state of fluid content. These parameters cannot be uniquely derived from the measure of the spatial variation of deviations of $V_p$, which mainly mirrors lithology, the distribution of rock types. Here $V_p/V_s$ is also obtained, which by comparison with $V_p$ allows discussion of defects, pores, and cracks and their fluid content. In the sediments, $V_s$ is low and $V_p$ is relatively even lower because of lithology, pores, and water content, so that $V_p/V_s$ is relatively very high. We are most interested in the high-$V_p$ parts because they mark the intrusive magmatic parts of the structure, in contrast to the low $V_p$ of both the sedimentary material and the eruptive products of the volcanic edifice. These intrusives with high $V_p$ have also high $V_s$. Their $V_p/V_s$ appears normal to lower than average because they are massive with respect to the surroundings which have low $V_p$ and $V_s$. By contrast, high $V_p/V_s$ because they are made of more porous, loose, and water-filled sediments or eruptive products. Then those regions which have a high $V_p/V_s$ within the high-$V_p$ intrusive part are of particular significance because they correspond to low $V_s$, i.e., fluids containing fractured medium. Such volumes will therefore be called anomalies, and we tentatively interpret them as marking zones of transport, advection, and crystallization of molten fractions. However, at shallow depth, water may be the fluid involved rather than melt if temperature was low and $V_p$ was not too high.

Tentatively, we identify and discuss five such anomalies on the maps at 2 km bsl of Plate 2. Anomaly 1 is located at 2 km bsl, SW of the Central Craters, where the edge of the high-$V_p/V_s$ body is invaded locally by high $V_p/V_s$. Anomaly 2, just NE of the Central Craters, is also centered on 2 km bsl, where a high-$V_p/V_s$ zone encroaches the northeastern edge of the generally low-$V_p/V_s$, high-$V_p$ body. Anomaly 3 is the extension of anomaly 2 toward the surface to the south of the Central Craters by a contorted path. Anomaly 4 may extend anomaly 2 at depth from NE to SE of the central craters, where it might possibly link to the west with anomaly 1. Anomaly 5 is farther away from the summit, to the SE of the southern rim of Valle del Bove (km 506 E, km 4171 N), where a slightly high $V_p/V_s$ coincides with the rather high $V_p$ at the SE edge of the body. Anomaly 1 is at 2 km bsl, where both $V_p$ and $V_p/V_s$ maps (Figures 3a and 3b) show a sharp boundary striking N-S just southwest of the Central Craters. However, the precise location of this limit differs on the two maps by at least a grid point (2 km). This can be considered as significant in this best sampled region, as suggested by the reconstruction in the synthetic test shown in the third column of Plate 2 and Figures 3 and 4. At location km 498 E, km 4174 N to km 4176 N in Figure 3, the edge of the high-$V_p$ body to the east of this limit appears invaded by the high-$V_p/V_s$ anomaly, whereas farther west the latter is instead associated with the low-$V_p$ sediments. This anomaly is clearly seen in Figures 4a and 4b in the E-W cross sections at km 4174 N and km 4176 N. In the original tomography with 1984 data [Hirn et al., 1991] a low $V_p$ under the high $V_p$ here was suggested as an example of the possible signature of a batch of magma, in a region where magma-sediment interaction would be likely from geochemical studies. During the preparation or initial phase of the 1991–1993 eruption, measurements of GPS and tilt and electronic distance measurements (EDM) showed deflation to have occurred in the region of anomaly 1. Indeed, the location in space and depth of the centers of deformation modeled from these measurements by Nunnari and Puglisi [1994a, 1994b] and Bonnacorso et al. [1994] coincide with anomaly 1, though they may be nearer to the summit according to Bonnacorso [1996]. Anomaly 2 is a high-$V_p/V_s$ region that encroaches into the sharp and straight northeastern edge of the large high-$V_p$ body seen at 2 km bsl in Plate 2a, southwest along km 502 E (Plate 2b, see also Figures 4a and 4b on the N-S section at 502 E). This shows that a part of the high-$V_p$ body has low $V_s$. It may be regarded as a part of the intrusive body, which is fractured and possibly contains magmatic fluids. The result of the synthetic test illustrates that the experiment is able to reconstruct such a feature. We may remark that its northern edge at 4 km beneath the surface is located at km 4180 N, beneath the NE rift zone of the 1865, 1928, 1971, and 1979 eruptions of Etna [Chester et al., 1985]. These eruptions have had high output rates. The high-$V_p/V_s$ anomaly could indicate a suitable structure for storing magma intermittently and for providing an efficient eruptive source when tapped. This can occur as a result of tectonic disruption at the top, which is likely the case for some of these eruptions, which occurred after episodes of surface fracturing between the summit and their vents on the NE flank. In recent periods of increased seismic monitoring, this region of anomaly 2 at km 4178 N, km 502 E has been revealed to be seismically activated in temporal relation to volcanic activity, while the effusive vents were ~3 km farther south. For instance, strong swarms of earthquakes occurred in the very end of the SE crater eruption of 1984 [Hirn et al., 1991].
Plate 2. Map views at 2 km bsl. A curved barbed line includes the Valle del Bove (VBO) depression of the upper eastern flank and the Central Craters (CC) to its northeast. Labels 1, 2, 4, and 5 locate corresponding anomalies discussed in text; anomaly 3 is shallower and is located in the cross sections of Figures 3 and 4. (a) $V_p$ deviation inverted from observations, superimposed are contours of values of 1.2, inner contour, and 1.5, outer contour, of the resolution spread function. (b) $V_p/V_s$ inverted from observations, superimposed are contours of values of 1.5, inner contour, and 2, outer contour, of the resolution spread function for that parameter. (c) $V_p/V_s$ inverted from times computed through synthetic model similar to that inverted from observations.
Figure 3. E-W cross sections at UTM kilometric northing (latitude) indicated at bottom right corner of each, with easting (longitude) kilometric ticks. Thick contours as in Plate 2. (a) $V_p$ deviation inverted from observations, contours in percent, (b) $V_p/V_s$ inverted from observations, and (c) $V_p/V_s$ inverted from synthetic times computed through model similar to that inverted from observations.
Figure 4. N-S cross sections at UTM kilometric easting (longitude) indicated at bottom right corner of each, with northing (latitude) kilometric ticks. Thick contours as in Plate 2. (a) $V_p$ deviation inverted from observations, (b) $V_p/V_s$ inverted from observations, and (c) $V_p/V_s$ inverted from synthetic times computed through model similar to that inverted from observations.
and is also reported for the onset in December of the 1991–1993 eruption [Ferrucci and Patanè, 1993]. During the latter eruption the peculiar seismicity made of long-period events also developed in this region NE and close to the summit craters after January 1992 [Falsaperla et al., 1994]. A new magma batch is shown by geochemistry to have mixed with previous ones [Treuil and Joron, 1994] in the second half of this eruption. Synthetic aperture radar (SAR) satellite-based deformation measurements during this second part were interpreted by Massonnet et al. [1995] as being due to magmatic discharge from a center of deflation that they locate slightly east of the Central Craters.

Anomaly 3 is suggested to be a physical link between anomaly 2, the site of seismic activation in the eruptive episodes described, and the corresponding surface vents. In the major 1991–1993 eruption, anomaly 2 was seismically activated, whereas venting did not occur above it but occurred in the southern summit region of the central cone. Also, while the 1984 eruption occurred at the vent of the southeastern crater, the seismic swarms that marked its end occurred to the northeast of the summit, in anomaly 2. In the E-W section at km 4178 N (Figure 3), anomaly 2 at km 502 E (2 km bsl) is seen to be continued upward to the west, reaching sea level at 500 E. We identify this continuation as anomaly 3, for which a further upward continuation is shown in Figures 4a and 4b, in the N-S section which cuts at km 500 E just across the summit. There the anomalous, high-\(V_p\) and high-\(V_p/V_s\) volume shallows southward and finally reaches the surface along km 4173–4175 N, km 500 E. This corresponds broadly to the location of the vents of the 1991–1993 eruption and numerous previous eruptions of Etna. The synthetics suggest that this structure is trustworthy, although it is small. This is presumably because it is shallow and rather well sampled by the large number of temporary stations located on the upper flanks and Central Craters and of seismic sources in the region of anomaly 2.

Anomaly 4 is a southward extension of anomaly 2, east of the craters, at km 502 E on the map at 2 km bsl (Plate 2a). In the inversion of the observations (Plate 2b and Figure 4b), anomaly 4, with high \(V_p/V_s\) reaches southward to km 4173 N, south of the craters and continues toward west (E-W cross sections at km 4174 N south of the Central Craters in Figures 3a and 3b). There anomaly 4 could connect as a faint anomaly of high \(V_p/V_s\) through the low-\(V_p/V_s\) and high-\(V_p\) body to the southern end of anomaly 1, situated a few kilometers SW of the Central Craters. Anomaly 4 would thus link anomaly 1 at distance with anomaly 2 east of the Central Craters. However, the corresponding synthetics show that the suggestion of anomaly 4 extending south of km 4176 N is not reliably established. Anomaly 4 could provide the structural link needed to be able to interpret the succession in time of events separated in space at the beginning of the 1991–1993 eruption. Indeed, this long-lasting eruption has been fed by a succession of compositionally different magma batches that followed diverse space-time paths toward eruption according to the geochemical studies of Armienti et al. [1994] and Treuil and Joron [1994]. The latter describe the succession with time as (1) a mingling of two different batches from the very beginning of the eruption on December 14, 1991, (2) evolution to a more stationary position of two different batches from the very beginning of the eruption. Indeed, Patanè et al. [1994] contend that focal mechanisms do not agree with the latter model and also that their diversity does not allow them to interpret them as due to a uniform regional stress. The orientations of dip slip that they find for these shocks NE and ESE of Etna appear to be conjugate when considered with respect to the high-\(V_p\) intrusive core of the volcano in between. This suggests that these earthquakes could be interpreted in terms of a bulk westward subsidence of the high-\(V_p\) block, as a transient marking the end of the sustained magma pressure which fed the eruption.

5. Discussion and Conclusions

The present \(V_p\) and \(V_p/V_s\) tomography uses a data set of Etna local earthquakes recorded by a dense array temporarily deployed in 1984 [Him et al., 1991] augmented by data of recent similar deployments in 1994 and 1995, which included stations in the region of the Valle del Bove. Velocity con-
straints on the upper part of the model are provided by new artificial source data and inversions for the minimum 1-D model from two end-member initial models. In spite of the change of the velocity model and of the inversion code the same structure is found as in the original tomography, where the results were deemed reliable. This is likely due to the dense array character of the data. The present results extend and sharpen those of the original tomography, confirming the high-V_p body centered on the southern Valle del Bove and reaching up toward sea level that was revealed by the original tomography of Him et al. [1991]. In contrast, images resulting from other studies with more data but a sparser array were reported to differ from the original one [Cardaci et al., 1993; De Luca et al., 1997; Villaseñor et al., 1999], but they also differ from each other, although the bulk of their database is the same. In our case of the dense array the information on structure appears robust with respect to the velocity model or inversion code. Images obtained from sparse arrays instead appear code- and assumption-dependent. This hampers interpretation in very heterogeneous volcanic areas.

The present LET retrieves the high-V_p body, which reaches to shallow depth, being best expressed at 2 km bsl and even shallower. This shallow depth range is the region where the results differ most among the different published LET studies of Etna. The waves turned back by the basement in the RAST [Laigle and Hirn, 1999] exclusively sample this shallow part. They hence constrain the high-V_p body to extend to shallow depth. This demonstrates the reliability of the present LET as well as of the original one [Hirn et al., 1991], which found this feature, whereas other LET do not find it at this depth. Synthetic tests are performed to check the quality of the LET inversion and to define trustworthy regions of the inverted volume. These synthetic tests are compared with indicators extracted from the full-resolution matrix. The areas not well reconstructed in the synthetics have resolution indicators below the threshold calibrated by Laigle and Hirn [1999] from the consistency between results of LET and RAST, two tomographies with completely different geometry.

The high-V_p body resulting from the inversion of the observations can be regarded as an acceptable representation of the real structure, since synthetic tests show that the shape of its edge comes from information in the data and not from the experiment geometry or inversion code. Similarly, synthetics establish that its vertical extension as a sharp contrast in velocity could be correctly retrieved in spite of the assumption of an initial 1-D velocity-depth model. LET establishes the presence of a deeper high-V_p anomaly, which traverses the crust below the top of the basement and which is possibly the root of the large high-V_p body embedded in the sediments. The likely intrusive magmatic nature of the high-V_p body is indicated by the contrast of its velocity with that of surrounding sediments. Then the exceptional proportion of reliable shear wave readings from three-component sensors provides the data to discuss its physical state. When considering V_p/V_s, the massive high-V_p body appears significantly heterogeneous, and complementary synthetic tests establish that this is required by the data. Regions inside it where V_p is low can then be suspected of containing a proportion of melt or being fractured and acting as pressure links or transport zones. A main such anomaly is imaged at 2 km bsl east of the Central Craters. Seismic activation occurred there in relation with eruptive phenomena at surface vents located south of the Central Crater, such as the stopping phase of the 1984 eruption and an episode of the 1991–1993 eruption. Indeed, LET resolves a contorted structural anomaly linking this deep anomaly east of the Central Craters below sea level and the region of the surface vents located south of them. The main anomaly inside the high-V_p body east of the Central Craters may also connect to the edge of this high-V_p body. This is the case, for instance, toward the north, where it reaches the region of the NE rift zone. Flank eruptions occurred nearby, as well as destructive earthquakes in relation to eruptive episodes. Another anomaly is located at 2 km bsl under the SW edge of the high-V_p body. It corresponds to the location of a deflation source in the preparation or initial phase of the 1991–1993 eruption. However, venting occurred far away, on a fissure radiated from the summit, after a preeruptive seismic crisis, which migrated from the SE to the summit. A connection at depth between these zones to the south between the anomalies SW and east of the Central Craters is suggested in the inverted structure but is only marginally significant using the available data.

By taking into account the heterogeneities in structure and physical state retrieved by seismic tomography, a succession of seismic events, deformational episodes, and geological variation of lava can be put in a consistent perspective with respect to recent eruptions. Some of the structural features had been detected and discussed previously but here are brought into focus. Better resolution by more extensive and dense spatial sampling is still desirable. It is within reach of experimental efforts of simultaneous deployment of a large number of three-component seismographs, up the volcano and inside the Valle del Bove for a long duration to record a larger set of well-distributed earthquakes.

Acknowledgments. This research is part of the multimethod seismic approach of Etna funded partly by EC Environment Programme, Volcanic Hazard, under contract ETNASEIS EV5V-CJ92-0187 to A. Hirn, R. Nicoll, J. Gallart, and B. Brandsdottir. The help of E. Kissling and J. Ansorge of ETH Zurich in providing additional instruments is acknowledged. We acknowledge the use of Simulpol14 and TOMO2GMT packages of E. Kissling, F. Haslinger, and S. Husen. We thank C. Thubner, J. Hole, and anonymous referees for extensive and constructive criticism and suggestions which led to significant evolution of the paper and for their patience. Contribution IPGP 1684.

References


Borgia, A., L. Ferrari, and G. Pasquaré, Importance of gravitational


J. Diaz and J. Gallart, Institut de Ciencies de la Terra “Jaume Almera,” CSIC, c/Lluis Sole Sabaris s/n, E-08028 Barcelona, Spain.

A. Hirn, M. Laigle, J.-C. Lépine, and M. Sapin, Laboratoire de Sismologie Expérimentale, Département de Sismologie, UMR 7580 CNRS, Institut de Physique du Globe, 4 Place Jussieu, F-75252 Paris Cedex 05, France. (hirn@ipgp.jussieu.fr)

R. Niccolich, Dipartimento di Ingegneria Navale del Mare i per l’Ambiente, Università di Trieste, Via Valerio 10, I-34127, Trieste, Italy.

(Rceived June 2, 1999; revised May 7, 2000; accepted May 31, 2000.)