An Open Peer Review Module for Open Access Repositories

Pandelis Perakakis, Emilio Lorenzo, Isabel Bernal, Carles Sierra, Concha Mosquera de Arancibia

Open Repositories Conference 2016
13-16 June, Dublin
— I am here for a conference on computational biology, and you?
— Well, I am a neuroscientist, but I am here for a conference on open access repositories.
— Repositories? What is that?
— Oh, well... it’s a long story... but you just gave me an idea on how to start my presentation...
• Open access
• Signed
• Nonselective
• Open in time

Open Peer Review?
an aggregation of its reviews, **weighted** by the reputation of reviewers
an aggregation of her papers’ reputation, weighted by the number of authors
an aggregation of others opinions on our reviewer, \textit{weighted} by the reputation of the reviewers

\url{http://digital.csic.es/handle/10261/130842}

\textbf{Reputation: reviewer}
• Invitation’s module
• Reviews’ module
• Compute reputations
• Item’s view customization
• Author’s view customization
• Standard DSpace configurations
  
  Defining new collections, workflows,...
  Extending the metadata model

• Apply the code
• Extend the data model (database)
• Views Customization
  
  Items, authors, item’s relationships, collections...
• Search system, index and filtering adjustment...
• OAI-PMH filtering
Author’s model is needed to...

- disambiguate
- identify
- give credit and recognition, i.e. show author’s reputation
Available at:

Code for DSpace v5 XMLUI (e-IEO)
https://github.com/arvoConsultores/Open-Peer-Review-Module--

Code for DSpace v4 JSPUI (digital.CSIC)
https://github.com/arvoConsultores/dspace_cris--

Wiki
https://github.com/arvoConsultores/Open-Peer-Review-Module/wiki
Pilot implementation in 2 institutional repositories
Open peer reviews and comments have their own collections

https://digital.csic.es/handle/10261/131210

https://digital.csic.es/handle/10261/131213
Waiting for open discussion...

https://digital.csic.es/handle/10261/132304
The reviewer must indicate her affiliation by default, all reviews and comments have a CC-BY license. New resource types include qualitative and quantitative peer review.
Open reviews and comments generate new items in the repositories

Open reviews records contain:
• Name of the reviewer and affiliation
• Links to the reviewed work
• Links to items with related open comments
• Individual quality rating of the reviewed work
• Weighed review reputation metrics

https://digital.csic.es/handle/10261/131502
Thunnus thynnus eggs obtained from captive
[Review]

Authors
Jerez, S. (Salvador) IEO
Instituto Español de Oceanografía

Date
2016-04-06

Type
review

Overall quality
80

Review reputation
86

Related works
80 http://hdl.handle.net/10508/2494

Related comments
90 View comment by Rodrigues-dos-Santos-Domingues, P.M. (I)
80 View comment by de-la-Gándara, F. (Fernando)

Comment sheet (clipping)

Amlages on the soft bottoms off the Catalan-Levante
[Comment]

Authors
García-Rodriguez, M. (Mariano) IEO
Subdirección General de Investigación

Date
2016-04-19

Type
comment

Overall quality
70

Related reviews
67 View review by Sampedro-Pastor, P. (Paz)

Abstract
Answer to the referee report of Paz Sampedro Dem time and sampling season has little or no effect in the
only in spring so, rigorously, only this season is ment
objection argued to the differentiation of the two groups.
Firstly, groups were established based on the results
being subsequently grouped by a cluster. The MDS
depth, performing one ANOSIM with the sub-routine of
Thus five groups were identified, clearly separated by
Records of the reviewed works link to their open reviews, individual quality ratings and overall reputation metrics.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>View/Open</th>
<th>Authors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cold-water corals in the Cap de Creus canyon, northwestern Mediterranean: spatial distribution, density and anthropogenic impact</td>
<td><img src="m397p037.pdf" alt="m397p037.pdf" /> (861.9Kb)</td>
<td>Orejas, C. (Covadonga); Gori, A. (Andrea); Lo-iacono, C. (Claudio); Puig, P. (Pere); Gili, J.M. (Josep Maria); Dale, M.R.T. (Mark R.T.)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Identifiers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>URI:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DOI:</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Export</th>
<th>Type</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>RIS</td>
<td>article</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statistics</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><img src="Scopus" alt="Scopus" /></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Related reviews</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>![View review by Cristobo, J. (Javier)](View review by Cristobo, J. (Javier))</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>![View review by Serrano, A. (Alberto)](View review by Serrano, A. (Alberto))</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Keywords</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cold water corals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Submarine canyons</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Author/reviewer reputation metrics show in their personal page (1/2)

http://digital.csic.es/cris/rp/rp01941
Continued..(2/2)

Orejas, C. (Covadonga)

Biography
Covadonga Orejas is graduate in Natural Sciences from the University of Granada. She is currently a staff of the IEO (currently at COBAS) and has participated in other benthic organisms projects since 1995, also serving as a scientific consultant for the sustainable management of the Common Cuttlefish project conducted in 12 different countries. She has authored 44 scientific papers in international journals, 7 book chapters, and several future projects are planned.

Contact Information
Download in PDF
Download in CVN fragment

Fields of Specialization
Biology and ecology of cold-water corals (CWC) and other benthic organisms

Degrees
Graduate in Biology from the Universidad Complutense de Madrid (Spain)

Departments
C.O. BALEARES

Author's reputation
79

Jerez, S. (Salvador)

Biography
Salvador Jerez, born in La Gomera (Spain), is a marine biologist with 20 years of experience in research and management at the IEO Island Oceanographic Centre since 1989. He has been involved in 19 international research projects, including the JCR/SC and 40 National and International Projects. He has also been involved in the greater amberjack in the European Project.

Contact Information
Download in PDF
Download in CVN fragment

Fields of Specialization
Expert on Greater amberjack (Seriola dumerili) aquaculture specializing in reproduction and growth.

Degrees
Graduate and PhD in Biology from the University of La Laguna (Spain)

Departments
C.O. CANARIAS

Last updated marzo 15, 2016

Reputation as a reviewer
86
Feedback from CSIC researchers and external reviewers invited to the OPRM pilot phase

- A long awaited service in the repository.
- It is a great idea that merits success as currently peer review is not credited in researchers CVs at all due to its anonymity. But researchers will not have time to review and comment on other peers works as long as this activity remains outside of CVs recognition and lacks strong support from the research institutions.
- The functionality may be also used to evaluate, accept and comment contributions before the conference?
- I have contacted 3 reviewers: one has no time available, another is against any type of peer review as reviewing is a subjective activity in such a reduced scholarly discipline and the third one has accepted to do it.
- The service should promote spontaneous discussion by anybody willing to send comments.
- Inviting peers to an open evaluation may place people in an uncomfortable situation, the module should work 100% open.
- The service is great for preprints and other unpublished works but has limited applicability for works that have been already evaluated and published.
- How does open peer review operate in relation to “finished” pieces of work (i.e, a book)?
- How will the service compete with Academia.edu open review/comments?
- May I use the review functionality to invite peers to review my paper on SSRN?
- On one side, I like the initiative by the CSIC, because it may foster debates among scholars on hot topics. On the other side, it requires time and effort from open reviewers, which they are probably willing to devote only if highly motivated. It must be hard for most scholars to be able to allocate their very scarce time to comment on published articles, unless they really want to say something about them.
- Why do I need to upload my review as an attachment? It is an extra work load.
Feedback from e-IEO researchers and reviewers invited to the OPRM pilot phase

• Leads to open collaboration
• Ensures expert reviews
• Avoids subjectivity
• Full support would soon lead to full open science
• Implementation requires time
• Negative review... awkward situation among colleagues?
Prospects for the future

Talking about functionality..
what to evolve in the short-term?

- Reviewers identification/authentication
- Visual approach to object’s relationships, reputations, timeline....

And some “blue-skies” ideas
standardize reputations concepts, profiles? Algorithms?... 
federation of repositories interchanging reputations...
Prospects for the future

• Institutional awareness raising campaigns
• It remains a challenge to enthuse authors to use the module for their preprints as fears of journal rejection later on still prevail.
• More work needed against the following barriers: reticence to participate as to lack of linkage with institutional assessment exercises and rewards system, limitations associated with an invitation-based module and misunderstandings about the OPRM reputation metrics>>>> FAQs coming soon!
• A cross-platform evaluation system is pending. Widely disseminated and comparable platform-independent metrics
Next Generation Repositories

https://www.coar-repositories.org/activities/advocacy-leadership/working-group-next-generation-repositories/

Panel 6: Repositories of the Future
Time: Thursday, 16/Jun/2016: 11:00am - 12:30pm
Session Chair: Richard Rodgers
Location: Joly Theatre
Hamilton Building
Contact

Pandelis Perakakis: peraka@ugr.es
Emilio Lorenzo: elorenzo@arvo.es
Isabel Bernal: isabel.bernal@bib.csic.es

Thank you for your Attention!