Susceptibility of two co-existing mytilid species to simulated predation under projected climate change conditions

Jose MF Babarro^{1*}, María José Abad², Ignacio Gestoso³, Elsa Silva¹, Celia Olabarria⁴

¹ Instituto de Investigaciones Marinas CSIC, Eduardo Cabello 6, 36208 Vigo, Spain

² Grupo de Polímeros (CIT), Campus de Esteiro, C/Dr Vázquez Cabrera, s/n 15403- Ferrol (A Coruña), Spain

³ MARE – Marine and Environmental Sciences Centre, Quinta do Lorde Marina, Sítio da Piedade, 9200-044 Caniçal, Madeira Island, Portugal

⁴ Departamento de Ecoloxía e Bioloxía Animal, Universidade de Vigo, 36310 Vigo, Spain

*Corresponding author. Email: jbabarro@iim.csic.es

Tel.: +34 986 231930 Ext. 207; Fax: +34 986 292762

Abstract

The properties of the shells and byssus filaments secreted by marine mussels are affected by environmental and biotic factors. In this study, we investigated the effects of pH and temperature on shell and byssus in artificially created monospecific and mixed aggregations of the indigenous mussel *Mytilus galloprovincialis* and the invasive mussel *Xenostrobus securis*. The variability in the response of the mussels was mainly explained by species-specific interactions derived from the type of aggregation. In the mixed groups, acidic conditions caused a decrease in byssus strength in *M. galloprovincialis*, but an increase in byssus strength in *X. securis*. Increased temperature positively affected shell strength in *X. securis*, but only in mixed aggregations. Interactive effects of acidification and warming were only detected in the organic matter of shells, the strength of which decreased in *M. galloprovincialis* in mixed aggregations. Although the invasive mussel may be able to take advantage of changed conditions by enhancing byssal attachment, the effects that acidification has on the shell may make this species more vulnerable to some predators. The study findings provide some insight into the responses of protective and attachment structures of mussels to biotic and abiotic stressors, highlighting how species-interactions may cause imbalances in future populations.

34 **Keywords.** *Mytilus galloprovincialis*, *Xenostrobus securis*, protective structure, byssus attachment, climate
35 change
36
37

38 **Introduction**

39 The increase in atmospheric CO₂ concentrations due to human activities is provoking changes in the global
40 climate, modifying atmospheric and oceanic temperatures and sea carbon chemistry (Meehl et al., 2007), with
41 the consequent acidification of the oceans (Doney et al., 2009). Since the industrial revolution, the
42 concentration of atmospheric CO₂ has increased from 280 to 395 ppm, causing a decrease in the pH of surface
43 ocean waters of 0.1 units and an increase in the global mean sea surface temperature of 0.7 °C (Raven et al.,
44 2005). Such changes have modified the carbonate (dissociation) system, leading to a decrease in the
45 concentration of carbonate ions and a consequent reduction in CaCO₃ saturation states of aragonite (Ω arag)
46 and calcite (Ω calc) (Gazeau et al., 2013). The CO₂ concentration is expected to rise above 1100 ppm by the end
47 of this century, possibly leading to a decrease in pH of approximately 0.3-0.4 units and an increase in the mean
48 global sea surface temperature of between 2.6 and 4.8 °C (IPCC, 2013). These predictions for the open ocean
49 may have even greater impacts in coastal or nearshore zones due to the possibly wider range of pH variation
50 caused by coastal upwelling, aquaculture, urban activities and marine-terrestrial interactions, which may
51 further exacerbate the worst scenarios predicted. Ocean acidification and warming have significant
52 consequences at many organization levels in marine ecosystems and the combination of both may have an
53 even stronger impact than the sum or product of the separate effects (Fabry et al., 2008; Duarte et al., 2014).

54 Mussels are important ecosystem engineers that dominate rocky shores worldwide and that have a
55 significant ecological role with important implications for ecosystem functioning and coastal diversity
56 (Borthagaray & Carranza, 2007). Moreover, some species of the family Mytilidae represent a large part of
57 worldwide aquaculture production, especially those species belonging to the genus *Mytilus*. The calcium
58 carbonate shell of mussels is composed of between 95 and 99.9% CaCO₃ arranged in two polymorphs: an
59 outer layer of calcite (prismatic) and an inner layer of aragonite (nacreous layer), whereas the remaining mass
60 (0.1–5 %) corresponds to the organic matrix (Marin et al., 2008). Formation of the shell (including the organic
61 matrix) and calcification are both physiologically costly processes and may be sensitive to environmental
62 changes, e.g. changes in pH and temperature (Duarte et al., 2014; Li et al., 2015; Gestoso et al., 2016).
63 Although acidification has very variable effects on shell structure or growth, the findings of many studies
64 suggest a negative impact on calcification rates in mussels (Michaelidis et al., 2005; Fernández-Reiriz et al.,
65 2012; Gazeau et al., 2013). The effects include loss of shell integrity and functionality (Fitzer et al., 2015),
66 which in turn may affect predator-prey interactions, making mussels more vulnerable to predators (Amaral et
67 al., 2012). Nevertheless, no impact or even positive consequences of ocean acidification have been reported

68 (e.g. Ries et al., 2009), suggesting that the responses of organisms to environmental change may be species-
69 specific (Fernández-Reiriz et al., 2012) and locally influenced (Range et al., 2014).

70 Much less information is available about another key material secreted by mussels, i.e. the byssal filaments
71 that ensure a gregarious and sessile mode of life by enabling these organisms to attach to almost any surface
72 (Waite, 2002). Recent studies of mytilids have revealed that this non-calcifying material may also be negatively
73 affected by acidification (O'Donnell et al., 2013; Sui et al., 2015; Zhao et al., 2017). For example, the byssal
74 threads of *Mytilus trossulus* exposed to high levels of CO₂ were weaker and less extensible than those of
75 mussels exposed to control conditions (O'Donnell et al., 2013). Moreover, exposure of the mussel *M. coruscus*
76 to low pH conditions (i.e. 7.3) negatively affected the number of byssal threads secreted, while the impact of
77 more usual pH (i.e. 7.7) depended on O₂ concentration (Sui et al., 2015). Secretion of byssal threads by the
78 internal secretory gland is also pH-dependent for a number of chemical functions involving histidine-metal
79 crosslinks, which together with the high concentration of the modified amino acid 3,4-dihydroxyphenylalanine
80 (Dopa) play an important role in adhesion to surfaces and self-healing after deformation (Harrington & Waite,
81 2007).

82 Temperature is another key environmental variable that affects bio-mineralization processes, growth and
83 metabolism of mussels (Gazeau et al., 2013). Temperature often mediates physiological responses and
84 regulates the development of life history traits via energetic costs (Barbosa et al., 2014). The allocation of
85 energy to protective structures or soft tissues of organisms may therefore be greatly affected by changes in
86 temperature. As the pH and temperature of the ocean vary simultaneously, synergistic effects are highly likely
87 (Pörtner et al., 2005; Pörtner, 2008; Kroeker et al., 2013). This has significant ecological and functional
88 implications, although the magnitude and direction of effects may vary among species (Li et al., 2015).
89 Together with temperature, acidification may cause a narrowing of optimal thermal windows (Pörtner &
90 Farrell, 2008), which may increase the susceptibility of protective structures to environmental change (Gazeau
91 et al., 2013). However, temperature does not always interact synergistically with acidification, e.g. in shell
92 breaking force in *M. edulis* (Li et al., 2015), and it may even offset the negative effects of acidification (Kroeker
93 et al., 2014).

94 Apart from the physiological and behavioural responses of mussels, species interactions may modulate the
95 effects of environmental conditions at individual and assemblage levels, highlighting the complexity of mussel
96 responses when various environmental factors act together (Li et al., 2015; Gestoso et al., 2016). For example,
97 under acidic conditions *M. galloprovincialis* survived better in mixed aggregations with *X. securis* than in
98 monospecific aggregations (Gestoso et al., 2016). The former species also showed a greater resistance to
99 heatwave stress when co-occurring with *X. securis* in mixed aggregations (Olabarria et al., 2016). Temperature
100 can also alter predator-prey interactions by modifying prey abundance and thus altering the activity of
101 predators (Dahlhoff et al., 2001; Queirós et al., 2015). Overall, species interactions may make the responses of
102 species less predictable and even closely-related species may show opposite responses in multispecies

assemblages due to alterations in the effectiveness of predation in the most tolerant species (Hale et al., 2011; Kroeker et al., 2011).

In the present study, we carried out a mesocosm experiment to explore the possible interactive effects of pH and temperature on two distinct protective structures, i.e. calcified and non-calcifying byssal filaments, in two co-existing mussel species, the invasive black pygmy *Xenostrobus securis* (Lamarck, 1819) and the native, commercially-important *M. galloprovincialis* (Lamarck, 1819). The species co-occur on rocky shores of the inner areas of Galician Rias Baixas (NW of Spain), but the abundance of each varies greatly along the estuarine gradient, mainly in relation to the salinity (Gestoso et al., 2012). Although both species belong to the same family, *Mytilidae*, they differ in their biological and ecological traits (Babarro & Lassudrie, 2011, Babarro & Abad, 2013) and have been reported to respond differently to changes in pH and temperature (Gestoso et al., 2015; 2016). We also investigated whether the mussel responses were both shaped by the presence of conspecific or heterospecific mussels. Most research has focused on the effects of climate change on mussels in isolation (but see Gestoso et al. 2016), and less information is available for predicting the impact of species interactions on the responses of individuals. Finally, after exposing the mussels to various conditions of pH and temperature, we tested the resistance of the shells to simulated mechanical and chemical stress of one of the most common benthic predators of mussels, i.e. the dog whelk *Nucella lapillus*. Dogwhelks, like other muricids, drill holes in shells of their prey, usually either above the most nutritious part or the most easily accessible point of the shell (Morton, 2008). They attack different calcified shelled species with a very efficient predatory strategy that involves drilling the prey shell by both mechanical and chemical processes before ingesting the internal soft tissues (Gabriel, 1981). Potential changes in shell properties in terms of composition and functionality derived from changes in pH or temperature would make mussels more vulnerable to attack by predators. This is especially important for comparison of these two mytilids, the shells of which differ considerably in terms of inorganic carbon content (Gestoso et al., 2016).

Materials and Methods

Artificially assembled aggregations

Individual mussels of similar size (*M. galloprovincialis*: 33.13 ± 0.24 mm shell length; *X. securis*: 33.50 ± 0.20 mm shell length; mean $\pm$ SE) were collected from the mid-intertidal area of a rocky shore in the inner part of the Ria de Vigo, NW Spain ($42^{\circ} 18' 43''$ N, $8^{\circ} 38' 9''$ W). The mussels were transported to the laboratory where epibionts were removed from the shells and byssal threads were carefully cut from the ventral margin. The mussels were then allowed to establish primary attachment to experimental units, i.e. PVC plates (15 x 15 x 0.5 cm) covered with biodegradable cotton mesh. Three types of aggregations of similar densities to those observed in the field were established: monospecific aggregations of *M. galloprovincialis* (14 individuals),

monospecific aggregations of *X. securis* (10 individuals) and mixed aggregations (7 individuals of *M. galloprovincialis* and 5 individuals of *X. securis*).

Mesocosm system

The experiment was carried out in the CIIMAR Coastal Biodiversity Laboratory in Porto (Portugal). Eight tanks (350-L), each equipped with its own mechanical and biological filter system, were filled with 1 μ m filtered-seawater. Seawater temperature and pH were orthogonally manipulated to produce the desired climate change conditions (IPCC, 2013) with two different levels of each: pH 8.00 and 7.65 and temperature 16 °C and 21 °C. Each treatment level was replicated in two randomly-positioned tanks, and seven replicates of each type of mussel aggregation (3 types) were randomly placed in each tank. The seawater in the tanks was renewed once a week. The pH was manipulated by diffusing pure CO₂ from a gas tank to the experimental tanks through a pH stat system (Aqua Medic AT Control) by opening or closing a solenoid valve when the pH readings in the experimental tanks deviated by 0.1 unit from the predetermined set points (see Gestoso et al., 2016 for detailed experimental set-up). The temperature in each tank was controlled with titanium aquarium chillers, which were also fitted with UV sterilizers (TECO TC-15). Mean pH, temperature, salinity, dissolved inorganic carbon (DIC), CO₂ pressure and total alkalinity for each treatment level are shown in Table 1, along with the saturation state for both calcite (Ω_{calc}) and aragonite (Ω_{arag}). Temperature and pH were continuously monitored using dedicated electrodes and the data-logger function of the controller. The pH electrodes were standardized against Tris seawater buffer (ionic strength, 0.7 M). Salinity was checked at least three times a week with a refractometer, and water from each tank was sampled twice a week for analysis of total dissolved inorganic carbon (TDIC). Samples were analysed with a Licor LI-7000 CO₂ analyzer within 3 days of collection, and TDIC was then partitioned into CO₂, bicarbonate, alkalinity, and carbonate from salinity, temperature and pH by using the Matlab program csys.m (Zeebe and Wolf-Gladrow, 2001). Calcium concentration was estimated from the salinity according to the concentrations of ions in seawater (Pilson, 2013). The saturation states of calcite (Ω_{calc}) and aragonite (Ω_{ara}) were calculated using the thermodynamic solubility product of calcite and aragonite following Morse et al. (1980).

Mussels were held under ambient pH conditions (pH 8.00) at 16 °C for 7 days prior to the experiment. The experiments lasted for 22 days, during which mussels were fed (3 % of total tissue dry-weight) once a day, every two days. Feeding was stopped 24 h before the measurements were started.

Shell characteristics: thickness, compressive strength and composition

Shell thickness and compressive force were measured in the left valves of 5 to 8 mussels for each type of aggregation and treatment level. Shell thickness was measured with calipers (Mitutoyo 0–25 $\pm$ 0.01 mm) at the highest point of each valve, i.e. where the force was applied (see below). The compressive force required to break the shell was measured with a universal testing machine (Instron 5566) by applying a 1 kN cell load at an

172 extension rate of 2 mm s⁻¹ (see Babarro & Abad, 2013). Each individual mussel was placed horizontally with the
173 shell edge on a flat surface, and a compressive force was then applied with a 2 mm diameter steel tip placed
174 on the curved surface at the highest point used to measure shell thickness. Load displacement curves up to
175 shell breaking point were constructed, and shell strength was calculated from the maximum force identified in
176 the curves. Although this does not provide absolute values of the compression strength of shells, the values
177 obtained can be used to compare the mechanical functionality of shells exposed to different combinations of
178 factors at different levels.

179 In addition, 6 mussels were sampled from each type of aggregation and treatment level for analysis of the
180 organic (periostracum) content of shells (Addadi et al., 2006). Organic content was determined using the
181 gravimetric method, by calculating the organic matter loss after calcination at 600 °C. The inorganic
182 carbonates were measured by inductively coupled plasma optical emission spectrometry (ICP-OES).

183

184 *Shell resistance to mechanical and chemical stress*

185 Shells of 16 individuals of each species were randomly selected from the four environmental tests and
186 analysed to determine their resistance to different chemical and mechanical stresses simulating attacks by
187 dogwhelks. Only shells of mussels from mixed aggregations were considered because the most significant
188 changes in shell composition were observed in this type of aggregation. Empty shells were dried and weighed
189 to the nearest 0.001 g before and after being exposed to the different stress factors. Specifically, the effects of
190 0.06M EDTA, 0.05 mM hydrochloric acid (pH 4.0) and a non-specific protease (papain from papaya latex Sigma
191 P3375, 1 g/100mL, at pH 7.16 with 1N NaOH) were tested during a period of 24 h, with empty shells placed in
192 50 ml glass flasks (see Gabriel, 1981 for detailed description of procedure). In addition, abrasion was simulated
193 by placing empty shells in 3.5 L glass flasks each containing 10.5 g of fine grade carborundum 80 powder (165
194 µm; Fisher Chemical) for 7 days. Water motion was simulated by magnetic stirrers placed at the bottom of the
195 flasks, and empty shells were hung and maintained in the water column. All tests were carried out at room
196 temperature, except the protease assay, which was conducted at 37 °C in an isothermal bath.

197

198 *Attachment strength*

199 Between 10 and 20 mussels were randomly selected from each type of aggregation and environmental
200 condition to measure the attachment strength of individuals. Only non-manipulated individuals were used to
201 measure byssus strength, because the byssal filaments are interconnected among the individuals in
202 aggregations and the filaments of mussels adjacent to those dislodged during the measurements may be
203 weakened.

204 Mussel detachment force was measured in immersion conditions to prevent modification of the
205 mechanical properties of byssal filaments exposed to the drying effects of air. Attachment force was measured
206 by connecting the shell to a spring scale (Digital Force Gauge DN431 with peak hold indication, resolution of

0.01 N) fitted to custom-made forceps. The spring scale was pulled perpendicularly (normal) to the substratum until the mussel was dislodged (Babarro & Comeau, 2014). Care was taken to avoid disturbing neighbouring mussels when individual mussels were dislodged. In all cases, selected mussels were attached primarily to the PVC plates.

211

212 *Statistical analysis*

213 Changes in shell thickness, compressive force, organic matter content of shells and byssus detachment
214 strength were analysed separately for each species by analysis of variance (ANOVA) models including three
215 orthogonal fixed factors: pH (two levels: 7.65 and 8.0), Temperature (Temp, two levels: 16 °C and 21 °C) and
216 Aggregation (Agg, two levels: monospecific and mixed). Tank was a random factor nested in the pH x
217 Temperature interaction. However, because the tank factor was not significant ($p > 0.25$, data not shown),
218 tanks were pooled in all subsequent analyses (Underwood, 1997). After exposure of mussels to different
219 environmental conditions, changes in shell weight due to chemical and mechanical stress were analysed
220 separately for each species by an ANOVA including two orthogonal fixed factors: pH and temperature.

221 Normality and homogeneity of variances were tested by Shapiro-Wilk's W and Levene tests, respectively.
222 For heterogeneous data, the analyses were conducted on untransformed data, and p-values for the F ratios
223 were considered significant at $p < 0.01$ (Underwood, 1997). Homogeneous groups were established *a posteriori*
224 with the Bonferroni adjusted level for distinct sample sizes in multiple comparisons. All values shown in the
225 figures are means $\pm$ SD. All analyses were performed with STATISTICA 7.0 software (Tulsa, OK 74104 USA).

226

227

228 **Results**

229 *Shell characteristics: thickness, compressive force and organic content*

230 Neither pH nor temperature had significant effects on shell thickness, which only differed between the
231 two mussel species (Table 2). Shells of *M. galloprovincialis* were thicker ($0.83 \text{ mm} \pm 0.05$, [0.77, 0.90];
232 $p < 0.001$) than those of *X. securis* ($0.52 \text{ mm} \pm 0.03$, [0.46, 0.57]), irrespective of the aggregation considered
233 (data not shown).

234 In general, shells of *M. galloprovincialis* were stronger ($146.81 \text{ N} \pm 14.86$, [130, 170]; $p < 0.001$) than
235 those of *X. securis* ($85.28 \text{ N} \pm 11.14$, [71, 104]) due to differences in thickness (Figures 1A-D). The
236 compressive strength of shells varied between aggregations in the case of the invasive species (Table 2;
237 Figures 1C-D). The compressive strength of *X. securis* shells tended to increase, although marginally, when
238 mussels were reared at higher temperature, but only in mixed aggregations (i.e. Temp x Agg; Table 2;
239 Figure 1C-D).

240 The organic content of shells varied between the two mussel species, with higher values for *X. securis*
241 (6.64 ± 0.65 %) than for *M. galloprovincialis* (3.72 ± 1.05 %; Figure 2A-D). The organic content of shells of
242 *M. galloprovincialis* reared at higher temperature increased, but only in the individuals in mixed
243 aggregations (Temp x Agg; $p < 0.05$; Table 3; Figure 2A-B). Moreover, the organic content of *M.*
244 *galloprovincialis* shells decreased when the mussels were reared under acidic conditions at high
245 temperature (pH x Temp; $p < 0.05$; Table 3; Figure 2A-B). In the case of *X. securis*, an increase was observed
246 in the organic content of shells of mussels exposed to ambient (control) pH conditions, although only in
247 mixed aggregations (pH x Agg; $p < 0.05$; Table 3; Figure 2C-D).

248

249 *Shell resistance*

250 Exposure to EDTA (0.06 M) caused greater loss of shell weight (range 14-20%) than the other stress factors
251 such as abrasion (3-5%) and exposure to HCl and protease (< 1%) (Figures 3 A-H). Specifically, EDTA caused the
252 greatest weight loss in shells of *M. galloprovincialis* previously exposed to conditions of low pH and
253 temperature (pH x Temp; $p < 0.05$; Table 4; Figure 3A). No effect of the environmental parameters was
254 observed in *X. securis* shells treated with EDTA (0.06 M). Weight loss in *X. securis* shells treated with HCl (pH 4)
255 was noted for both the low pH and low temperature treatment levels, independently (Table 4; Figure 3D). By
256 contrast, these environmental parameters did not affect *M. galloprovincialis* shells (Table 4; Figure 3C).
257 Exposure to protease caused greater weight loss in shells of the invasive species exposed to higher
258 temperature (Table 4; Figure 3F), but no effect of environmental parameters was observed for *M.*
259 *galloprovincialis* shells (Figure 3E). Abrasion had a significant impact on shells of the invasive species, which
260 lost more weight when the mussels were previously exposed to low temperature (Table 4; Figure 3H).
261 Abrasion caused greater loss of weight of *M. galloprovincialis* shells previously exposed to low pH (Table 4;
262 Figure 3G).

263

264 *Byssus attachment strength*

265 Environmental conditions affected byssus attachment strength, although this varied depending on the
266 mussel species considered and type of aggregation (Table 5; Figure 4A-D). The attachment strength of *M.*
267 *galloprovincialis* decreased when mussels were reared at low pH and temperature (i.e. significant
268 interaction pH x Temp; $p < 0.01$; Table 5; Figure 4A-B). The attachment strength of the invasive *X. securis*
269 increased significantly when mussels were exposed to low pH, irrespective of temperature, but only in the
270 mixed aggregations (pH x Agg; $p < 0.01$; Table 5; Figure 4C-D).

271

272

Discussion

The study findings demonstrated that pH and temperature significantly affect the response variables considered, with the exception of shell thickness. They also showed interactive effects of both factors in several cases, as reported in other studies on shelled bivalves (Kroeker et al., 2013; Li et al., 2015). The responses also varied significantly in relation to species and aggregation, highlighting the importance of species interactions in shaping responses to environmental changes (Fabricius et al., 2011; Hale et al., 2011; Gestoso et al. 2015; 2016). In general, the invasive species *X. securis* performed better under acidic conditions than the indigenous mussel, as indicated by the responses of several parameters (shell strength, organic content of shell and byssus strength). Although shell thickness was not affected by the environmental conditions, the variation in compressive strength and organic content of shells indicate that *X. securis* is more resistant than *M. galloprovincialis* to environmental change. Although marginal, changes in shell compressive force occurred at high temperature, with opposing trends in *M. galloprovincialis* and *X. securis*. On the other hand, a significant decrease in the organic content of the *M. galloprovincialis* shells occurred under conditions of low pH and high temperature, but not for the invasive *X. securis*.

Intertidal organisms adapt to wide variations in environmental factors on a daily basis, e.g. frequent emersion processes and internal acidosis, which they cope with by having a compensatory mechanism to maintain homeostasis (Chaparro et al., 2009). This can make individuals more resistant to environmental stressors such as acidification and increased temperature (Scanes et al., 2017). The study findings indicate that the invasive *X. securis* is more resistant than *M. galloprovincialis*. We expected that *X. securis*, a gaping species, would be energetically more efficient (i.e. with less oxygen debt after re-immersion) and better prepared to cope with additional stressors. Indeed, previous studies on these species have indicated better physiological performance of the invasive species under environmentally stressful conditions (Gestoso et al., 2016; Olabarria et al., 2016). The environmental conditions of the original habitats where mussels were collected e.g. past history of both species may be important in shaping the responses of protective structures to environmental conditions tested in this study. For example, elevated temperature (up to 25°C) enhanced the negative effect of acidification on biomineralization and metabolism of *M. edulis* (Li et al., 2015), although the *M. galloprovincialis* shells were thicker under conditions of moderate warming (20°C), irrespective of CO₂ levels (7.69-8.06) (Koeker et al., 2014). The mechanical properties of aragonite-type and calcite-type shells, of respectively *Mercenaria mercenaria* and *Crassostrea virginica*, showed no impact of moderate hypercapnia (~800 µatm pCO₂) in mussels acclimated at 22 °C (Ivanina et al., 2013). However, other surveys did not show any negative effects of acidification on biomineralization processes neither on shell functioning, i.e. the capacity to maintain crystallographic orientation and structural integrity, despite species-specific responses of bivalves (Gazeau et al., 2007; Ries et al., 2009) and the fact that some organisms are still able to secrete shell under very low pH conditions (Hiebenthal et al., 2013; Gazeau et al., 2013). In *M. edulis*, the shells may dissolve at pH 7.5 or lower (Gazeau et al., 2007; Michaelidis et al., 2005), i.e. under more intense acidification

308 than tested here. Mussels seem to tolerate pH fluctuations and even a decrease in the aragonite saturation
309 state within a wider range of temperatures that they naturally experience in the field (Kroeker et al., 2014). In
310 the present study, the mesocosm system was not undersaturated with respect to calcite or aragonite, which
311 may explain why the composition of the shells remained unaltered (see also Range et al., 2012; Gestoso et al.,
312 2016). The positive (although marginal) effect of temperature on shell strength in the invasive species may be
313 partly due to the upper thermal tolerance of mussels, i.e. above 25°C (Kimura & Sekiguchi, 2009), which is still
314 very different from that tested in our experiment. Exposure of *X. securis* to elevated temperature improved
315 shell strength rather than exacerbating any negative effects of acidification, which is consistent with previous
316 findings in *M. edulis* (Li et al., 2015). The fact that differences in shell strength were not accompanied by
317 changes in shell thickness suggests that other factors may play a role in the response of this protective
318 structure. For example, the crystallographic orientation of the mineral units that form part of the shell
319 corresponds to changes in temperature; in addition, other micro-structural changes such as size and
320 elongation of prismatic structural units have been positively correlated with seawater temperature (Milano et
321 al., 2017).

322 The high organic content of *X. securis* shells is probably a key factor influencing the greater capacity of this
323 species to withstand environmental stress because the organic content plays a major role in protecting shells
324 from acidification (see Ries et al., 2009). Interestingly, the organic content of the *M. galloprovincialis* shells
325 decreased under acidic and warmer conditions. By contrast, the *X. securis* shells were not affected by these
326 conditions and even showed an increase in organic content when present in mixed aggregations at ambient
327 pH. However, *X. securis* shells with a higher organic content also underwent greater weight loss after the
328 simulated predatory attacks. Ocean acidification may have a greater impact on shell dissolution than on shell
329 deposition (Nienhuis et al., 2010) and, consequently, lower pH may explain significant changes in shell weight.
330 Low pH (7.8) has been reported to significantly affect the organic matrix and biomineralization rates in *M.*
331 *edulis* (Li et al., 2015). Indeed, acidification exacerbated the weight loss of shells subjected to simulated
332 predatory attacks, with *X. securis* suffering the greatest weight loss, especially at low pH (hydrochloric acid)
333 but also after simulated predation (protease) at higher temperature. Aragonite-type shells are thought to be
334 more susceptible to dissolution, mainly at low temperature (Mackenzie et al., 2014).

335 Environmental conditions also affected byssus attachment strength, although the responses of the two
336 species varied greatly. Acidification reduces byssus strength in *M. galloprovincialis* within the predicted range
337 of climate change projections and the effect was not exacerbated by high temperature. This indicated that
338 byssal attachment was not more susceptible to seawater acidification at higher temperature. Similar
339 responses were obtained when shell breaking force of *M. edulis* was analysed after exposure of mussels to
340 acidic and warming conditions (Li et al., 2015), and therefore warming may offset the negative effect of
341 acidification on byssus strength (see also Kroeker et al., 2014). Negative impacts of acidic conditions on mussel
342 attachment strength due to an increase in the decay of number of threads and a decrease in mechanical

performance have also been reported for different mytilids (O'Donnell et al., 2013; Sui et al., 2015; Zhao et al., 2017). *Mytilus galloprovincialis* reared under low pH and high temperature, but still within optimal thermal window, will probably display greater physiological activity, including byssogenesis rate, with a positive impact on attachment strength. Similar buffer or compensatory mechanisms of elevated temperature within predicted increasing $p\text{CO}_2$ conditions have been reported for material properties of mussel shells (Fitzer et al., 2017). Mussels may compensate for the weakened byssal threads secreted at low pH by up-regulating expression of some byssal proteins (Zhao et al., 2017), and increased temperature may have played a role in this aspect. The invasive mussel showed the opposite trend, with an increase in byssus attachment strength under acidification, although the effect was only significant in mixed aggregations, thus highlighting the need to consider multiple-species interactions in more detailed analyses. A lack of any effect of acidification on byssus secretion has also been reported for the oyster *Pinctada fucata* (Welladsen et al., 2010). The lack of effect of low pH on mussel attachment strength may be partly due to the large number of byssal threads secreted by *X. securis*, i.e. up to 1000 filaments (Babarro & Lassudrie 2011) compared to the 20-50 filaments secreted by *M. galloprovincialis*. Even if low pH had a negative impact on the performance and/or number of byssal threads, the invasive species still secretes a very large number of threads that could compensate for potential negative impacts of acidification.

Species interactions played a role in the responses of mussels to environmental conditions in relation to the byssus and shell strength and the organic matter content of shells. Previous studies have indicated that the negative effects of environmental conditions can be ameliorated by interactions between species (Hale et al., 2011; Jurgens & Gaylord, 2016; Olabarria et al., 2016), which suggest that responses of species are not simply additive and the dynamics of the combinations are not linear (Walther, 2010). Here, we found that mussels in mixed aggregations performed better in relation to shell strength (specifically for *X. securis* at high temperature) and byssus attachment strength (for *X. securis* at low pH). However, the opposite was also noted for the organic content of shells in mussels from mixed assemblages. Therefore, our findings showed that interspecific interactions may have an important effect on the magnitude of the impact of environmental stressors on mussel responses and complement the findings of Gesoso et al. (2016) in other mussel responses, such as survivorship, growth, condition index and shell composition. Indeed species interactions often determine responses to environmental stressors and patterns of recovery from disturbances (Montoya & Raffaelli, 2010). Interactions between new species assemblages resulting from invasion by exotic species are of special interest, as novel species interactions may become increasingly decoupled (Hughes, 2012) and changes in these relationships may alter community structure and composition (Angert et al., 2013).

In conclusion, acidification and warming had interactive effects on the mussel-related parameters considered, with a greater impact on the byssus attachment strength. This reveals that other biological structures rather than shell can be more vulnerable to changes in pH and temperature at least under short-term, acute stress. Results also indicated that both species responded differently to environmental stressors,

with *X. securis* appearing to be the most resistant. *Mytilus galloprovincialis* may be at a disadvantage relative to the invasive *X. securis* because weakened byssal attachment may represent a challenge for this species, especially in suspended-culture mussel farms. However, despite the better performance of the shell and byssus structures of *X. securis*, this species may be more vulnerable to attack by predatory drilling species. Overall, the most significant losses in shell weight were observed for the invasive *X. securis* previously exposed to low pH and warming seawater conditions and then treated with acid (HCl) and protease stressors, respectively. The impact of abiotic and biotic stressors and their potential interactions within multiple-species assemblages must be addressed in future studies in order to improve our understanding of the impact of climate change on marine ecosystems (see Queirós et al. 2015). The findings of the present study confirm that the impact of climate change is complex and influenced by species-specific interactions, making it necessary to consider different response variables in order to analyse future effects on the structure and functioning of mussel communities.

Acknowledgements. This study was funded by the Spanish government through the Ministerio de Economía y Competitividad (projects AGL2013-45945-R and CTM2016-76146-C3-2-R) and the Autonomic government Xunta de Galicia-FEDER (project GRC2013-004).

References

- Addadi, L., D. Joester, F. Nudelman & S. Weiner, 2006. Mollusk shell formation: a source of new concepts for understanding biomineralization processes. *Chemistry - A European Journal* 12: 980–987.
- Amaral, V., H. N. Cabral & M. J. Bishop, 2012. Effects of estuarine acidification on predator–prey interactions. *Marine Ecology Progress Series* 445: 117–127.
- Angert, A. L., S. L. LaDeau & R. S. Ostfeld, 2013. Climate change and species interactions: ways forward. *Annals of the New York Academy of Sciences* 1297: 1-7. doi: 10.1111/nyas.12286.
- Babarro, J. M. F. & M. J. Abad, 2013. Co-existence of two mytilids in a heterogeneous environment: mortality, growth, and strength of shell and byssus attachment. *Marine Ecology Progress Series* 476: 115–128.
- Babarro, J. M. F. & M. J. Lassudrie, 2011. Ecophysiological responses of invasive and indigenous mytilids in the Ría de Vigo (NW Spain). *Aquatic Living Resources* 24: 303–315.
- Babarro, J. M. F. & L. A. Comeau, 2014. Byssus attachment strength of two mytilids in mono-specific and mixed-species mussel beds, Biofouling: The Journal of Bioadhesion and Biofilm Research 30: 975-985.
- Barbosa, M., J. Pestana & A. M. V. M Soares, 2014. Predation Life History Responses to Increased Temperature Variability. *PLoS ONE* 9(9): e107971. doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0107971.

412 Borthagaray, A. I. & A. Carranza, 2007. Mussels as ecosystem engineers: Their contribution to species richness
 413 in a rocky littoral community. *Acta Oecologica* 31: 243–250.

414 Chaparro, O. R., J. A. Montory, C. J. Segura & J. A. Pechenik, 2009. Effect of reduced pH on shells of brooded
 415 veligers in the estuarine bivalve *Ostrea chilensis* Philippi 1845. *Journal of Experimental Marine Biology and*
 416 *Ecology* 377: 107–112.

417 Dahlhoff, E., B. Buckley & B. Menge, 2001. Physiology of the rocky intertidal predator *Nucella ostrina* along an
 418 environmental stress gradient. *Ecology* 82: 2816–2829.

419 Doney, S. C., V. J. Fabry, R. A. Feely & J. A. Kleypas, 2009. Ocean acidification: the other CO₂ problem. *Annual*
 420 *Review of Marine Science* 1: 169–192.

421 Duarte, C., J. M. Navarro, K. Acuña, R. Torres, P. H. Manríquez, M. A. Lardies, C. A. Vargas, N. A. Lagos & V.
 422 Aguilera, 2014. Combined effects of temperature and ocean acidification on the juvenile individuals of the
 423 mussel *Mytilus chilensis*. *Journal of Sea Research* 85: 308–314.

424 Fabry, V. J., B. A. Seibel, R. A. Feely & J. C. Orr, 2008. Impacts of ocean acidification on marine fauna and
 425 ecosystem processes. *ICES Journal of Marine Science* 65: 414–432.

426 Fernández-Reiriz, M. J., P. Range, X. A. Álvarez-Salgado, J. Espinosa & U. Labarta, 2012. Tolerance of juvenile
 427 *Mytilus galloprovincialis* to experimental seawater acidification. *Marine Ecology Progress Series* 454: 65–74.

428 Fitzer, S. C, L. Vittert, A. Bowman, N. A. Kamenos, V. R. Phoenix & M. Cusack, 2015. Ocean acidification and
 429 temperature increase impact mussel shell shape and thickness: problematic for protection? *Ecology and*
 430 *Evolution* 2015; 5(21): 4875–4884.

431 Fitzer, S. C., W. Zhu, K. E. Tanner, V. R. Phoenix, N. A. Kamenos & M. Cusack, 2017. Ocean acidification alters
 432 the material properties of *Mytilus edulis* shells. *Journal of the Royal Society Interface* 12: 20141227.

433 Fabricius, K. E., C. Langdon, S. Uthicke, C. Humphrey, S. Noonan, G. De’ath, R. Okazaki, N. Muehllehner, M. S.
 434 Glas & J. M. Lough, 2011. Losers and winners in coral reefs acclimatized to elevated carbon dioxide
 435 concentrations. *Nature Climate Change* 1: 165–169.

436 Gabriel, J. M., 1981. Differing resistance of various mollusc shell materials to simulated whelk attack. *Journal of*
 437 *Zoology* 194, 363–369.

438 Gazeau, F., C. Quiblier, J. M. Jansen, J.-P. Gattuso, J. J. Middleburg & C. H. R. Heip, 2007. Impact of elevated
 439 CO₂ on shellfish calcification. *Geophysical Research Letters* 34: L07603. doi:10.1029/2006GL028554.

440 Gazeau, F., L. M. Parker, S. Comeau, J.-P. Gattuso, W. A. O’Connor, S. Martin, H.-O. Pörtner & P. M. Ross, 2013.
 441 Impacts of ocean acidification on marine shelled molluscs. *Marine Biology* 160: 2207–2245.

442 Gestoso, I., C. Olabarria & F. Arenas, 2012. The invasive mussel *Xenostrobus securis* along the Galician Rias
 443 Baixas (NW of Spain): status of invasion. *Cahiers de Biologie Marine* 53: 391–396.

444 Gestoso I, F. Arenas & C. Olabarria, 2015. Feeding behaviour of an intertidal snail: Does past environmental
 445 stress affect predator choices and prey vulnerability? *Journal of Sea Research* 97: 66–74.

446 Gestoso, I., C. Olabarria & F. Arenas, 2016. Ecological interactions modulate responses of two intertidal mussel
 447 species to changes in temperature and pH. *Journal of Experimental Marine Biology and Ecology* 474: 116–
 448 125.

449 Hale, R., P. Calosi, L. McNeill, N. Mieszkowska & S. Widdicombe, 2011. Predicted levels of future ocean
 450 acidification and temperature rise could alter community structure and biodiversity in marine benthic
 451 communities. *Oikos* 120: 661–674.

452 Harrington, M. J. & J. H. Waite, 2007. Holdfast heroics: comparing the molecular and mechanical properties of
 453 *Mytilus californianus* byssal threads. *Journal of Experimental Biology* 210: 4307–4318.

454 Hiebenthal, C., E. E. R. Philipp, A. Eisenhauer & M. Wahl, 2013. Effects of seawater pCO₂ and temperature on
 455 shell growth, shell stability, condition and cellular stress of Western Baltic Sea *Mytilus edulis* (L.) and *Arctica*
 456 *islandica* (L.). *Marine Biology* 160: 2073–2087.

457 Hughes, L., 2012. Climate Change Impacts on Species Interactions: Assessing the Threat of Cascading
 458 Extinctions. Chapter 18 In: *Saving a million species. Extinction risk from climate change*. Ed. Hannah L.
 459 Copyright © 2012 Island Press. Washington, DC 20009.

460 IPCC, 2013. Climate change 2013. The Physical Science Basis. Summary for Policymakers. Intergovernmental
 461 Panel on Climate Change. Cambridge University Press.

462 Ivanina, A. V., G. H. Dickinson, O. B. Matoo, R. Bagwe, A. Dickinson, E. Beniash & I. M. Sokolova, 2013.
 463 Interactive effects of elevated temperature and CO₂ levels on energy metabolism and biomineralization of
 464 marine bivalves *Crassostrea virginica* and *Mercenaria mercenaria*. *Comparative Biochemistry and*
 465 *Physiology, Part A* 166: 101–111.

466 Jurgens, L. J. & B. Gaylord, 2016. Edge effects reverse facilitation by a widespread foundation species. *Scientific*
 467 *Reports* 6: 37573.

468 Kimura, T. & H. Sekiguchi, 2009. Spatial and temporal patterns of abundance of the exotic mytilid *Xenostrobus*
 469 *securis* and the native mytilid *Musculista senhousia* in the Lake Hamana, Japan. *Marine Biodiversity*
 470 *Records* 2, e89, <http://dx.doi.org/10.1017/S175526720900102X>.

471 Kroeker, K. J., F. Micheli, M. C. Gambi, T. R. Martz, 2011. Divergent ecosystem responses within a benthic
 472 marine community to ocean acidification. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United*
 473 *States of America* 108: 14515–14520.

474 Kroeker, K. J., R. L. Kordas, R. Crim, I. E. Hendriks, L. Ramajo, G. S. Singh, C. M. Duarte & J-P. Gattuso, 2013.
 475 Impacts of ocean acidification on marine organisms: quantifying sensitivities and interaction with warming.
 476 *Global Change Biology* 19: 1884–1896. doi: 10.1111/gcb.12179.

477 Kroeker K. J., B. Gaylord, T. M. Hill, J. D. Hofelt, S. H. Miller & E. Sanford, 2014. The role of temperature in
 478 determining species' vulnerability to ocean acidification: a case study using *Mytilus galloprovincialis*. *Plos*
 479 *One* 9 (7): e100353.

Li, S., C. Liu, J. Huang, Y. Liu, G. Zheng, L. Xie & R. Zhang, 2015. Interactive effects of seawater acidification and elevated temperature on biomineralization and amino acid metabolism in the mussel *Mytilus edulis*. *Journal of Experimental Biology* 218: 3623-3631.

Mackenzie, C. L., G. A. Ormondroyd, S. F. Curling, R. J. Ball, N. M. Whiteley & S. K. Malham, 2014. Ocean warming, more than acidification, reduces shell strength in a commercial shellfish species during food limitation. *PLoS One* 9, e86764.

Marin, F., G. Luquet, B. Marie & D. Medakovic, 2008. Molluscan shell proteins: primary structure, origin, and evolution. *Current Topics in Developmental Biology* 80: 209-276.

Meehl, G. A., T. F. Stocker, W. D. Collins, P. Friedlingstein, A. T. Gaye, J. M. Gregory, et al., 2007. Global climate projections. In: Solomon, S., Qin, D., Manning, M., Chen, Z., Marquis, M., Averyt, K.B., et al. (Eds.), *Climate Change 2007: The Physical Science Basis. Contribution of Working Group I to the Fourth Assessment Report of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change*. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge.

Michaelidis, B., C. Ouzounis, A. Paleras & H. O. Pörtner, 2005. Effects of long-term moderate hypercapnia on acid–base balance and growth rate in marine mussels. *Marine Ecology Progress Series* 293: 109–118.

Milano, S., G. Nehrke, A. D. Wanamaker Jr, I. Ballesta-Artero, T. Brey & B. R. Schöne, 2017. The effects of environment on *Arctica islandica* shell formation and architecture. *Biogeosciences* 14: 1577–1591.

Montoya, J. M. & D. Raffaelli, 2010. Climate change, biotic interactions and ecosystem services. *Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences* 365: 2013–2018. doi: 10.1098/rstb.2010.0114.

Morse, J.W., A. Mucci & F.J. Millero, 1980. The solubility of calcite and aragonite in seawater of 35‰ salinity at 25 °C and atmospheric pressure. *Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta* 44, 85–94.

Morton, B., 2008. Attack responses of the southern Australian whelk, *Lepsiella vinosa* (Lamarck, 1822) (Gastropoda: Muricidae), to novel bivalve prey: an experimental approach. *Biological Invasions* 10, 1265–1275.

Nienhuis, S., A. R. Palmer & C. D. G. Harley, 2010. Elevated CO₂ affects shell dissolution rate but not calcification rate in a marine snail. *Proceedings of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences* 277 (1693): 2553–2558.

O'Donnell, M. J., M. N. George & E. Carrington, 2013. Mussel byssus attachment weakened by ocean acidification. *Nature Climate Change* 3: 587e590.

Olabarria, C, I. Gestoso, F. P. Lima, E. Vázquez, L. A. Comeau, F. Gomes, R. Seabra & J. M. F. Babarro, 2016. Response of two mytilids to a heatwave: the complex interplay of physiology, behaviour and ecological interactions. *PLOS ONE* 11(10): e0164330. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0164330.

Pilson, M.E., 2013. *An Introduction to the Chemistry of the Sea*. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, UK.

Pörtner, H. O., 2008. Ecosystem effects of ocean acidification in times of ocean warming: a physiologist's view. *Marine Ecology Progress Series* 373: 203–217.

Pörtner, H. O. & A. P. Farrel, 2008. Physiology and climate change. *Science* 322: 690–692.

515 Pörtner, H. O., M. Langenbuch & B. Michaelidis, 2005. Synergistic effects of temperature extremes, hypoxia,
 516 and increases in CO₂ on marine animals: from Earth history to global change. *Journal of Geophysical*
 517 *Research* 110: 1–15.

518 Queirós, A. M., J. A. Fernandes, S. Faulwetter, J. Nunes, A. P. S. Rastrick, N. Mieszkowska, Y. Artioli, A. Yool, P.
 519 Calosi, C. Arvanitidis, H. S. Findlay, M. Barange, W. W. L. Cheung & S. Widdicombe, 2015. Scaling up
 520 experimental ocean acidification and warming research: from individuals to the ecosystem. *Global Change*
 521 *Biology* 21: 130–143. doi: 10.1111/gcb.12675.

522 Range, P., D. Piló, R. Ben-Hamadou, M. A. Chícharo, D. Matias, S. Joaquim, A. P. Oliveira & L. Chícharo, 2012.
 523 Seawater acidification by CO₂ in a coastal lagoon environment: effects on life history traits of juvenile
 524 mussels *Mytilus galloprovincialis*. *Journal of Experimental Marine Biology and Ecology* 424–425: 89–98.

525 Range, P., M. A. Chícharo, R. Ben-Hamadou, D. Piló, M. J. Fernández-Reiriz, U. Labarta, M. G. Marin, M.
 526 Bressan, V. Matozzo, A. Chinellato, M. Munari, E. T. El Menif, M. Dellali & L. Chícharo, 2014. Impacts of
 527 CO₂-induced seawater acidification on coastal Mediterranean bivalves and interactions with other climatic
 528 stressors. *Regional Environmental Change* 14 (Suppl 1): S19–S30. doi 10.1007/s10113-013-0478-7.

529 Raven, J. K. Caldeira, H. Elderfield, O. Hoegh-Guldberg, P. S. Liss, U. Riebesell, J. Sheperd, C. Turley & A.
 530 Watson, 2005. Ocean Acidification due to Increasing Atmospheric Carbon Dioxide. Royal Society Policy
 531 Document. 57 pp.

532 Ries, J. B., A. L. Cohen & D. C. McCorkle, 2009. Marine calcifiers exhibit mixed responses to CO₂-induced ocean
 533 acidification. *Geology* 37: 1131–1134.

534 Scanes E., L. M. Parker, W. A. O'Connor, L. S. Stapp & P. M. Ross, 2017. Intertidal oysters reach their
 535 physiological limit in a future high-CO₂ world. *Journal of Experimental Biology* 220: 765–774.

536 Sui, Y., M. Hu, X. Huang, Y. Wang & W. Lu, 2015. Anti-predatory responses of the thick shell mussel *Mytilus*
 537 *coruscus* exposed to seawater acidification and hypoxia. *Marine Environmental Research* 109: 159–167.

538 Underwood, A.J., 1997. Experiments in Ecology. Their Logical Design and Interpretation Using Analysis of
 539 Variance. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, UK.

540 Waite, J. H., 2002. Adhesion à la Moule. *Integrative and Comparative Biology* 42: 1172–1180.

541 Walther, G.-R., 2010 Community and ecosystem responses to recent climate change. *Philosophical*
 542 *Transactions of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences* 365: 2019–2024. doi:10.1098/rstb.2010.0021.

543 Welladsen, H.M., P. C. Southgate & K. Heimann, 2010. The effects of exposure to near-future levels of ocean
 544 acidification on shell characteristics of *Pinctada fucata* (Bivalvia: Pteriidae). *Molluscan Research* 30(3): 125–
 545 130.

546 Zeebe, R.E., & D. Wolf-Gladrow, 2001. CO₂ in Seawater: Equilibrium, Kinetics, Isotopes. Elsevier Oceanography
 547 Series, Amsterdam.

548 Zhao, X., C. Guo, Y. Han, Z. Che, Y. Wang, X. Wang, X. Chai, H. Wu & G. Liu, 2017. Ocean acidification decreases
 549 mussel byssal attachment strength and induces molecular byssal responses. Marine Ecology Progress Series
 550 565: 67-77.

551
 552
 553
 554

Table 1. Mean ($\pm$ SD) values of carbonate chemistry variables in seawater for each treatment during the mesocosm experiment.

Treatment combination		pH n=42	Temperature n=42	Salinity n=18	DIC ($\mu\text{mol C kg}^{-1}$) n=12	pCO ₂ (ppm) n=12	TA ($\mu\text{mol kg}^{-1}$) n=12	ΩCa n=12	ΩAra n=12
pH 8	16 °C	7.98 $\pm$ 0.01	16.04 $\pm$ 0.01	36.42 $\pm$ 0.08	1850.54 $\pm$ 6.19	566.12 $\pm$ 4.64	1979.75 $\pm$ 15.78	3.00 $\pm$ 0.03	1.88 $\pm$ 0.02
pH 8	21 °C	8.01 $\pm$ 0.01	20.67 $\pm$ 0.02	36.42 $\pm$ 0.06	1769.74 $\pm$ 6.79	543.21 $\pm$ 4.49	2100.35 $\pm$ 19.82	4.07 $\pm$ 0.05	2.54 $\pm$ 0.03
pH 7.65	16 °C	7.62 $\pm$ 0.05	16.46 $\pm$ 0.03	36.14 $\pm$ 0.02	2009.27 $\pm$ 100.80	1371.33 $\pm$ 15.20	2160.18 $\pm$ 24.82	1.73 $\pm$ 0.02	1.09 $\pm$ 0.01
pH 7.65	21 °C	7.63 $\pm$ 0.07	21.36 $\pm$ 0.01	36.46 $\pm$ 0.04	1876.00 $\pm$ 75.86	1319.81 $\pm$ 23.17	2077.76 $\pm$ 19.63	2.04 $\pm$ 0.03	1.27 $\pm$ 0.02

555
 556

Table 2. Three-way ANOVAs to determine the effect of pH, temperature (Temp) and aggregation (Agg) on shell thickness and compressive force values of the mussel shells. See main text (Materials and Methods) for specific details of each factor. Shell thickness and compressive force were untransformed prior to the analyses (see main text). Marginal differences are indicated with the symbol +.

<i>M. galloprovincialis</i>		shell thickness			shell compressive force	
Source of variation		df	F	p	F	p
	pH	1	0.341	0.563	1.175	0.286
	Temp	1	0.006	0.939	0.284	0.597
	Agg	1	1.134	0.294	0.678	0.416
	pH x Temp	1	0.012	0.912	4.101	0.050
	pH x Agg	1	0.799	0.377	0.563	0.458
	Temp x Agg	1	1.930	0.173	4.697	0.037
	pH x Temp x Agg	1	0.942	0.338	0.035	0.852
	Error	36				
<i>X. securis</i>		shell thickness			shell compressive force	
Source of variation		df	F	p	F	p
	pH	1	0.001	0.971	0.038	0.847
	Temp	1	1.116	0.298	0.631	0.432
	Agg	1	0.032	0.859	9.170	0.004
	pH x Temp	1	0.461	0.501	2.367	0.133
	pH x Agg	1	0.127	0.723	0.447	0.508
	Temp x Agg	1	0.789	0.380	6.949	0.011 ⁺
	pH x Temp x Agg	1	0.446	0.508	0.429	0.517
	Error	36				

557
 558

Table 3. Three-way ANOVAs to determine the effect of pH, temperature (Temp) and aggregation (Agg) on organic matter of the mussel shell. Dependent variable was log-transformed prior to the analyses.

Source of variation	<i>M. galloprovincialis</i>			<i>X. securis</i>	
	df	F	p	F	p
pH	1	4.575	0.038	0.007	0.934
Temp	1	0.194	0.662	0.208	0.651
Agg	1	0.032	0.859	3.935	0.054
pH x Temp	1	5.744	0.021	0.032	0.859
pH x Agg	1	3.136	0.084	5.131	0.028
Temp x Agg	1	5.988	0.019	1.639	0.208
pH x Temp x Agg	1	2.538	0.119	0.258	0.614
Error	40				

Table 4. Two-way ANOVAs to determine the effect of pH and temperature (Temp) on weight loss values (%) in shells of mussels from mixed aggregations after exposure to distinct chemical and mechanical actions. See main text (Materials and Methods) for specific details. All response variables were log-transformed prior to the analyses.

<i>M. galloprovincialis</i>				EDTA		HCl		protease		abrasion	
Source of variation	df	F	p	F	p	F	p	F	p		
pH	1	0.006	0.942	0.068	0.798	0.179	0.680	7.213	0.020		
Temp	1	0.091	0.768	3.355	0.092	1.620	0.227	0.214	0.652		
pH x Temp	1	6.377	0.027	0.926	0.355	1.098	0.315	1.345	0.269		
Error	12										
<i>X. securis</i>				EDTA		HCl		protease		abrasion	
Source of variation	df	F	p	F	p	F	p	F	p		
pH	1	1.346	0.268	7.721	0.017	0.001	0.970	3.739	0.077		
Temp	1	1.370	0.265	7.879	0.016	7.370	0.019	10.371	0.007		
pH x Temp	1	2.971	0.110	3.358	0.092	1.083	0.318	2.803	0.120		
Error	12										

571

Table 5. Three-way ANOVAs to determine the effect of pH, temperature (Temp) and aggregation (Agg) on byssus attachment force of mussels. See main text (Materials and Methods) for specific details of each factor. Byssus attachment forces were untransformed prior to the analyses (see main text).

Source of variation	<i>M. galloprovincialis</i>			<i>X. securis</i>		
	df	F	p	df	F	p
pH	1	5.702	0.019	1	1.484	0.226
Temp	1	0.857	0.357	1	2.268	0.135
Agg	1	0.395	0.531	1	3.658	0.059
pH x Temp	1	9.593	0.003	1	0.009	0.925
pH x Agg	1	0.310	0.579	1	6.937	0.009
Temp x Agg	1	1.611	0.207	1	2.098	0.151
pH x Temp x Agg	1	3.656	0.059	1	0.063	0.802
Error	99			97		

572

573

574

575

576

577

578

579

580

581

582

583

584

585

586

587

588

589

590

591
592
593
594
595
596
597
598
599
600
601
602
603
604
605
606
607
608
609
610
611
612
613

Figure legends.

Figure 1. Shell compressive strength of *M. galloprovincialis* (A and B) and *X. securis* (C and D) shells after being exposed to different pH and temperature conditions. Left (A and C) and right (B and D) letters corresponded to monospecific and mixed aggregations, respectively. Low and high temperatures results are shown with black and white columns (*M. galloprovincialis*) and horizontal and vertical degraded columns (*X. securis*), respectively. Values correspond to means ($\pm$ SD).

Figure 2. Organic content of the shells of *M. galloprovincialis* (A and B) and *X. securis* (C and D) exposed to different pH and temperature conditions. For different letters (aggregations) and column colour and style (temperature), see Figure 1 legend. Values correspond to means ($\pm$ SD).

Figure 3. Shell weight loss (%) in mussels exposed previously to different pH and temperature conditions and treated with several chemical and mechanical stressors simulating attack by dogwhelks (A-B: EDTA 0.06M; C-D: HCl pH=4; E-F: Protease; G-H: Abrasion). All shells considered were from mussels in mixed aggregations. Left and right letters corresponded to *M. galloprovincialis* and *X. securis*, respectively. For results for different temperatures, see Figure 1 legend. Values correspond to means ($\pm$ SD).

Figure 4. Byssus attachment strength of *M. galloprovincialis* (A and B) and *X. securis* (C and D) exposed to different pH and temperature conditions. For distinct letters (aggregations) and column colour and style (temperature), see Figure 1 legend. Values correspond to means ($\pm$ SD).

614
615
616
617
618
619
620
621
622
623
624
625
626

Figure 1

627
628
629
630
631
632
633
634
635
636
637
638
639

Figure 2

640

641

642

643

644

645

646

647

648

Figure 3

649
650
651
652
653
654
655
656
657
658
659
660
661
662

Figure 4