Multilocus sequence analysis for assessment of the biogeography and evolutionary

...genetics of four Bradyrhizobium species that nodulate soybeans on the asiatic continent

Pablo Vinuesa,1* Keilor Rojas-Jiménez,2,3 Bruno Contreras-Moreira,4 Suresh K. Mahna,2,5 Braj Nandan Prasad,2,6 Hla Moe,2,7 Suresh Babu Selvaraju,2,8 Heidemarie Thierfelder,2 and Dietrich Werner,2

Centro de Ciencias Genómicas, Universidad Nacional Autónoma de México, Mexico1; FB Biologie, FG für Zellbiologie und Angewandte Botanik, Philipps Universität Marburg, Germany2; Instituto Nacional de Biodiversidad, Santo Domingo de Heredia, Costa Rica3; Estación Experimental Aula Dei, Consejo Superior de Investigaciones Científicas, Zaragoza, Spain4; Department of Botany, Maharshi Dayanand Saraswati University Ajmer, India5; School of Biotechnology, Chemical and Biomedical Engineering, VIT University, Vellore, India6; Department of Botany, University of Mandalay, Myanmar7; Research Children’s Mercy Hospitals and Clinics, Kansas City, MO8

* Corresponding author. Mailing address: Centro de Ciencias Genómicas – UNAM, Av. Universidad S/N, Col. Chamilpa, AP 565-A, Cuernavaca CP 62210, Morelos, México. Phone:+ 52 777 3175867. Fax: + 52 777 3175581.
E-mail: vinuesa@ccg.unam.mx (P. Vinuesa).

Supplemental material for this article may be found at http://aem.asm.org/

Running title: Biogeography and evolutionary genetics of bradyrhizobia
Abstract

A highly supported maximum likelihood species phylogeny for the genus *Bradyrhizobium* was inferred from a supermatrix obtained from the concatenation of partial *atpD*, *recA*, *glnII* and *rpoB* sequences corresponding to 33 reference strains and 76 bradyrhizobia isolated from the nodules of *Glycine max* (soybean) trap plants inoculated with soil samples from Myanmar, India, Nepal and Vietnam. The power of the multigene approach using multiple strains per species was evaluated in terms of overall tree resolution and phylogenetic congruence, representing a practical and portable option for bacterial molecular systematics. Potential pitfalls of the approach are highlighted. Seventy five of the isolates could be classified as *B. japonicum* type Ia (USDA110/USDA122-like), *B. liaoningense*, *B. yuanmingense* or *B. elkanii*, whereas one represented a novel *Bradyrhizobium* lineage. Most Nepalese *B. japonicum* Ia isolates belong to a highly epidemic clone closely related to strain USDA110. Significant phylogenetic evidence was found against the monophyly of the *B. japonicum* I and Ia lineages. Analysis of their DNA polymorphisms revealed high population distances, significant genetic differentiation and contrasting population genetic structures, suggesting that the strains in the Ia lineage are misclassified as *B. japonicum*. The DNA polymorphism patterns of all species conformed to the expectations of the neutral mutation and population equilibrium models and, excluding the *B. japonicum* Ia lineage, were consistent with intermediate recombination levels. All species displayed epidemic clones and had broad geographic and environmental distribution ranges, as revealed by mapping climate types and geographic origins of the isolates on the species tree.
INTRODUCTION

Soybean (*Glycine max*) is the most important grain legume in the world with an annual production of around 180 million tons and a market value of more than 36 billion EURO. This crop is planted on 5.7, 8.3, 29 and 30 million hectares in India, China, South and North America, respectively (66). It is a major cash crop for small farmers in Asia, South America and also in some African countries. The diversity of soybeans today is the result of more than 5,000 years of cultivation, which started in China, where more than 20,000 land races were selected and later globally distributed and further domesticated by modern breeding programs (4). Soybeans were introduced in India around 1000 A.D. via the silk route from China (26).

*Bradyrhizobium japonicum*, *B. elkanii*, *B. liaoningense*, *Ensifer* (*Sinorhizobium*) *fredii*, *E. xinjiangense* and *Mesorhizobium tianshanense* are the microsymbionts currently known to nodulate soybeans naturally under field conditions (19, 23, 36, 45, 46, 57, 68). Soybean-nodulating *B. japonicum* strains have been isolated from different continents and climatic zones. Recently, two *B. japonicum* biovars (symbiotic ecotypes) were described (61). The bv. *glycinearum* isolates nodulate soybeans whereas the bv. *genistearum* strains nodulate genistoid legumes such as *Adenocarpus*, *Lupinus*, *Spartocytisus* or *Teline*, but not soybeans, and *vice versa*. *Bradyrhizobium elkanii*-like isolates have been recovered from diverse legumes, including soybeans, growing in tropical soils (1, 34), and in subtropical and temperate regions (32, 58). *Bradyrhizobium liaoningense* isolates from soybeans and peanuts (*Arachis hypogaea*) have only been isolated in Chinese locations with cold or temperate humid climates (65, 68).

The other three validly published *Bradyrhizobium* species are *B. yuanmingense*, isolated from the root nodules of *Lespedeza cuneata* in China (69), *B. betae* from tumour-like structures of sugar beet (*Beta vulgaris*) in Northern Spain (42), and *B. canariense* bv. *genistearum*, recovered from the nodules
of diverse legume genera in the tribes Genistae and Loteae growing naturally in the Canary Islands, Morocco, Spain, along the Mediterranean Basin and the Americas (18, 61). The latter species has been recently reported to nodulate lupins and serradela plants in South Africa and Western Australia (54), thus being a truly cosmopolitan species.

Multilocus sequence analysis (10) has been recently employed to infer highly resolved *Bradyrhizobium* species phylogenies, to elucidate micro-evolutionary processes of particular species, to determine their geographic distribution ranges and to formulate initial phylogeographic hypotheses (54, 61, 65). The aim of the study was to assess the power and practical utility of the multilocus sequence analysis approach (10) for *Bradyrhizobium* molecular systematics. This bacterial genus is considered as a “taxonomically difficult” group of organisms due to their highly conserved *rrs* sequences and poor correlation between the groupings formed on the basis of genotypic and phenotypic traits, raising questions about the suitability of the polyphasic taxonomic approach to *Bradyrhizobium* systematics (51, 60).

Here we present a multilocus sequence-based analysis of 80 soybean nodule isolates obtained from India, Myanmar, Nepal and Vietnam. Thirty three reference strains were included in the combined phylogenetic and population genetic approaches used for species demarcation, to estimate the magnitude of evolutionary forces acting within lineages, and to gain further insights into their geographic and environmental distribution ranges. We took advantage of recently developed fast maximum likelihood phylogeny algorithms (2, 11) and the power of multiprocessor computing to make thorough searches of tree space, compute bipartition significance values and evaluate competing phylogenetic hypotheses in order to ground our taxonomic classifications. We discuss the advantages and potential pitfalls of phylogenetic supermatrix analyses in the frameworks of bacterial molecular systematics and ecological inference.
MATERIALS AND METHODS

Isolation of symbiotic Bradyrhizobium strains from soybean root nodules. Rhizospheric soil samples were taken from traditionally-managed soybean fields in India, Myanmar, Nepal, and Vietnam without known inoculation records, except for two Indian locations that had been inoculated with B. japonicum (Table 1). The geographic coordinates, Köppen-Geiger climatic types and agroecological land use of the soil sampling sites are summarized in Table 1. The isolates were obtained from the nodules induced by bacteria present in the rhizosphere soil samples on Glycine max trap plants cultivated for 4 weeks using the Leonard jar setting, cultivation conditions and isolation protocols described elsewhere (62). Five gram aliquots of air-dried soil were mixed with the sterile perlite-vermiculite substrate used to fill each cultivation unit. Three jars containing two axenically germinated plantlets were used for each site, whereas jars without soil inoculum served as negative nodulation controls. Genomic DNA from purified isolates and reference strains was isolated using a CTAB-based protocol, as described previously (62).

Amplification and sequencing of atpD, glnII, recA and rpoB gene fragments. Partial atpD, glnII and recA gene fragments were amplified with the primers and conditions reported previously (65). Here we developed and validated an additional molecular marker for the genus Bradyrhizobium, tagging the RNA polymerase beta subunit (rpoB) locus, which had been previously used to study phylogenetic relationships between Afipia and Bosea species, two close relatives of bradyrhizobia (20). A partial rpoB fragment of 910 bp was amplified with primers rpoB-454F (ATCGTCTCGCAGATGCACCG) and rpoB-1364R (TCGATGTCGTCGATYTCGCC) using the protocol developed for the recA locus. The digits in the primer designations correspond to their binding coordinates on the B. japonicum USDA 110 rpoB gene.

All amplifications were performed with Taq polymerase (USB-Amersham). Amplification products were purified using the PCR product purification system of Roche. Both strands were commercially sequenced by Macrogen, Korea (www.macrogen.com). The GenBank accession numbers for all the sequences generated in this study are listed in Table S1, provided as supplementary online material. These include 80 atpD, glnII, recA and rpoB sequences for a corresponding number of Asiatic soybean nodule isolates, and 37 rpoB sequences for selected reference strains, for which the other three loci had been sequenced in previous studies (61, 65).

Evolutionary analyses of nucleotide sequence alignments. Diverse data parsing and transformation tasks were automated using ad hoc Perl scripts (http://perl.com/). Nucleotide sequences were translated and aligned using muscle 3.52 (6). The resulting multiple sequence alignments of proteins were used as masks to generate the corresponding codon alignments using custom Perl scripts.

Models of nucleotide substitution were selected by the Akaike information criterion (AIC), using MODELTEST3.7 (38). Among-site rate variation was modelled by a gamma distribution, approximated with 4 rate categories (7), each category being represented by its mean. Maximum likelihood (ML) trees were inferred under the AIC-selected models (37) of nucleotide substitution for each data set.
using PhyML v2.4.5 (2, 11). In order to make a more thorough search of tree space, 100 random step-wise addition parsimony trees were generated for each locus with PAUP*4b10 (55) and used to initiate a corresponding number of ML searches on a cluster of 27 dual core Pentium IV processors under Linux Rocks 3.3.0. A default search using a starting BioNJ tree was also run for all loci. The tree yielding the highest lnL value was selected among the 101 independent searches. The robustness of the ML topologies was evaluated using a recently developed Shimodaira-Hasegawa-like test (47) for branches implemented in PhyML v2.4.5 (2). In brief, the test assesses whether the branch being studied provides a significant likelihood gain, in comparison with the null hypothesis that involves collapsing that branch, but leaving the rest of the tree topology identical. We chose the Shimodaira-Hasegawa-like procedure for assessing bipartition significance because the test is non-parametric and much less liberal than the diverse (parametric) approximate likelihood ratio tests (aLRTs) that are also implemented in that program. The resulting SH-like P-values therefore indicate the probability that the corresponding split is significant. Shimodaira-Hasegawa tests (47) were used to evaluate the global phylogenetic congruence of trees inferred single genes, as well as those inferred from all possible combinations of partitions, as implemented in PAUP* (55), using 10 random sequential addition starting trees and TBR branch swapping. The statistical significance of conflicting phylogenetic hypotheses for different partitions and specific clades was also determined by SH-tests using the phylograms resulting from constrained vs. unconstrained tree searches under best-approximating substitution models.

Population genetic analyses of sequence polymorphisms were performed with DnaSP4.5 (44) in order to test the neutral mutation and population equilibrium hypotheses, to infer the population mutation ($\theta = 2N_e \mu$) and recombination ($C = 2N_e \rho$) parameters (13), and to obtain estimates of population differentiation (15) and gene flow (17), as detailed in the relevant sections. Coalescent simulations based on $10^4$ genealogy replications were performed with DnaSP to estimate the 95% confidence interval of the $Rm$ (minimal number of recombination events) and $R_2$ (population growth) test statistics (16, 41). Permutation analyses with $10^4$ replicates were run to test the significance of the population subdivision test statistics (15).
RESULTS

Isolation of novel soybean root nodule rhizobial strains from India, Myanmar, Nepal and Vietnam. A total of 112 soybean microsymbionts were isolated. All soils used as inoculum contained soybean-compatible bradyrhizobia. In this study, we present the analyses performed on 80 of these isolates. A list linking the sampling sites with the origin of the isolate is provided in Table 1.

Phylogenetic classification of the new Asiatic soybean root-nodule isolates based on total evidence. Sequence data for the atpD, glnII, recA and rpoB loci were obtained for all 80 isolates. In addition, we sequenced the rpoB fragment for 37 reference Bradyrhizobium strains for which the former three loci had been previously sequenced and analyzed (61, 65). Therefore, a total of 357 new sequences were deposited in GenBank (Acc. Nos. EF190155-EF190191 and EU574088-EU574407; see table S1 provided as online supplementary material). These loci are unlinked and therefore provide independent genealogies from which to infer a species tree (43).

ML tree searches under best-approximating models were individually performed for the 4 sequence partitions containing 115 aligned sequences (comprising 80 Asiatic isolates and 35 reference strains). The resulting gene trees are provided as online supplemental material (Figs. S1-S4). These analyses identified several xenologous sequences. The Nepalese B. japonicum type Ia NeRa14 isolate had a B. japonicum type I rpoB locus, while the B. yuanmingense BuCeR1, BuCeR2 and BuMiT10 isolates were recipients of B. elkanii-like rpoB loci (highlighted on Fig. S4). These isolates were excluded from further analyses.

Figure 1 shows the ML phylogram obtained under the GTR+I+G model for 62 unique haplotypes recorded among concatenated atpD+glnII+recA+rpoB sequences from the 110 Bradyrhizobium sp. isolates and reference strains. This was the best-scoring tree found among 100 independent PhyML
searches that started from a corresponding number of random sequential-addition seed trees. Their $\ln L$ scores ranged from -13004.57183 to -13038.67491 (best to worst). These values correspond to 86 tree islands with unique trees and 7 islands with two trees. A default PhyML search starting with a BioNJ tree found a slightly worse tree ($\ln L = -13007.21494$) than the best one indicated above. Better-scoring ML trees could be found in all the single-locus analyses performed in this study when multiple distinct seed trees were used to initiate ML searches, as compared to the score of the tree found by default PhyML searches starting from a BioNJ tree (data not shown). The fact that most of the tree islands, including the highest-scoring one, were hit only once, reveals the complexity of the likelihood surface and strongly suggests that better trees remain to be found.

The tree is rooted with the homologous sequences from *Rhodopseudomonas palustris* BisB5. The phylogeny resolves two major and deeply branching clades with maximal SH-like support (A and B in Fig. 1) and a total of 10 *Bradyrhizobium* lineages (see labels in Fig. 1). The Asiatic isolates were recovered in 5 of them. Clade A groups *B. elkanii* strains, whereas clade B groups strains from *B. japonicum* types I and Ia, *B. canariense*, *B. yuanmingense* and *B. liaoningense*, *Bradyrhizobium* genospecies alpha and beta, and a novel lineage represented by isolate BuNoG5.

Ten multilocus haplotypes from 15 Myanmarese isolates were recovered in clade A, forming two subclades related to the *B. elkanii* strains USDA76$^T$ and USDA94, respectively. All BuMi* isolates grouped in the former, while all BuNo* isolates clustered in the latter (* denoting any alphanumerical characters). Eight very significantly supported subclades (SH-like $P$-values $\geq 0.99$) were resolved within clade B (bold and shaded $P$-values in Fig. 1). The remaining Asiatic isolates were recovered in 4 of these subclades. The largest number of the isolates, (21 Indian, 6 Myanmarese and 2 Vietnamese), comprising a total of 9 haplotypes, clustered with the *B. yuanmingense* reference strains CCBAU10071$^T$, LMTR28 and TAL760. No obvious correlation was found between the internal subdivisions of this clade and the geographic origin of the isolates, the most abundant haplotype being
shared by Myanmarese, Indian and Vietnamese isolates (darker shading on Fig. 1). Four Myanmarese (BuMi*) and 9 Vietnamese isolates (ViHa*) grouped with *B. liaoningense* LMG18230\(^T\) and Spr3-7 from China. The three lineages resolved within the *B. liaoningense* clade correlate perfectly with the geographic origin of the strains (China, Myanmar and Vietnam). All 19 Nepalese NeMa* and NeRa* isolates clustered tightly with *B. japonicum* type Ia strains such as USDA110 and USDA122, representing 6 haplotypes. One of them was shared by 15 Nepalese isolates, corresponding to a highly epidemic clone (white box in Fig. 1). The isolate NeRa14 was found to harbour a xenologous *rpoB* allele from a *B. japonicum* type I donor (see Fig. S4), but none of the Asiatic isolates studied herein was recovered within the clade grouping those strains (Fig. 1). The Myanmarese isolate BuNoG5 most likely represents a novel *Bradyrhizobium* species within clade B.

The splits separating the highly significant subclades (*B. canariense*, *B. japonicum* I and Ia, *B. liaoningense* and *Bradyrhizobium* genospecies beta) resolved within clade B are significant (≥ 0.95) only in one case (see inclined dotted-box on Fig. 1). Interestingly, species clades could be recognized as the most inclusive clades with a long subtending branch (≥ 26 expected substitutions) with SH-like P-values ≥ 0.99, separated from other such clades by short branches (≤ 22 expected substitutions) with P-values ≤ 0.95. One of these deep internal branches is particularly short and not supported at all (P = 0.51), indicating that the phylogenetic relationships between some species may not be properly determined, particularly for sister clades having very short and poorly supported (P << 0.90) subtending branches.

**Global phylogenetic congruence among single gene partitions and their combinations.** Figure 2 shows the result of pairwise Shimodaira-Hasegawa tests (47) performed between all pairs of single gene partitions and all possible combinations of them. All single gene partitions were significantly incongruent between them. However, as shown in Fig. 2 and in Table S2 (provided as online
supplementary material), the mean and median congruence levels of trees increases with the number of 
concatenated partitions used to infer them. The species tree shown in Fig. 1 has the highest mean and 
median $P$ values (0.40 and 0.38, respectively) for all pairwise comparisons (Table S2).

**Taxonomic implications of significant phylogenetic incongruences found among sequence parti\-\ons for specific clades.** All maximum likelihood gene trees support the monophyly of $B$. *canariense*, $B$. *japonicum* type I and Ia, $B$. *yuanmingense* and $B$. *elkanii* (Figs. S1-S4 provided as supplementary data). However, the $B$. *japonicum* I and Ia lineages are not grouped in a clade on the 
$atpD$, $glnII$ and $rpoB$ phylograms, whereas the BuMiN*, BuMiT*, ViHaG* and ViHaR* strains are 
significantly associated with the bona fide $B$. *liaoningense* strains LMG18230$^T$ and Spr3-7 in the $atpD$, 
and $rpoB$ phylogenies, but not in the $recA$ or $glnII$ trees. Shimodaira-Hasegawa tests (47) were 
performed on constrained and unconstrained ML tree searches in order to test the strength of the 
alternative phylogenetic hypotheses suggested by the individual gene trees. As shown in Table 2, the 
constrained $glnII$ and $recA$ tree searches forcing the monophyly of BuMiN*, BuMiT*, ViHaG* and 
ViHaR* isolates (excluding ViHAG1 and ViHaG5, recovered in the $B$. *yuanmingense* clade) with the 
bona fide $B$. *liaoningense* strains LMG18230$^T$ and Spr3-7 did not result in significantly worse trees ($P$ 
> 0.2 in both cases). Therefore we classified the former isolates as $B$. *liaoningense*, which is consistent 
with their highly significant monophyletic grouping in the ML phylogeny shown in Fig. 1. However, 
tree searches imposing the monophyly constraint on the $B$. *japonicum* I and Ia clades resulted in 
significantly worse trees for both the $atpD$ and $rpoB$ loci, as well as for the concatenated dataset. The 
monophyly hypothesis was therefore rejected in this case.

**Quantification of the phylogenetic signal content of individual sequence partitions and their 
concatenations.** The relative phylogenetic information content of the individual sequence partitions
and their concatenation was evaluated by computing diverse descriptive statistics of the SH-like \( P \)-values parsed from the corresponding trees using *ad hoc* Perl scripts. Table 3 shows the mean, median and standard deviations of SH-like \( P \)-values for each tree, along with the percentages of bipartitions having particular \( P \) cut-off values. This analysis indicates that the *atpD* and *rpoB* partitions have the lowest median \( P \)-values, whereas *recA* has the highest mean and median \( P \)-values of the single locus partitions. However, based on the \( P \geq 0.95 \) cut-off value, the partitions are ranked in decreasing order of significant split percentages as follows: *glnII* > *rpoB* > *recA* > *atpD*. The additive nature of the phylogenetic signal contained in the individual partitions is evident when these values are compared with those achieved by the concatenated *glnII*+*recA* and *atpD*+*glnII*+*recA*+*rpoB* data sets. The latter one has the lowest percentage of non-significant (\( P < 0.95 \)) and highest proportion of significantly supported (\( P \geq 0.95 \)) bipartitions (Table 3).

**Population genetic analysis of the DNA sequence polymorphisms found in selected lineages.**

Table 4 summarizes the results of basic descriptive statistics of DNA polymorphisms, neutrality, and population growth tests based on the concatenated dataset used to infer the phylogeny shown in Fig. 1 for *B. japonicum* I and Ia, *B. liaoningense*, *B. yuanmingense* and *B. elkanii*. The analyses were based on the segregating sites, excluding those that violate the infinite sites model (i.e., those segregating more than one base). *Bradyrhizobium elkanii* was the lineage with the highest level of DNA polymorphism, both in terms of haplotype (\( H_d \)) and nucleotide (\( \pi \)) diversity, whereas the *B. japonicum* Ia lineage displayed the lowest diversity. The observed patterns of nucleotide substitution were compatible with those expected under the neutral equilibrium model, as revealed by Tajima’s *D* (56), *Fu* and *Li’s* \( D^* \) and \( F^* \) (9) statistics, which were all non-significant. They are all based on intraspecific data of DNA polymorphisms and designed to test the hypothesis that all mutations are selectively
neutral (21). The small negative $D$ values could be the result of population bottlenecks (8, 56).

However, the powerful $R_2$ test statistic (41), which is particularly suited for small sample sizes with recombination, also failed to reject the population equilibrium model, as revealed by coalescent simulations (14) run under the assumption of intermediate levels of recombination. Therefore, all evidence indicates that the observed polymorphisms in the concatenated datasets conform to the neutral equilibrium model (8, 41, 56).

Table 5 shows the estimates obtained for the population recombination parameter $C$ using the methods of Hudson and Kaplan (16) and Hudson (13). The first method is based on $R_M$, or minimum number of recombination events, observed in the sample. Estimates of the observed $R_M$ were used to compute average $C$ and 95% credibility intervals by neutral coalescent simulations (14). The Hudson (13) method is based on the variance of the number of differences between pairs of sequences; in this case, the estimate of $C$ can be obtained numerically. Both estimates of $C$ are consistent with intermediate levels of recombination in all but the *B. japonicum* Ia lineage, which appears to have a clonal and highly epidemic population structure. Interestingly, the *B. japonicum* I lineage has the highest level of average $R_M$ values (estimated under the neutral coalescent), which is almost 4 orders of magnitude higher than that estimated for the Ia lineage.

Further evidence for the distinctness of the *B. japonicum* I and Ia lineages was gained from genetic differentiation and gene flow analyses (Table 6). The highest average nucleotide substitutions per site between lineages ($D_{xy}$) was found precisely for this pair. Both the haplotype ($\chi^2$) and sequence-based $(K_{ST}^*)$ genetic differentiation statistics for this comparison were also the most significant ones found (Table 6). This differentiation cannot be explained solely by disjunct geographic origins of the isolates, since both groups contain isolates from different continents. High fixation indices ($F_{ST}$) and low effective numbers of migrants ($Nm$) between these lineages reveal a high level of genetic isolation.
Highly significant $K_{ST}^*$ values were also found for the pair-wise comparisons between the *B. elkanii* USDA76 vs. USDA94 lineages, and for the *B. liaoningense* isolates originating from Burma and Vietnam. However, their genetic differentiation is not so marked, as judged from their higher $K_{ST}^*$ values, lower or non-significant haplotype ($\chi^2$) differentiation levels, and ~25% lower $D_{xy}$ values, when compared with those obtained for the first pairwise comparison.

The populations from all lineages presented epidemic clones, that is, multilocus haplotypes that appear in high frequency in the collection (28, 48). The two most prevalent *atpD*+*glnII*+*recA*+*rpoB* haplotypes found in our collection belong to the *B. yuanmingense* and *B. japonicum* Ia clades, with 12 and 15 isolates respectively.

**Broad geographic and environmental distribution of four *Bradyrhizobium* species nodulating soybean.** A preliminary definition of the environmental distribution ranges of 4 *Bradyrhizobium* species could be defined when the Köppen-Geiger climate types of the sites sampled in this study were mapped on the species phylogeny shown in Fig. 1. *B. yuanmingense* was recovered from sites with humid Equatorial (Aw) or dry hot semiarid regions (BSh) with marked seasonal fluctuations in water availability. The *Bradyrhizobium japonicum* Ia, *B. liaoningense* and *B. elkanii* isolates in our collection were preferentially recovered from areas with humid temperate climates with dry winters and hot summers (Cwa).

Taking also the reference strains into account indicates that at least *B. japonicum* I and Ia, *B. yuanmingense* and *B. elkanii* have a very broad geographic distribution across the Northern hemisphere. *B. liaoningense* seems to be broadly distributed across East and South East Asia. The distribution range of *B. yuanmingense* reaches the Southern hemisphere, since strain LMTR28 was isolated in Peru from Lima beans (31). Therefore, the environmental range for this species also includes dry arid and hot environments (BWh), as well as humid cold climates with dry winters and
hot summers (Dwa). Larger samples of taxonomically well characterized strains are obviously required to better define the environmental and geographic distribution ranges of these species. Hence, those provided herein represent only minimal ranges.

DISCUSSION

Many studies report on the high diversity of native *Bradyrhizobium* spp. strains found in contrasting ecosystems, on different continents, and associated with diverse agricultural and wild legumes (1, 18, 24, 29, 31, 35, 70, 71). However, in most of these and similar studies, no clear assertions were made about the number of *Bradyrhizobium* species that nodulate a particular host. Generally the strains are classified as *Bradyrhizobium* sp. “related to” the *B. japonicum* or *B. elkanii* lineages, the equivalent to classifying the strains as belonging to clades A or B in Fig. 1 of this study. This level of taxonomic resolution is clearly insufficient to disclose geographic or environmental distribution ranges of particular species (40), or to make inferences about evolutionary forces and historic contingencies acting on them (53, 54, 63, 65). This situation is largely due to the predominant use of 16S rDNA sequences or PCR-RFLPs as the only molecular marker for diversity assessment and lineage classification. Several publications have shown that this marker has only limited utility in *Bradyrizobium* diversity studies due to very low levels of polymorphism and frequent intragenic mosaicism, which yields a poor and often misleading signal (33, 58, 59, 61, 64, 67).

This work provides further empirical evidence showing the adequacy of multilocus sequence analyses (10) of protein-coding genes for *Bradyrhizobium* species demarcation (52, 61, 65), and their suitability for making refined ecological and evolutionary inferences. Because of the stochastic way in which lineages sort during speciation, gene trees generally differ in topology from each other and from the species tree, and therefore no single gene tree is likely to be a good approximation of a species
phylogeny (30, 43, 50, 63-65), as clearly illustrated in this study with our phylogenetic congruence analyses. It has also been shown that the inference of a multispecies tree can be problematic when single individuals are analyzed per species, due to the presence of anomalous gene trees (5). A practical and powerful strategy to diminish the impact of this potential problem is to sample multiple individuals per species, as shown in this and other studies (5, 43). However, the strong phylogenetic incongruence detected between bipartitions, and the presence of at least one very short and non-supported bipartition located deeply within the species tree indicate that, although the overall tree support is high, its accuracy is not granted (22). The short internal branches may reflect incomplete lineage sorting, but as the number of individuals per species increases, the corresponding species clades become more robust, because each individual from a species provides an independent opportunity to observe coalescence with an individual from the sister species (25). Therefore, based on these theoretical considerations, and the very strong support of the relatively long branches subtending the species clades, we conclude that the species demarcation suggested by our species tree is robust. The use of multiple strains per species is also very useful to identify individuals harboring xenologous loci. The inference of accurate bacterial species trees from concatenated alignments demands the identification and removal of such individuals, which can strongly distort species phylogenies inferred using standard tree reconstruction methods that assume a single underlying evolutionary history (65). Moreover, the estimation of a multispecies tree with many multilocus haplotypes and several concatenated sequence partitions, demands the use of complex substitution models (37, 39, 65) and, what is even more important, a thorough search of tree space. There are $(2s-5)!/2^{s-3}(s-3)!$ unrooted and bifurcating trees for $s$ sequences (7). Thus, for the inference problem with 62 multilocus haplotypes presented in this study, there are $1.945514 \times 10^{181}$ possible topologies of this kind! Only heuristic tree searching algorithms are suitable to solve such a formidable computational task, implying that there is no guarantee to find the best global ML tree, since the search may easily “get trapped” in a local
maximum (7). This explains why starting multiple heuristic searches from distinct random trees allowed, in all cases, better maximum likelihood trees to be found than those found using a BioNJ starting tree, which is the default search option in PhyML (11).

Despite these computational limitations, a well resolved species phylogeny could be inferred from the concatenated dataset after exclusion of the individuals showing xenologous sequences. This tree had both the highest overall tree resolution level and the highest mean and median phylogenetic congruence level when compared with all possible single and combined partition combinations. These figures underline the convenience of the supermatrix approach used herein for species demarcation, although some uncertainty concerning the phylogenetic relationships between species evident, based on the low support values ($P << 0.90$) of some of the shorter branches found deep within the tree.

Five lineages of soybean-nodulating bradyrhizobia were found among the Asiatic isolates. These lineages could be classified with great statistical confidence as $B. japonicum$ type Ia (12), $B. elkanii$ (23), $B. yuanmingense$ (69), $B. liaoningense$ (68), including the identification of a novel lineage. We show that $B. yuanmingense$ contains isolates capable of nodulating soybeans in diverse soils and countries (India, Myanmar and Vietnam), confirming and extending the results of a report (3) that appeared during the review process of this paper. Taking into account previous publications, we conclude that this species has very broad geographic and host ranges, nodulating not only Lespedeza spp. in northern China (65), but also Lima beans in Peru (31, 59), Indigofera hirsuta in Mexico (59), soybeans in southern and southeastern Asia and different Vigna species in southern Africa (52) and subtropical China (72). The fact that the $B. yuanmingense$ isolates from Chinese Lespedeza cuneata plants do not nodulate soybeans (69) strongly suggests the existence of several symbiotic ecotypes (50, 61) within this cosmopolitan species. This species has also a very broad environmental distribution. It has been isolated from warm semiarid regions such as the Indian Rajasthan or the arid coastal strip of Peru, humid temperate and equatorial climates such as those found in Myanmar and Vietnam, but also...
from regions with a humid cold climate with dry winters such as the Beijing province of China.

Noteworthy, the most abundant *B. yuanmingense* composite *atpD*+*glnII*+*recA*+*rpoB* haplotype was recovered from all three tropical and subtropical Asiatic countries sampled, revealing that some of its clones or clonal complexes also have a broad geographic and environmental distribution. Therefore, no clear geographic or ecological patterning of haplotypes was found for this species.

Very striking was the finding that 16 Nepalese isolates (NeMa* and NeRa*) had the same composite *glnII*+*recA*+*rpoB* haplotype as that of *B. japonicum* USDA110. These strains do not represent a contamination of the cultivation systems used for the trapping experiments with USDA110 because the Nepalese strains have a different *atpD* sequence. The *B. japonicum* Ia (12) lineage displayed the lowest DNA polymorphism level of all lineages analyzed. It essentially has a clonal (and highly epidemic) population structure (28), which contrasts with that of the *B. japonicum* I lineage, for which the highest haplotype diversity and *R*<sub>M</sub> values (16) were recorded. Kuykendall *et al.* (23) also found low genetic diversity among *B. japonicum* strains of the DNA homology group Ia based on DNA hybridization experiments with cosmid clones. Strong phylogenetic evidence was found against the monophyly of these two lineages, as reported by van Berkum and Fuhrmann based on bootstrap analysis of a neighbor joining phylogeny reconstructed from ribosomal internal transcribed spacer sequences (58). Our results present compelling evidence that these two groups represent significantly differentiated and genetically isolated evolutionary lineages, therefore supporting the previously published opinion that strains USDA110 and USDA122 “need not necessarily be representative of *B. japonicum*” (58). In other words, current evidence suggests that homology group Ia (12) strains are misclassified as *B. japonicum* and probably represent a novel species.

A comparative evolutionary genetic analysis of multiple *Bradyrhizobium* species revealed that all have epidemic clones, as found in other population genetic studies of diverse rhizobia (28, 49, 50, 65), and that intermediate levels of recombination shape their population genetic structures (28, 49, 50, 65),
with the notable exception of the *B. japonicum* Ia lineage. The recombination parameter values are most likely underestimated because they are based on data for all individuals and not on haplotypes (28, 50). Significant genetic structuring of haplotypes was found within the two *B. elkanii* lineages represented by the North American reference strains USDA76<sup>T</sup> and USDA94. Kuykendall and colleagues also reported significant genetic differentiation between these two groups of strains (*B. elkanii* homology groups II and IIA) (23). This issue requires further investigation, not only because of potential taxonomic implications, but especially because it would be desirable that future reports on the diversity of strains described as “related to the *B. elkanii* clade” consider the evident genetic structuring that exists within this species, as currently defined.

In conclusion, more studies using careful multilocus sequence analyses coupled with detailed descriptions of the habitats from which new strains are isolated are needed to build the databases required to make robust inferences about the biogeography and environmental distribution of rhizobial species (63). Current evidence clearly demonstrates that rhizobia belong to the class of bacteria with very broad geographic and environmental distribution ranges at the genus and species levels of taxonomic resolution (50, 54, 64). Much remains to be learned, however, about the relative contributions of history and environment on the distribution patterns of particular rhizobial species, as well as about the processes that shape their biogeography (27, 40).

**ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

We thank the European Union for long-term support in the INCO DEV project ICA4-CT-2001-10057, the DEGAPA-PAPIIT from the National Autonomous University of Mexico for grant DGAPA IN201806-2 to PV. Drs. Claudia Silva, Susana Brom and Paul V. Dunlap are gratefully acknowledged for their critical reading of the manuscript.
REFERENCES


Figure legends.

**Figure 1.** Maximum likelihood species tree estimated under the GTR+I+G model showing the relationships among 62 atpD+glnII+recA+rpoB haplotypes found among 76 Asiatic *Bradyrhizobium* isolates and 34 reference strains (bold font). This was the best tree found among 101 independent PhyML searches started from 100 random sequential addition and 1 NJ seed trees. The support values on the bipartitions correspond to Shimodaira-Hasegawa-like P-values, which denote the probability of the particular branch being correct. Ten *Bradyrhizobium* spp. lineages were resolved. The Asiatic isolates grouped in 5 of them, enclosed in rounded boxes. Shaded boxes highlight epidemic clones. The vertical rectangular box shows the parameterization of the PhyML tree search resulting in the best lnL score. The scale indicates the expected number of substitutions per site under the specified substitution model. The following country or regional abbreviations were used to indicate the geographic origin of the reference strains: Can: Canary Islands; Chi: China; Ger: Germany; Jap: Japan; Mex: Mexico; Mor: Morocco; Per: Peru; Spa: Spain; USA: United States of America. The following abbreviations were used to indicate the world climate classes after Köppen-Geiger: BWh: Dry arid hot; Cfa: Humid temperate without dry season and hot summer; Csb: Humid temperate with dry cool summer; Dwa: Humid cold with dry winter and hot summer; Dwb: Humid cold with dry winter and cool summer. The remaining abbreviations are explained in Table 1.

**Figure 2.** Matrix showing P-values of Shimodaria-Hasegawa phylogenetic congruence tests among all pairs of single and combined sequence partitions, as indicated. White corresponds to $P = 0$ and black to $P = 1$, meaning completely incongruent and congruent trees, respectively.
### Table 1. Geographic coordinates, climate type and land use of the sampling sites.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Isolate(^a)</th>
<th>Country / Locality(^b)</th>
<th>Geographic coordinates</th>
<th>Climate(^c)</th>
<th>Land use(^d)</th>
<th>G. max cultivar(^e)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>BuCeG</td>
<td>Bu/Heho</td>
<td>E 97.04° N 20.78°</td>
<td>Aw</td>
<td>Diverse Phaseolus beans</td>
<td>Gm-JS335</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BuCeR</td>
<td>Bu/Heho</td>
<td>E 97.04° N 20.78°</td>
<td>Aw</td>
<td>Diverse Phaseolus beans</td>
<td>Ra</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BuMiN</td>
<td>Bu/Nan-daw-kyun</td>
<td>E 96.03° N 22.05°</td>
<td>Cwa</td>
<td>Vigna cajan L.</td>
<td>MA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BuMiT</td>
<td>Bu/Tha-min-chan</td>
<td>E 96.05° N 22.03°, N 22.02°</td>
<td>Cwa</td>
<td>G. max, Lablab niger</td>
<td>MA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BuNoG</td>
<td>Bu/Mandalay</td>
<td>E 96.09° N 21.98°</td>
<td>Cwa</td>
<td>Diverse Phaseolus beans</td>
<td>Gm-JS335</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BuNoR</td>
<td>Bu/Mandalay</td>
<td>E 96.09° N 21.98°</td>
<td>Cwa</td>
<td>Diverse Phaseolus beans</td>
<td>Ra</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>InBu</td>
<td>In/Rajasthan/Bundi</td>
<td>E 75.6° N 25.5°</td>
<td>BSh</td>
<td>G. max L. Previous inoculation</td>
<td>MA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>InIn</td>
<td>In/Madhya Pradesh - Indore</td>
<td>E 75.86° N 22.72°</td>
<td>Aw</td>
<td>G. max L. No inoculation</td>
<td>MA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>InJa</td>
<td>In/Madhya Pradesh - Jabalpur</td>
<td>E 79.94° N 23.17°</td>
<td>Aw</td>
<td>G. max L. No inoculation</td>
<td>MA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>InKo</td>
<td>In/Rajasthan - Kota</td>
<td>E 75.83° N 25.18°</td>
<td>Bsh</td>
<td>G. max L. Previous inoculation</td>
<td>MA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>InRo</td>
<td>In/Uttaranchal - Roorkee</td>
<td>E 77.89° N 29.87°</td>
<td>Cwa</td>
<td>Alluvial soils, Ganges plains, rice fields</td>
<td>Ra</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NeMa</td>
<td>Nep/Kathmandu</td>
<td>E 85.26° N 27.42°</td>
<td>Cwa</td>
<td>soybean/rice/maize/potatoes</td>
<td>MA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NeRa</td>
<td>Nep/Kathmandu</td>
<td>E 85.26° N 27.42°</td>
<td>Cwa</td>
<td>soybean/rice/maize/potatoes</td>
<td>Ra</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ViHaG</td>
<td>Vi/Halong</td>
<td>E 107° N 21°</td>
<td>Cwa</td>
<td>Diverse vegetables</td>
<td>Gm-JS71-05</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ViHaR</td>
<td>Vi/Halong</td>
<td>E 107° N 21°</td>
<td>Cwa</td>
<td>Diverse vegetables</td>
<td>Ra</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\(^a\)These prefixes are the ones given to the isolates obtained from each of the indicated sites, followed by the isolate number.

\(^b\)Bu = Myanmar (former Burma), In = India, Ne = Nepal, Vi = Vietnam. After the slash comes the region or geographic location from which the soil samples were obtained.

\(^c\)Climate classification after Köppen-Geiger; Aw (Humid equatorial climate with dry winters), Cwa (Humid temperate climate with dry winters and hot summers), BSh (Dry climate, semiarid, hot).

\(^d\)Land use of the soybean plantations from which the soil samples were taken for the trapping experiments.

\(^e\)Abbreviations for the G. max (soybean) cultivars used in the trapping experiments are as follows: MA= Mapple Arrow; Ra=Ramson;
Table 2. Evaluation of constrained vs. unconstrained tree searches for selected clades and lineages in a maximum likelihood framework.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>locus</th>
<th>Constraint (monophyly)</th>
<th>-lnL</th>
<th>Diff. -lnL</th>
<th>P</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>atpD</td>
<td>B. japonicum I &amp; Ia</td>
<td>2489.38670</td>
<td>56.16313</td>
<td>0.000***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>rpoB</td>
<td>B. japonicum I &amp; Ia</td>
<td>3479.73551</td>
<td>22.05898</td>
<td>0.017*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>concat.</td>
<td>B. japonicum I &amp; Ia</td>
<td>13360.14170</td>
<td>359.42271</td>
<td>0.000***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>glnII</td>
<td>B. liaoningense</td>
<td>3094.23147</td>
<td>8.68990</td>
<td>0.208 ns</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>recA</td>
<td>B. liaoningense</td>
<td>2968.76600</td>
<td>5.18924</td>
<td>0.245 ns</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a Concat.

Refers to the concatenated dataset (atpD+glnII+recA+rpoB) used to infer the phylogeny shown in Fig. 1.

b The constraints used in maximum likelihood tree searches under best-fitting substitution models for the indicated sequence partition.

c The –lnL values correspond to those for the constrained topology.

d The difference in –lnL corresponds to the score differences between the non-constrained and constrained trees.

e The P-values indicate the significance of the difference in –lnL scores achieved by the constrained and unconstrained trees, as assessed by the Shimodaira-Hasegawa test.
Table 3. Relative performance of individual molecular markers and some of their combinations assessed using Shimodaria-Hasegawa-like $P$-values of branch significance under the maximum likelihood criterion.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Partition</th>
<th>Sites</th>
<th>Hapl$^b$</th>
<th>Bip$^c$</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Median</th>
<th>StdDev$^d$</th>
<th>Var</th>
<th>$P &lt; 0.95$</th>
<th>$P \geq 0.95$</th>
<th>$0.95 \leq P &lt; 0.99$</th>
<th>$P \geq 0.99$</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>atpD</td>
<td>483</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>0.76</td>
<td>0.78</td>
<td>0.17</td>
<td>0.0293</td>
<td>85.37</td>
<td>14.64</td>
<td>7.32</td>
<td>7.32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>glnII</td>
<td>591</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>0.75</td>
<td>0.84</td>
<td>0.27</td>
<td>0.0727</td>
<td>65.11</td>
<td>34.88</td>
<td>20.93</td>
<td>13.95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>recA</td>
<td>510</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>0.79</td>
<td>0.87</td>
<td>0.25</td>
<td>0.0613</td>
<td>83.72</td>
<td>16.28</td>
<td>11.63</td>
<td>4.65</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>rpoB</td>
<td>771</td>
<td>51</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>0.63</td>
<td>0.77</td>
<td>0.36</td>
<td>0.1299</td>
<td>77.09</td>
<td>22.91</td>
<td>14.58</td>
<td>8.33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>glnIIrecA</td>
<td>1101</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>0.86</td>
<td>0.92</td>
<td>0.17</td>
<td>0.0287</td>
<td>64.15</td>
<td>35.85</td>
<td><strong>18.87</strong></td>
<td>16.98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>atpDglnIIrecA</td>
<td>2355</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>0.78</td>
<td><strong>0.94</strong></td>
<td>0.31</td>
<td>0.0980</td>
<td><strong>55.93</strong></td>
<td><strong>44.07</strong></td>
<td>16.95</td>
<td><strong>27.12</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

$^a$Values for the best tree found for each partition among the 101 ML searches initiated from 100 random sequential addition parsimony trees and a NJ tree, using the sequences from the organisms included in the analysis shown in Fig. 1.  
$^b$Number of haplotypes  
$^c$Number of bipartitions (splits) on the tree  
$^d$Standard deviation  
$^e$Percentage of bipartitions having a Shimodaria-Hasegawa-like $P$-values above or below the indicated $P$-value cut-off
Table 4. Descriptive statistics of nucleotide polymorphisms, along with neutrality and growth test for the concatenated *atpD*+*glnII*+*recA*+*rpoB* partitions (2355 sites), based on segregating sites.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Species (no. of seqs.)</th>
<th>$S^a$</th>
<th>Pi$^b$</th>
<th>kals$^c$</th>
<th>$k^d$</th>
<th>$h/Hd^e$</th>
<th>$\theta^f$</th>
<th>$\pi^g$</th>
<th>Tajima's $D^h$</th>
<th>Fu's $D^*^i$</th>
<th>Fu's $F^*^j$</th>
<th>$R^2^j$</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><em>B. japonicum</em> I (7)</td>
<td>83</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>80/6</td>
<td>33.667</td>
<td>7/1</td>
<td>0.1475</td>
<td>0.01430</td>
<td>-0.03628</td>
<td>-0.23415</td>
<td>-0.21017</td>
<td>0.1293</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>B. japonicum</em> Ia (21)</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>24/1</td>
<td>6.067</td>
<td>6/0.495</td>
<td>0.00297</td>
<td>0.00258</td>
<td>-0.48593</td>
<td>0.96108</td>
<td>0.61592</td>
<td>0.1171</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>B. elkanii</em> (18)</td>
<td>151</td>
<td>89</td>
<td>135/22</td>
<td>45.84</td>
<td>13/0.948</td>
<td>0.01864</td>
<td>0.01947</td>
<td>0.18707</td>
<td>-0.77994</td>
<td>-0.57540</td>
<td>0.1357</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>B. liaoningense</em> (15)</td>
<td>112</td>
<td>93</td>
<td>101/14</td>
<td>38.01</td>
<td>7/0.838</td>
<td>0.01463</td>
<td>0.01614</td>
<td>0.45443</td>
<td>0.83018</td>
<td>0.83579</td>
<td>0.1601</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>B. yuanmingense</em> (32)</td>
<td>129</td>
<td>93</td>
<td>122/8</td>
<td>28.81</td>
<td>12/0.817</td>
<td>0.01407</td>
<td>0.01225</td>
<td>-0.51068</td>
<td>-0.26557</td>
<td>-0.41353</td>
<td>0.1061</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

$^a$ Segregating sites.  
$^b$ Parsimony informative sites.  
$^c$ Total number of synonymous / nonsynonymous changes.  
$^d$ Average number of nucleotide differences.  
$^e$ Number of haplotypes / haplotype (gene) diversity.  
$^f$ Theta per bp, after Waterson (1975), assuming the infinite sites model.  
$^g$ Nucleotide diversity.  
$^h$ Calculations using the total number of segregating sites; all the values are non significant.  
$^i$ Population growth test statistic of Ramos-Onsis and Rozas (2002); all the values were non significant as determined by neutral coalescence simulations considering recombination if necessary.
Table 5. Recombination estimates based on the segregating sites from the concatenated *atpD+glnII+recA+rpoB* partitions (2355 sites) of selected *Bradyrhizobium* populations.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Species (no. of seq)</th>
<th>$R^a$</th>
<th>$R_M^b$</th>
<th>Conf. Int. $^d$</th>
<th>$P R_m \leq \text{obs.} R_M^c$</th>
<th>$R_M$ avg.$^f$</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><em>B. japonicum I</em> (7)</td>
<td>125</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>(5.0, 15.0)</td>
<td>0.922</td>
<td>9.98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>B. japonicum Ia</em> (21)</td>
<td>0.001</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>(0.0, 0.0)</td>
<td>1.0</td>
<td>0.002</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>B. elkanii</em> (18)</td>
<td>9.3</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>(2.0, 9.0)</td>
<td>1.0</td>
<td>5.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>B. liaoningense</em> (15)</td>
<td>0.99</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>(0.0, 2.0)</td>
<td>0.98</td>
<td>0.683</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>B. yuanmingense</em> (32)</td>
<td>2.6</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>(0.0, 5.0)</td>
<td>1.0</td>
<td>2.372</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

$^a$ Estimate of the population recombination parameter $R$ (Hudson 1987) corrected for haploid organisms.

$^b$ Observed minimum number of recombination events (Hudson and Kaplan 1985).

$^c$ Neutral coalescence simulations ($10^4$) given the number of segregating sites, with an intermediate level of recombination.

$^d$ Confidence interval (lower limit, upper limit) for $R_m$ under the neutral coalescent process.

$^e$ Probability that $R_m \leq$ the observed $R_m$ under the neutral coalescent process.

$^f$ Average value of $R_m$ under the neutral coalescent process.
Table 6. Genetic differentiation and gene flow estimates.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Populations (lineages or sampling sites)</th>
<th>Fix.</th>
<th>$D_{xy}$</th>
<th>$\chi^2$ (df)</th>
<th>$P$</th>
<th>$K_{ST}$</th>
<th>$P'$</th>
<th>$F_{ST}$</th>
<th>$Nm$</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>B. japonicum I vs. Ia (7, 21)</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>0.03928</td>
<td>28.0 (12)</td>
<td>0.0055 **</td>
<td>0.38907</td>
<td>0.0000***</td>
<td>0.78523</td>
<td>0.14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. elkanii USDA76 vs. USDA94 (11, 7)</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>0.02930</td>
<td>18.0 (12)</td>
<td>0.1157 (ns)</td>
<td>0.51744</td>
<td>0.0001***</td>
<td>0.68310</td>
<td>0.23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. liaoningense Vietnam vs. Burma (9, 4)</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>0.02647</td>
<td>13.0 (4)</td>
<td>0.0113*</td>
<td>0.94092</td>
<td>0.0007***</td>
<td>0.97950</td>
<td>0.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. liaoningense Vietnam vs. China (9, 2)</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>0.02222</td>
<td>11.0 (5)</td>
<td>0.0514 (ns)</td>
<td>0.49644</td>
<td>0.0055**</td>
<td>0.81316</td>
<td>0.11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. liaoningense Burma vs. China (4, 2)</td>
<td>79</td>
<td>0.03694</td>
<td>6.0 (2)</td>
<td>0.0498*</td>
<td>1.0</td>
<td>0.0677 (ns)</td>
<td>0.90230</td>
<td>0.05</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. yuanmingense Burma vs. India (6, 21)</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.01201</td>
<td>21.8 (8)</td>
<td>0.0053**</td>
<td>0.15049</td>
<td>0.0006***</td>
<td>0.43216</td>
<td>0.66</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

$^a$ Number of fixed differences between populations.

$^b$ Average number of nucleotide substitutions per site between populations or lineages.

$^c$ Haplotype based statistic (Hudson et al. 1992a), degrees of freedom are indicated in parenthesis.

$^d$ Probability of rejecting the null hypothesis that the two populations are not genetically differentiated, based on the critical values from the $\chi^2$ distribution.

$^e$ Sequence based statistic described in Hudson et al. (1992a).

$^f$ Probability obtained by the permutation test (Hudson et al. 1992a) with 1000 replicates.

$^g$ Sequence based estimate described in Hudson et al. (1992a).

$^h$ Effective number of migrants.

ns, not significant.
Fig. 1. of Vinuesa et al. 2008.

**Bradyrhizobium**

### *B. elkanii*  
- Myanmar (Cwa)

### *B. canariense*  
- Can, Mor, Spa

### *B. japonicum I*  
- Mex, Ger, Can, Chi, Jap

### *B. japonicum Ia*  
- Nepal (Cwa)

### Novel lineage  
- Myanmar (Cwa)

### *B. liaoningense*  
- Vietnam (Cwa)  
- Myanmar (Cwa)

### *B. yuanmingense*  
- Myanmar (Aw)  
- India (Aw, BSh)  
- Vietnam (Cwa)

---

**PhyML_aLRT analysis**  
- no. of haplotypes: 62  
- four partitions, 2355 chars.  
- start: 100 rdm. add. MP trees  
- SH-like split support values  
- lnL for best tree = -13004.57183  
- Model: GTR+I+G  
- alpha = 0.755 (4 rate cat.)  
- p-inv = 0.524  
- Nucleotides frequencies:  
  - f(A) = 0.19214  
  - f(C) = 0.33028  
  - f(G) = 0.31317  
  - f(T) = 0.16442  
- GTR relative rate parameters:  
  - A <-> C: 0.65230  
  - A <-> G: 2.63611  
  - A <-> T: 1.07239  
  - C <-> G: 2.12240  
  - C <-> T: 7.15121  
  - G <-> T: 1.0 (fixed)

---

**Bradyrhizobium genosppecies alpha**  
- Can

**Bradyrhizobium genosppecies beta**  
- Can, Mor

---

**Rhodopseudomonas palustris BisB5**
Fig. 2. of Vinuesa et al., 2008.