Progress in the Control of Bovine Tuberculosis in Spanish Wildlife

Christian Gortazar^{1*}, Joaquín Vicente¹, Mariana Boadella¹, Cristina Ballesteros¹, Ruth C. Galindo¹, Joseba Garrido², Alicia Aranaz³, José de la Fuente^{1,4}

1. IREC (CSIC-UCLM-JCCM), Ronda de Toledo s/n, Ciudad Real 13071, Spain

2. NEIKER-TECNALIA, Inst Vasco Invest & Desarrollo Agrario, Dpt. Anim. Hlth., Bizkaia 48160, Spain

3. Departamento de Patología Animal (Sanidad Animal), Facultad de Veterinaria, Universidad Complutense, 28040 Madrid, Spain

4. Department of Veterinary Pathobiology, Center for Veterinary Health Sciences, Oklahoma State University, Stillwater, OK 74078, USA.

* Corresponding author. Tel: 0034926295450, Fax: 0034926295451. E-mail address: Christian.Gortazar@uclm.es (C. Gortazar).

16 Abstract

17 Despite the compulsory test and slaughter campaigns in cattle, bovine tuberculosis (bTB) is
18 still present in Spain, and the role of wildlife reservoirs is increasingly recognized. We
19 provide an update on recent progress made in bTB control in Spanish wildlife, including
20 aspects of epidemiology, surveillance, host-pathogen interaction and wildlife vaccination.

21 At the high densities and in the particular circumstances of Mediterranean environments, wild
22 ungulates, mainly Eurasian wild boar and red deer, are able to maintain *M. bovis* circulation
23 even in absence of domestic livestock. Infection is widespread among wild ungulates in the
24 south of the country, local infection prevalence being as high as 52% in wild boar and 27% in
25 red deer. Risk factors identified include host genetic susceptibility, abundance, spatial
26 aggregation at feeders and waterholes, scavenging, and social behaviour. An increasing trend
27 of bTB compatible lesions was reported among wild boar and red deer inspected between
28 1992 and 2004 in Southwestern Spain. Sporadic cases of badger TB have been detected,
29 further complicating the picture.

30 Gene expression profiles were characterized in European wild boar and Iberian red deer
31 naturally infected with *M. bovis*. The comparative analysis of gene expression profiles in
32 wildlife hosts in response to infection advanced our understanding of the molecular
33 mechanisms of infection and pathogenesis, revealed common and distinctive host responses
34 to infection and identified candidate genes associated with resistance to bTB and for the
35 characterization of host response to infection and vaccination.

36 Ongoing research is producing valuable knowledge on vaccine delivery, safety and efficacy
37 issues. Baits for the oral delivery of BCG vaccine preparations to wild boar piglets were
38 developed and evaluated. The use of selective feeders during the summer was found to be a
39 potentially reliable bait-deployment strategy. Safety experiments yielded no isolation of *M.*

40 *bovis* BCG from faeces, internal organs at necropsy and the environment, even after oral
41 delivery of very high doses. Finally, preliminary vaccination and challenge experiments
42 suggested that a single oral BCG vaccination may protect wild boar from infection by a
43 virulent *M. bovis* field strain.

44 Keywords: *Cervus elaphus*; Disease control; *Meles meles*; *Sus scrofa*; Wildlife epidemiology

45

45 1. Introduction

46 Bovine tuberculosis (bTB), a chronic infectious disease shared between livestock and
 47 wildlife, has a complex epidemiology, often with climate and habitat-mediated peculiarities.
 48 Four potential wildlife bTB reservoirs (as reviewed in EFSA 2009) exist in mainland Spain:
 49 Eurasian wild boar (*Sus scrofa*), red deer (*Cervus elaphus*), fallow deer (*Dama dama*) and
 50 Eurasian badger (*Meles meles*). Eurasian badgers are scarce in Mediterranean habitats and
 51 more abundant in Atlantic ones (Revilla and Palomares, 2002), and wild ungulates are
 52 continuously expanding in range and in numbers throughout the whole Peninsula (e.g.
 53 Gortazar et al. 2000, Delibes-Mateos et al. 2009), but are largely absent from the Islands.

54 Spain is a major livestock producer within the European Union. There are about 6,250,000
 55 cattle in 143,000 herds. Since test and slaughter campaigns became compulsory, bTB in cattle
 56 declined significantly from 12% herd prevalence in 1987 to 1.68% in 2008. However, cattle
 57 bTB distribution is not uniform in the country. Island regions are almost bTB free, and most
 58 of the northern Spanish mainland (Atlantic climate region) is also almost bTB free. In
 59 contrast, several regions of central and southern Spain still have high bTB prevalence (Figure
 60 1). In infected regions, bTB is consistently more prevalent among beef cattle and bullfighting
 61 cattle, which often share wildlife habitats, than among the generally fenced dairy cattle
 62 (<http://rasve.mapa.es//Publica/Sanidad/documentos/INFORME%20FINAL%20TÉCNICO%20TB%202008.pdf>).
 63

64 Moreover, bTB is also present among goat and pig livestock, although information on
 65 prevalence is lacking. About 2,500,000 pigs are raised in open air systems. Most belong to
 66 the Iberian pig breed, which is raised in open evergreen oak woodland habitats of the south
 67 western Iberian Peninsula. Contact with domestic ruminants and with wildlife occurs in this
 68 ecosystem, and cases of *M. bovis* infection have been recorded (Gómez-Laguna et al. 2010).
 69 Molecular typing suggests that *M. bovis* strains of pigs may be shared with livestock and

wildlife species (Parra et al. 2005). Regarding goats, current numbers in Spain are around 3,000,000 (<http://www.mapa.es/estadistica/pags/anuario/2008/>). Not only *M. caprae*, but also *M. bovis* strains are identified in goats (Gutiérrez and García-Marín, 1999).

The role of wildlife reservoirs in bTB epidemiology is increasingly recognized, worldwide (EFSA 2009). However, the definition of a wildlife reservoir is somewhat controversial. In a broad sense, a reservoir is defined as one or more epidemiologically connected populations or environments in which the pathogen can be permanently maintained and from which infection is transmitted to the defined target population (Haydon et al. 2002). For being a competent bTB reservoir, any host species must be susceptible, able to transmit the disease, and abundant enough (Corner 2006). In Spain, the wildlife component of this reservoir is composed of one or more sympatric host species, with marked regional differences. Essentially, wild ungulates are responsible for bTB maintenance in Mediterranean regions of continental Spain, and the badger could have some relevance in the more humid Atlantic regions (see below).

Herein, we provide an update on recent progress made in bTB control in Spanish wildlife, including aspects of epidemiology, surveillance, host-pathogen interaction and wildlife vaccination.

87

2. The wildlife factor in bTB epidemiology in Spain

The Iberian Peninsula in the southwestern end of Europe is largely dominated by Mediterranean climate, with mild to cold, dry winters, hot and dry summers, and limited rainfall (usually less than 600 mm per year), which is concentrated in spring and autumn. The northern strip of the Peninsula, from Portugal to the Pyrenees, is characterized by an Atlantic climate, with up to 2000 mm rainfall per year.

94 2.1. Island regions

95 Both Spanish island regions (the Balearic Islands in the Mediterranean and the Canary
96 Islands in the Atlantic) are almost bTB free. This is interesting from a wildlife perspective,
97 since these regions are lacking all four potential wildlife reservoirs. For comparison, bTB was
98 diagnosed among feral black pigs from the Italian Mediterranean island Sicily and the disease
99 still constitutes a problem for livestock in this region (Di Marco et al. 2008).

100

101 2.2. Atlantic Spain

102 It is not known if wildlife represents a significant bTB reservoir in northern Spain. Eurasian
103 badgers, a well known bTB reservoir in Ireland and the UK, are more common and abundant
104 in Atlantic than in Mediterranean habitats in Spain (Revilla and Palomares, 2002), and
105 sporadic cases of *M. bovis* infection have been detected in different Spanish regions, even in
106 the north (Sobrino et al. 2008, A. Balseiro pers. comm.). However, prevalence figures based
107 on large enough sample sizes, which are difficult to obtain in this protected species, are
108 currently lacking. Moreover, recent monitoring data suggests that badger densities are
109 increasing (Sobrino et al. 2009).

110 Very few cases of *M. bovis* infection have been reported among wild ungulates from Atlantic
111 habitats in Spain, despite locally intense sampling. However, the bTB outbreak among red
112 deer and wild boar from the Brotonne forest in France shows that stable situations with a high
113 infection prevalence may well occur in Atlantic habitats (Zanella et al. 2008). One spillover
114 case has been reported in a roe deer (*Capreolus capreolus*, Balseiro et al. 2009).

115 Considering together both the continued reduction of cattle bTB prevalence up to levels close
116 to official eradication, and the nearly absence of wildlife bTB cases detected in Atlantic
117 Spain, the current role of wildlife in bTB epidemiology seems of little relevance in this

region, and eradication among cattle will hopefully be achieved soon. However, sporadic cases diagnosed in Eurasian badgers, along with increasing demographic trends in several potential bTB hosts (Gortazar et al. 2000, Acevedo et al. 2006, Sobrino et al. 2009), indicate that maintaining a targeted surveillance is advisable (see below).

2.3. Mediterranean Spain

In semiarid Mediterranean habitats of central and southern Spain, several wild ungulates contribute to bTB maintenance in a multi-host system (Gortazar et al. 2008). The epidemiologically most relevant wildlife hosts include the Eurasian wild boar (Naranjo et al. 2008a), and two cervids of the subfamily cervinae: the red deer and the fallow deer. Spillover hosts include the red fox (*Vulpes vulpes*; Millán et al. 2008) and the endangered Iberian lynx (*Lynx pardinus*; Peña et al. 2006), among others. Habitat constraints determine that badgers exist only at very low densities in Mediterranean Spain (Revilla and Palomares, 2002).

Bovine TB is widespread among wild ungulates in central and southern Spain (Vicente et al. 2006), local prevalence of culture confirmed infection being as high as 52% in wild boar and 27% in red deer (Gortazar et al. 2008). At the high densities and in the particular circumstances of Mediterranean environments, Eurasian wild boar and red deer are able to maintain *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* complex (MTBC) circulation in the absence of domestic livestock, for instance in fenced estates (Figure 2, panel a) and protected natural areas with no domestic ruminants (Gortazar et al. 2005). Red deer alone and wild boar alone maintain bTB circulation in the absence of other wildlife hosts (Vicente et al. 2006). The situation is worst among farm-like hunting enclosures called “cercones”, where virtually all wild boar become infected (Acevedo et al. 2007). The reservoir role of fallow deer has been less studied, but is possibly relevant at a local scale (Aranaz et al. 2004, Gortazar et al. 2008,

142 Jaroso et al. unpublished data). Table 1 displays relevant facts about these three host species
143 in Mediterranean habitats.

144 Individual risk factors for *M. bovis* infection in wild ungulates include the host species, wild
145 boar consistently showing higher *M. bovis* infection prevalence than deer (Vicente et al.
146 2006, 2007b, Gortazar et al. 2008), and red deer showing higher prevalence than fallow deer
147 (Gortazar et al. 2008); sex in red and fallow deer (males more prevalent, Vicente et al. 2006,
148 Gortazar et al. 2008); age in deer and in wild boar (age-increasing trends; Vicente et al. 2006,
149 Gortazar et al. 2008); and host genetic susceptibility (e.g. Acevedo-Whitehouse et al. 2005
150 and Naranjo et al. 2008a in wild boar, Fernández-de-Mera et al. 2009b, in red deer).

151 In multi-host systems such as those occurring in Mediterranean Spain, the infection levels of
152 sympatric host species do also contribute to the risk factors for a given one (e.g. wild boar on
153 red deer and vice versa; Vicente et al. 2007b). Belonging to an *M. bovis*-infected social group
154 is a significant risk factor for infection in red deer and wild boar, but not for fallow deer
155 (Gortazar et al. submitted).

156 Environmental risk factors are often, but not always, linked to artificial management of
157 wildlife habitats and wildlife populations in high-wire fenced estates (Vicente et al. 2007a,
158 2007b). Fencing (Figure 2, panel a) can affect bTB epidemiology through a reduced host
159 genetic variability. Using microsatellite markers, Acevedo-Whitehouse et al. (2005) found
160 that genetic variability, fencing and wild boar abundance had significant effects on bTB
161 infection. The strongest effects were observed for genetic heterozygosity, with relatively less
162 heterozygous wild boar being more likely to be infected. Fencing may increase the chances of
163 mating amongst close relatives, and contribute to a reduced genetic variability and reduced
164 disease resistance. This was also suggested in red deer, where Fernández-de-Mera et al.
165 (2009a, 2009b) showed significant loss in variability of the drb2 MHC-II locus over only 16
166 years in a fenced red deer population.

Moreover, fencing is commonly associated with other well known bTB risk factors such as feeding and translocating (Figure 2, panel c), and in general with wildlife overabundance (Gortazar et al. 2006). Artificial feeding and watering causes spatial aggregation and allows maintaining ungulate densities above the carrying capacity of a given habitat. Disease prevalence has been linked to spatial aggregation and high densities (Acevedo et al. 2007, Vicente et al. 2007a, 2007b). However, high *M. bovis* prevalences are found even in protected areas where no feeding and no translocations of wild ungulates take place, such as the Doñana National Park (DNP, Gortazar et al. 2008), possibly because of the high densities and habitat mediated spatial aggregation occurring in DNP. Aggregation and *M. bovis* transmission may occur more often in certain habitats. For instance hardwood *Quercus* spp. forest availability was associated with increased bTB risk in red deer and wild boar in central Spain (Vicente et al. 2007b). Miller et al. (2003) suggested that woodland areas provide shady, moist conditions under which *M. bovis* might survive longer in the environment.

Finally scavenging, including hunting gut-pile consumption (Figure 2, panel d), is most probably a significant risk factor for wild boar and for carnivores. Infection through consumption of contaminated materials may increase the probability of contacting *M. bovis* (Gortazar et al. 2008). Ongoing research is evidencing that the amount of carrion scavenged by wild boar in Mediterranean Spain compares to that by specialized scavengers (vultures), and even locally this suid becomes the top consumer (unpublished data). Figure 2 suggests that gut-piles may occasionally attract herbivores such as red deer.

The main purpose of controlling bTB in Spanish wildlife is to prevent the infection of the domestic stock, and also humans. In this sense, ongoing research is addressing wildlife-domestic livestock interaction to elucidate shared epidemiology and to identify control measures such as those related to safe husbandry practices. Also, large scale studies on spatiotemporal incidence patterns of bTB in livestock herds are including wildlife related

features, which will provide a first approximation to the relative contribution of wild animals, and a fine biogeographical picture of the problem.

3. Wildlife disease surveillance

3.1. Defining the concepts

Two important concepts in wildlife disease epidemiology need to be defined: surveillance and management. Surveillance is the ongoing recording of diseases in wildlife populations with a view to disease management. Surveillance data are used to identify the areas to be targeted for control, and to anticipate spatial and temporal trends so that pre-emptive management interventions can be used to reduce disease risks (Artois et al. 2009). Wildlife disease management begins with surveillance; knowing if diseases are present, their past and current distribution, and the trends in their prevalence. Possibilities for disease management, always in addition to surveillance, include disease control through different means, disease eradication, which is usually not realistic, or taking no action, if the cost-benefit analysis suggests that this is the most convenient option (Wobeser, 1994).

3.2. Methods in bTB surveillance

The development of effective schemes for the surveillance of disease in wildlife populations is becoming increasingly important (Artois et al. 2009). Tools available for bTB surveillance include visual inspection for macroscopic bTB-compatible lesions or combinations of visual inspection with culture (e.g. Vicente et al. 2006); systematic culture of selected tissues (e.g. Gortazar et al. 2008); and even serology or combinations of serology and culture (e.g. Aurtenetxe et al. 2008, Vicente et al. 2007b). In Spain, surveillance is based on large post-

mortem samples obtained from hunter-harvested wildlife. However, alternative techniques need to be used in protected wildlife such as badgers, or in protected areas where hunting is banned.

Bacteriological culture is the gold standard test for determining bTB infection prevalence. In DNP red and fallow deer, taking culture samples from both the tonsil and retropharyngeal lymph node increased the rate of isolation of *M. bovis* by 22% over culture of the retropharyngeal lymph node alone (Martín-Hernando et al. 2010). Similarly, 19% of DNP wild boar yielded *M. bovis* isolates from the tonsil but not from the mandibular LN samples (unpublished data). Hence, pools of both tissues are now used for surveillance purposes.

Investigation of wild deer for bTB compatible lesions should ideally include examination of the medial retropharyngeal, left tracheobronchial, mediastinal, mesenteric and ileocaecal lymph nodes (LNs) (Martín-Hernando et al. 2010). Otherwise, the inspected organs should be clearly stated to allow comparisons. In the wild boar visible lesions are most often (i.e. in 92-100% of cases) located in the mandibular lymph nodes (Gortazar et al. 2003, Parra et al. 2006, Martín-Hernando et al. 2007). This makes targeted surveillance in this host easy. However, for epidemiological purposes it is interesting to sample at least also the left tracheobronchial LN of wild boar, to estimate the number of individuals with thoracic extended lesions (Martín-Hernando et al. 2007). Ideally, lesion identification should be carried out by trained staff in a systematic manner, and the presence of infection at the local level should later be confirmed by culture. Such information is considered to be valuable for exploring the magnitude and general distribution of bTB in wildlife, provided a large enough sample size is obtained from an extensive area (Vicente et al. 2006). Further, molecular characterization of the isolates from different species (including livestock) would provide additional information to clarify both the local epidemiology of bTB and large spatiotemporal patterns (Gortazar et al. 2005).

The recent development of ELISA tests for the detection of antibodies against *M. bovis* will facilitate studies on large areas and long time series. Two recent studies in wild boar coincide in reporting sensitivity of 73-77% and specificity of 96-97%. A close association between strong antibody response and the presence of gross lesions in individuals infected with *M. bovis* has been observed in wild boar (Aurtenetxe et al. 2008; Lyashchenko et al. 2008). More data on the utility of these techniques for other hosts such as red and fallow deer are needed.

3.3. Prevalence trends among Spanish wildlife

An increasing trend of bTB compatible lesions was reported among wild boar and red deer inspected between 1992 and 2004 in Extremadura, south-western Spain (Parra et al. 2006). In Doñana NP (Southern Spain), *M. bovis* infection prevalence increased from 1998-2003 to 2006-2007 by 100% in wild boar and by 50% in red deer (Romero et al. 2008, Gortazar et al. 2008). Among 14 wildlife populations included in a 10 year survey in south central Spain, 11 presented increasing levels of bTB compatible lesions and of incidence among juvenile wild boar, in contrast to only 3 sites with decreasing bTB (unpublished data; Figure 3). However, no nationwide figures on bTB trends are available for wildlife.

Field methods for estimating wild ungulate abundance and spatial aggregation (e.g. Acevedo et al. 2007, 2008) have been implemented, allowing matching population monitoring with disease surveillance. At a national scale, a Wildlife Disease Surveillance Program is being set up. This scheme is expected to provide quality information on disease trends in Spanish wildlife.

4. Host-pathogen interactions

Substantial evidence suggests that genetic and environmental factors contribute to the pathogenesis and differences in susceptibility of humans and mice to *M. tuberculosis* (Fernando and Britton, 2006). In Eurasian wild boar, genetic factors have been associated with resistance to bTB at the population level (Acevedo-Whitehouse et al. 2005). In this study, wild boar microsatellite marker variability was correlated with bTB providing evidence of both general and single-locus associative effects on bTB, and several loci revealed high homology to regions of the genome with known immune function (Acevedo-Whitehouse et al. 2005).

Recent studies demonstrated by suppression-subtractive hybridization and proteome analysis differential gene expression in tonsils and mandibular lymph nodes of tuberculous and non-tuberculous wild boar exposed to natural *M. bovis* infection (Naranjo et al. 2006a; 2007a). Microarray gene expression profiling also showed differential gene expression in Iberian red deer lymph nodes and wild boar peripheral blood mononuclear cells in response to natural *M. bovis* infection (Fernández de Mera et al. 2008, Galindo et al. 2009). These studies showed tissue-specific expression profiles that suggested differences in the role that tonsils and mandibular lymph nodes play in response to *M. bovis* infection in wild boar (Naranjo et al. 2007b). Furthermore, these studies suggested candidate gene markers associated with bTB resistance in wild boar and characterized genes that could be used to monitor host response to pathogen infection and vaccination (Naranjo et al. 2006b; 2008b; Pérez de la Lastra et al. 2009). One of these genes, methylmalonyl-CoA mutase (MUT) was upregulated in *M. bovis*-exposed uninfected animals and specific alleles were associated with resistance to bTB in wild boar (Naranjo et al. 2006b; 2008b; Pérez de la Lastra et al. 2009). Other genes such as complement component 3 (C3), interferon gamma (IFN-gamma), interleukin 4 (IL-4) and Regulated on Activation, Normal T Expressed and Secreted cytokine, also known as CCL5 (RANTES) were downregulated in infected wild boar and upregulated in parentally and

orally BCG-immunized animals when compared to non-immunized controls (Pérez de la Lastra et al. 2009; Ballesteros et al. 2009c). These results also provided additional evidence that expression of selected genes correlates with protection to *M. bovis* infection after oral BCG vaccination in wild boar (Ballesteros et al. 2009c).

These studies identified new mechanisms by which wildlife hosts respond to *M. bovis* infection and how the pathogen circumvents host immune responses to establish infection. Furthermore, gene expression profile in vaccinated animals showed BCG-specific responses that are different from those observed in naturally *M. bovis*-infected wild boar which may be used to monitor BCG vaccination during experimental vaccine studies in this species. Gene expression studies in naturally-infected wildlife bTB reservoirs are important for functional genomics and vaccine studies to aid in disease control.

5. Wild boar oral vaccination with BCG

Whether wildlife vaccination will become a realistic option in the frame of bTB control in Spain will depend on factors such as the long term success of cattle bTB control in wildlife habitats, and the results of ongoing vaccination trials in other countries, such as Ireland and UK in badgers and New Zealand in possums (*Trichosurus vulpecula*). Current vaccination research in Spain is focused on wild boar. Delivery, safety and efficacy issues need to be addressed in order to be prepared for eventually licensing a vaccine. Recently, baits for the oral delivery of vaccine preparations to 2–4 month-old wild boar piglets, the preferred age for vaccination, were developed and evaluated. The use of selective feeders during the summer was found to be a potentially reliable bait-deployment strategy (Ballesteros et al. 2009a; 2009b). Safety experiments yielded no isolation of *M. bovis* BCG from faeces, internal organs at necropsy and the environment, even after oral delivery of very high doses. Finally,

preliminary vaccination and challenge experiments suggest that a single oral BCG vaccination may protect wild boar from infection by a virulent *M. bovis* field strain (Ballesteros et al. 2009c).

6. Discussion

The ecology of *M. bovis* in Spain represents a multi-host system, with a relevant role for wildlife, but also for domestic reservoirs and for the environment. There are huge differences between regions, with almost no bTB and no wildlife reservoirs in the islands; almost no bTB and few wildlife and habitat risk factors in the Atlantic mainland; and still high bTB prevalence in the Mediterranean habitats of the mainland, partly explained by wildlife and habitat risk factors. As bTB prevalence has dropped in livestock, the relative importance of a potential wildlife reservoir may increase. Thus, wildlife aspects need to be considered in the strategy to control bTB in Spain

(<http://ec.europa.eu/food/animal/diseases/eradication/reportsanco-10584-2007btbsubgroupsevallarev110-1-08.pdf>). Moreover, wildlife numbers and wildlife distribution are continuously changing, with potential impacts on epidemiology.

Regarding wildlife, steps have been taken towards disease control. Firstly, new regulations of wild animal translocations (Royal Decree 1082/2009; <http://www.boe.es/boe/dias/2009/07/23/pdfs/BOE-A-2009-12206.pdf>) and on disposal of hunting carcass remains (both at the EU and the regional level), if properly enforced, will contribute to limit bTB spread. Secondly, new diagnostic tools and setting up a Wildlife Disease Surveillance scheme will allow documenting the spatial and temporal trends of bTB in wildlife. In Spain, the variety of surveillance systems is broad, and a need exists to find effective ways to share and exchange data among regions and coordinate on a global scale.

This will hopefully improve our ability to identify new health risks in wildlife populations and enhance our capability to manage them when necessary (Artois et al. 2009).

Wildlife fencing, feeding, and keeping overabundant populations for hunting or other recreational purposes, is still a problem of paramount importance in disease epidemiology, not only regarding bTB (Gortazar et al. 2006). To contribute to solve this problem, census methods have been developed (Acevedo et al. 2007) or adapted to Mediterranean habitats (Acevedo et al. 2008). This allows getting accurate estimations of the wildlife densities before and after a given management. Now it is the responsibility of the environment authorities to achieve a reduction of the current wildlife densities to more sustainable levels, and to contribute also to reduce the spatial aggregation of wildlife at feeders or waterholes (Figure 2, panel b). However, the success of any such management action must be assessed critically, including an analysis of the costs, of the ecological consequences and of the animal and human health, welfare, and conservation benefits.

This, in turn, urgently requires applied research regarding waterhole ecology, wild boar and deer space use and movements, carrion and gutpile consumption by birds and mammals, and particularly on the effect of any attempt to control bTB in wildlife, for instance through population control or testing the hypothesis that changes in food or water distribution may affect transmission rates. Ongoing research is also addressing wildlife-domestic livestock interaction in order to provide safer husbandry practices.

Despite the initial characterization of gene expression profiles in wildlife in response to *M. bovis* infection and BCG vaccination, further experiments are required to identify specific genes associated with protective response in these animals to monitor immune response after vaccination and to establish gene markers for genetic studies and assisted breeding in farmed game.

New vaccination and challenge trials are currently being conducted with larger numbers of experimental subjects. In parallel, safety issues are being addressed and, in the field, bait delivery experiments with biomarkers are being analyzed to evaluate the coverage of our vaccination strategy and model the possible impact on bTB control in wildlife under the conditions found in Spain. If these experiments progress as expected, work towards licensing the use of oral BCG in free living wild boar will be the goal. However, vaccination will not be a golden bullet but just one of several tools available for bTB control in wildlife in Spain.

Acknowledgements

We thank many colleagues at IREC for making this research possible. Studies on TB at IREC are supported by Grupo Santander - Fundacion Marcelino Botin, and by TB-STEP EU FP7, INIA-MICINN FAU 06-017, and PAI07-0062-6611 Castilla – La Mancha.

Conflict of Interest Statement

The authors have no conflict of interest.

7. References

- Acevedo, P., Escudero, M.A., Muñoz, R., Gortazar, C., 2006. Factors affecting wild boar abundance across an environmental gradient in Spain. *Acta Theriol.* 51, 327-336.
- Acevedo, P., Vicente, J., Hofle, U., Cassinello, J., Ruiz-Fons, F., Gortazar, C., 2007. Estimation of European wild boar relative abundance and aggregation: a novel method in epidemiological risk assessment. *Epidemiol. Infect.* 135, 519-527.

- 383 Acevedo, P., Ruiz-Fons, F., Vicente, J., Reyes-Garcia, A.R., Alzaga, V., Gortazar, C., 2008.
 384 Estimating red deer abundance in a wide range of management situations in Mediterranean
 385 habitats. *J. Zool.* 276, 37-47.
- 386 Acevedo-Whitehouse, K., Vicente, J., Gortazar, C., Höfle, U., Fernández-de-Mera, I.G.,
 387 Amos, W., 2005. Genetic resistance to bovine tuberculosis in the Iberian wild boar. *Mol.*
 388 *Ecol.* 14, 3209-3217.
- 389 Aranaz, A., de Juan, L., Montero, N., Sanchez, C., Galka, M., Delso, C., Alvarez, J., Romero,
 390 B., Bezos, J., Vela, A.I., Briones, V., Mateos, A., Dominguez, L., 2004. Bovine tuberculosis
 391 (*Mycobacterium bovis*) in wildlife in Spain. *J. Clin. Microbiol.* 42, 2602-2608.
- 392 Artois, M., Bengis, R., Delahay, R.J., Duchêne, M.J., Duff, P., Ferroglio, E., Gortazar, C.,
 393 Hutchings, M.R., Kock, R.A., Leighton, T., Mörner, T. & Smith G.C., 2009. Wildlife disease
 394 surveillance and monitoring, In: Delahay, R., Smith, G.C., Hutchings, M.R. (Eds.)
 395 Management of Disease in Wild Mammals. Springer, New York, pp. 187-214 .
- 396 Aurtenetxe, O., Barral, M., Vicente, J., de la Fuente, J., Gortazar, C., Juste, R.A., 2008.
 397 Development and validation of an enzyme-linked immunosorbent assay for antibodies against
 398 *Mycobacterium bovis* in European Wild Boar. *BMC Vet. Res.* 4, 43-52.
- 399 Ballesteros, C., Gortazar, C., Canales, M., Vicente, J., Lasagna, A., Gamarra, J.A., Carrasco-
 400 García, R., Fuente, J., 2009a. Evaluation of baits for oral vaccination of European wild boar
 401 piglets. *Res. Vet. Sci.* 86, 388-393.
- 402 Ballesteros, C., Carrasco-García, R., Vicente J., Carrasco J., Lasagna, A., de la Fuente, J.,
 403 Gortazar, C., 2009b. Selective piglet feeders improve age-related bait specificity and uptake
 404 rate in overabundant Eurasian wild boar populations. *Wildl. Res.* 36, 203-212.
- 405 Ballesteros, C., Garrido, J.M., Vicente, J., Romero, B., Galindo, R.C., Minguijón, E., Villar,
 406 M., Martín-Hernando, M.P., Sevilla, I., Juste, R., Aranaz, A., de la Fuente, J., Gortazar, C.,

- 2009c. First data on Eurasian wild boar response to oral immunization with BCG and challenge with a *Mycobacterium bovis* field strain. *Vaccine* 27, 6662–6668.
- Balseiro, A., Oleaga, A., Orusa, R., Robetto, S., Zoppi, S., Dondo, A., Gorla, M., Gortazar, C., Marin, J.F.G., Domenis, L., 2009. Tuberculosis in roe deer from Spain and Italy. *Vet. Rec.* 164, 468–470.
- Corner, L.A., 2006. The role of wild animal populations in the epidemiology of tuberculosis in domestic animals: how to assess the risk. *Vet. Microbiol.* 112, 303–312.
- Delahay, R.J., De Leeuw, A.N.S., Barlow, A.M., Clifton-Hadley, R.S., Cheeseman, C.L., 2002. The status of *Mycobacterium bovis* infection in UK wild mammals: a review. *Vet. J.* 164, 90–105.
- Delibes-Mateos, M., Farfan, M.A., Olivero, J., Marquez, A.L., Vargas, J.M., 2009. Long-term changes in game species over a long period of transformation in the Iberian Mediterranean landscape. *Environ. Manag.* 43, 1256–1268.
- Di Marco, V., Marianelli, C., Russo, M., Aronica, V., Bollo, E., Amedeo, S., Valenza, F., Capucchio, M.T., 2008. Black wild pigs of Nebrodi Park in Sicily: evidence of their possible role as reservoir of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* complex infection. *European Society of Veterinary Pathology, 26th Meeting, 17–21 September, 2008, Dubrovnik, Croatia.*
- EFSA 2009. Draft report on wildlife reservoirs of bovine tuberculosis in Europe.
- Fernández-de-Mera, I.G., Pérez de la Lastra, J.M., Ayoubi, P., Naranjo, V., Kocan, K.M., Gortazar, C., de la Fuente, J., 2008. Differential expression of inflammatory and immune response genes in mesenteric lymph nodes of Iberian red deer (*Cervus elaphus hispanicus*) naturally infected with *Mycobacterium bovis*. *Dev. Comp. Immunol.* 32, 85–91.
- Fernández-de-Mera, I.G., Vicente, J., Pérez De La Lastra, J.M., Mangold, A.J., Naranjo, V., Fierro, Y., De La Fuente, J., Gortazar, C., 2009a. Reduced major histocompatibility complex

- class II polymorphism in a hunter-managed isolated Iberian red deer population. J. Zool. 277, 157-170.
- Fernández de Mera, I.G., Vicente J., Naranjo V., Fierro Y., Garde J.J., de la Fuente J., Gortazar C., 2009b. Impact of major histocompatibility complex class II polymorphisms on Iberian red deer parasitism and life history traits. Infec. Genet. Evol. 9, 1232-1239.
- Fernando, S.L., Britton, W.J., 2006. Genetic susceptibility to mycobacterial disease in humans. Immunol. Cell. Biol. 84, 125-137.
- Galindo, R.C., Ayoubi, P., Naranjo, V., Gortazar, C., Kocan, K.M., de la Fuente, J., 2009. Gene expression profiles of European wild boar naturally infected with *Mycobacterium bovis*. Vet. Immunol. Immunopathol. 129, 119-125.
- Gómez-Laguna, J., Carrasco, L., Ramis, G., Quereda, J.J., Gómez, S., Pallarés, F.J., 2010. Use of real-time and classic polymerase chain reaction assays for the diagnosis of porcine tuberculosis in formalin-fixed, paraffin-embedded tissues. J. Vet. Diagn. Invest. 22:123–127.
- Gortazar, C., Herrero, J., Villafuerte, R., Marco, J., 2000. Historical examination of the status of large mammals in Aragon, Spain. Mammalia 64, 411-422.
- Gortazar, C., Vicente, J., Gavier-Widen, D., 2003. Pathology of bovine tuberculosis in the European wild boar (*Sus scrofa*). Vet. Rec. 152, 779-780.
- Gortazar, C., Vicente, J., Samper, S., Garrido, J.M., Fernandez-de-Mera, I.G., Gavin, P., Juste, R.A., Martin, C., Acevedo, P., De La Puente, M. and Hofle, U., 2005. Molecular characterization of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* complex isolates from wild ungulates in south-central Spain. Vet. Res. 36, 43-52.
- Gortazar, C., Acevedo, P., Ruiz-Fons, F., Vicente, J., 2006. Disease risks and overabundance of game species. Eur. J. Wildl. Res. 52, 81-87.

- 454 Gortazar, C., Torres J., Vicente J., Acevedo P., Reglero M., de la Fuente J., Negro J.J.,
 455 Aznar-Martin J., 2008. Bovine Tuberculosis in Doñana Biosphere Reserve: The role of wild
 456 ungulates as disease reservoirs in the last Iberian lynx strongholds. PLoS ONE 3, e2776.
- 457 Gutiérrez, M., García-Marín, J.F., 1999. Brief communications and case reports:
 458 *Cryptococcus neoformans* and *Mycobacterium bovis* causing granulomatous pneumonia in a
 459 goat. Vet. Pathol. 36, 445-448.
- 460 Haydon, D.T., Cleaveland, S., Taylor, L.H., Laurenson, M.K., 2002. Identifying reservoirs of
 461 infection: A conceptual and practical challenge. Emerg. Infect. Dis. 8, 1468-1473.
- 462 Lyashchenko, K.P., Greenwald, R., Esfandiari, J., Chambers, M.A., Vicente, J., Gortazar, C.,
 463 Santos, N., Correia-Neves, M., Buddle, B.M., Jackson, R., O'Brien, D.J., Schmitt, S., Palmer,
 464 M.V., Delahay, R.J., Waters, W.R., 2008. Animal-side serologic assay for rapid detection of
 465 *Mycobacterium bovis* infection in multiple species of free-ranging wildlife. Vet. Microbiol.
 466 132, 283-292.
- 467 Martin-Hernando, M.P., Hofle, U., Vicente, J., Ruiz-Fons, F., Vidal, D., Barral, M., Garrido,
 468 J.M., de La Fuente, J., Gortazar, C., 2007. Lesions associated with *Mycobacterium*
 469 *tuberculosis* complex infection in the European wild boar. Tuberculosis 87, 360-367.
- 470 Martin-Hernando, M.P., Torres, M.J., Aznar, J., Negro, J.J., Gandía, A., Gortazar, C. 2010.
 471 Distribution of Lesions in Red and Fallow Deer Naturally Infected with *Mycobacterium*
 472 *bovis*. J. Comp. Pathol. 142, 43-50.
- 473 Millan, J., Jimenez, M.A., Viota, M., Candela, M.G., Pena, L., Leon-Vizcaino, L., 2008.
 474 Disseminated bovine tuberculosis in a wild red fox (*Vulpes vulpes*) in Southern Spain. J.
 475 Wildl. Dis. 44, 701-706.

- 476 Miller, R., Kaneene, J.B., Fitzgerald, S.D., Schmitt, S.M., 2003. Evaluation of the influence
477 of supplemental feeding of white-tailed deer (*Odocoileus virginianus*) on the prevalence of
478 bovine tuberculosis in the Michigan wild deer population. *J. Wildl. Dis.* 39, 84-95.
- 479 Naranjo, V., Höfle, U., Vicente, J., Martín, M.P., Ruiz-Fons, F., Gortazar, C., Kocan, K.M.,
480 de la Fuente, J., 2006a. Genes differentially expressed in oropharyngeal tonsils and
481 mandibular lymph nodes of tuberculous and non-tuberculous European wild boars naturally
482 exposed to *Mycobacterium bovis*. *FEMS Immunol. Med. Microbiol.* 46, 298-312.
- 483 Naranjo, V., Ayoubi, P., Vicente, J., Ruiz-Fons, F., Gortazar, C., Kocan, K.M., de la Fuente,
484 J., 2006b. Characterization of selected genes upregulated in non-tuberculous European wild
485 boar as possible correlates of resistance to *Mycobacterium bovis* infection. *Vet. Microbiol.*
486 116, 224-231.
- 487 Naranjo, V., Villar, M., Martín-Hernando, M.P., Vidal, D., Höfle, U., Gortazar, C., Kocan,
488 K.M., Vázquez, J., de la Fuente, J. 2007a. Proteomic and transcriptomic analyses of
489 differential stress/inflammatory responses in mandibular lymph nodes and oropharyngeal
490 tonsils of European wild boars naturally infected with *Mycobacterium bovis*. *Proteomics* 7,
491 220-231.
- 492 Naranjo, V., Gortazar, C., Villar, M., de la Fuente, J. 2007b. Comparative genomics and
493 proteomics to study tissue-specific response and function in natural *Mycobacterium bovis*
494 infections. *Anim. Health Res. Rev.* 8, 81-88.
- 495 Naranjo, V., Gortazar, C., Vicente, J., de la Fuente, J., 2008a. Evidence of the role of
496 European wild boar as a reservoir of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* complex. *Vet. Microbiol.*
497 127, 1-9.

- 498 Naranjo, V., Acevedo-Whitehouse, A., Vicente, J., Gortazar, C., de la Fuente, J., 2008b.
 499 Influence of methylmalonyl-CoA mutase alleles on resistance to bTB in the European wild
 500 boar (*Sus scrofa*). Anim. Genet. 39, 316-320.
- 501 Palomo, L.J., Gisbert, J., 2002. Atlas de los mamíferos terrestres de España. Dirección
 502 General de la Conservación de la Naturaleza-SECEM-SECEMU, Madrid, pp. 306-314.
- 503 Parra, A., Larrasa, J., García, A., Alonso, J.M., Hermoso De Mendoza, J., 2005. Molecular
 504 epidemiology of bovine tuberculosis in wild animals in Spain: A first approach to risk factor
 505 analysis. Vet. Microbiol. 110, 293-300.
- 506 Parra, A., Garcia, A., Inglis, N.F., Tato, A., Alonso, J.M., de Mendoza, M.H., de Mendoza,
 507 J.H., Larrasa, J., 2006. An epidemiological evaluation of *Mycobacterium bovis* infections in
 508 wild game animals of the Spanish Mediterranean ecosystem. Res. Vet. Sci. 80, 140-146.
- 509 Peña, L., Garcia, P., Jiménez, M.A., Benito, A., Alenza, M.D.P., Sánchez, B., 2006.
 510 Histopathological and immunohistochemical findings in lymphoid tissues of the endangered
 511 Iberian lynx (*Lynx pardinus*). Comp. Immunol. Microbiol. Infect. Dis. 29, 114-126.
- 512 Pérez de la Lastra, J.M., Galindo, R.C., Gortazar, C., Ruiz-Fons, F., de la Fuente, J. 2009.
 513 Expression of immunoregulatory genes in peripheral blood mononuclear cells of European
 514 wild boar immunized with BCG. Vet. Microbiol. 134, 334-339.
- 515 Revilla, E., Palomares, F., 2002. Spatial organization, group living and ecological correlates
 516 in low-density populations of Eurasian badgers, *Meles meles*. J. Anim. Ecol. 71, 497-512.
- 517 Romero, B., Aranaz, A., Sandoval, A., Álvarez, J., de Juan, L., Bezos, J., Sánchez, C., Galka,
 518 M., Fernández, P., Mateos, A., Domínguez, L., 2008. Persistence and molecular evolution of
 519 *Mycobacterium bovis* population from cattle and wildlife in Doñana National Park revealed
 520 by genotype variation. Vet. Microbiol. 132, 87-95.

- 521 Sobrinho, R., Martin-Hernando, M.P., Vicente, J., Aurtenetxe, O., Garrido, J.M., Gortazar, C.,
522 2008. Bovine tuberculosis in a badger (*Meles meles*) in Spain. Vet. Rec. 163, 159-160.
- 523 Sobrinho, R., Acevedo, P., Escudero, M.A., Marco, J., Gortazar, C., 2009. Carnivore
524 population trends in Spanish agrosystems after the reduction in food availability due to rabbit
525 decline by rabbit haemorrhagic disease and improved waste management. Eur. J. Wildl. Res.
526 55, 161-165.
- 527 Vicente, J., Hofle, U., Garrido, J.M., Fernandez-de-Mera, I.G., Juste, R., Barral, M.,
528 Gortazar, C., 2006. Wild boar and red deer display high prevalences of tuberculosis-like
529 lesions in Spain. Vet. Res. 37, 107-119.
- 530 Vicente, J., Delahay, R.J., Walker, N.J., Cheeseman, C.L., 2007a. Social organization and
531 movement influence the incidence of bovine tuberculosis in an undisturbed high-density
532 badger *Meles meles* population. J. Anim. Ecol. 76, 348-360.
- 533 Vicente, J., Höfle, U., Garrido, J.M., Fernández-De-Mera, I.G., Acevedo, P., Juste, R., Barral,
534 M., Gortazar, C., 2007b. Risk factors associated with prevalence of tuberculosis-like lesions
535 in wild boar and red deer in South Central Spain. Vet. Res. 38, 451-464.
- 536 Vicente, J., Hofle, U., Fernandez-De-Mera, I.G., Gortazar, C., 2007c. The importance of
537 parasite life history and host density in predicting the impact of infections in red deer.
538 Oecologia 152, 655-664.
- 539 Wobeser, G.A., 1994, Disease in Wild Animals, Investigation and management, 1st edition
540 Edition. Plenum, New York, pp. 131-234.
- 541 Zanella, G., Durand, B., Hars, J., Moutou, F., Garin-Bastuji, B., Duvauchelle, A., Ferme, M.,
542 Karoui, C., Boschioli, M.L., 2008. *Mycobacterium bovis* in wildlife in France. J. Wildl. Dis.
543 44, 99-108.

Table 1.- Current situation in Spain, status regarding bovine tuberculosis (bTB), and selected bTB risk factors among three wild ungulates.

546

	Host species			
Fact	Eurasian wild boar	Red deer	Fallow deer	References
Situation in Spain				
- Current distribution (1)	Widespread	Patchy	Local	Palomo and Gisbert, 2002
- Population trend	Increasing	Increasing	Stable to increasing	Gortazar et al. 2000, Acevedo et al. 2006
- Abundance	Range 1 to 90/km ² , even higher in farm-like enclosures	Mean 21, locally up to 69/km ²	Usually lower than red deer, but locally up to 50/km ²	Acevedo et al. 2007, 2008
Status regarding bTB				
- Prevalence	42.5% (max 100%)	13.7% (max 50%)	? (max 18.5%)	Vicente et al. 2006, Gortazar et al. 2008
- % of generalized bTB	57.8-61.2%	57.1-70%	73.3%	Vicente et al. 2006, Martín-Hernando et al. 2007, 2010
- % of lung lesions	38.1%	30%	80%	Martín-Hernando et al. 2007, 2010
Known bTB risk factors				
- Individual	Age, Genetics,	Age, Sex, Genetics	Age, Sex	Acevedo-Whitehouse et al. 2005, Vicente et al. 2006, Gortazar et al. 2008, Fernández-de-Mera et al. 2009
- Intra and inter-specific	Social group, Red deer bTB prevalence	Social group, Wild boar bTB prevalence	Not known	Vicente et al. 2007, Gortazar et al. (Submitted)
- Environmental	Density, Fencing, Hardwood <i>Quercus</i> spp. forest availability, Spatial aggregation of wild boar at artificial watering sites	Density, Hardwood <i>Quercus</i> spp. forest availability, Spatial aggregation of wild boar at artificial watering and feeding sites	Not known	Acevedo-Whitehouse et al. 2005, Vicente et al. 2007a, 2007b
- Ability to cross fences	High	Low	Low	Unpublished data from GPS-tagged wild boar
- Use of carrion	Frequent	Occasional	No	Unpublished data from camera trap surveys

547

548 (1) All three are absent from the island regions.

549

Figure legends

Figure 1.- Recent trends in cattle herd bovine tuberculosis (bTB) prevalence (in %) in three ecologically contrasting Spanish regions, the Balearic Islands (Mediterranean climate, no potential wildlife reservoirs), Galicia (Atlantic climate, potential wildlife reservoirs abundant), and Castilla – La Mancha (Mediterranean climate, potential wildlife reservoirs abundant and frequent high wire fencing & feeding). Prevalence data from MARM (<http://www.mapa.es>).

Figure 2.- Risk factors for bovine tuberculosis in Spanish wildlife. (a) High wire fencing nowadays occupies over 50% of suitable wildlife habitat in some provinces. While most fences are not wild boar proof, they reduce the genetic variability and disease resistance of red deer and wild boar. (b) Feeding and artificial watering causes aggregation of wild ungulates, in the picture wild boar. (c) Wildlife translocations imply the risk of spreading diseases. (d) Carrion consumption. Red deer stag consuming material from a hunting gut pile. The picture was taken by a movement triggered camera set up after a driven hunt to record carrion consumption.

Figure 3.- Ten year trends in the prevalence of bovine tuberculosis compatible lesions in wild boar from south central Spain. In panel (a), total lesion prevalence for each of the 14 populations in 2001-2004 and 2007-2009 is shown. Panel (b) shows the prevalence by age class for a population with declining trend (NV) and a population with an increasing trend (CB). These differences are most evident among yearlings.

A

B